1

In the matter of the *Commissions of Inquiry Act 1950* Commissions of Inquiry Order (No. 3) 2022 Commission of Inquiry into Forensic DNA Testing in Queensland

## STATEMENT OF DALE FRIEBERG

I, Dale Frieberg, of 200 Roma Street, Brisbane, Queensland, 4001 state as follows:

The following statement is provided in response to a notice I received from the Commission of Inquiry into Forensic DNA Testing in Queensland requiring me to give information in a written statement regarding my knowledge of matters set out in the Schedule attached to that notice. Attached and marked **'Exhibit 1'** is a copy of that notice.

## **Current Employment**

Dale Frieberg

1. I am the Superintendent (Commander), Integrity and Performance Group, Ethical Standards Command.

#### **Qualifications and experience**

- 2. My qualifications include:-.
  - a) Masters in Leadership and Management Policing and Security Completed
    2018 Australian Graduate School of Police Management Charles Sturt
    University;
  - b) Graduate Certificate in Applied Management (Policing and Emergency Services) Completed with Distinction 2017 Australian Institute of Police Management;
  - c) Graduate Diploma in Leadership and Management Graduated with Distinction 2005 – 2008- Australian Graduate School of Police Management – Charles Sturt University; and
  - d) Diploma in Teaching English and Home Economics 1985/1986 not completed Kelvin Grove Teachers College (now QUT).

SENSITIVE

Witness

#### 2

- 3. A copy of my CV is attached and marked 'Exhibit 2'.
- 4. For the period August 2017 to September 2018, I was the Superintendent of the Forensic Services Group (FSG). I reported to the Assistant Commissioner Operations Support Command who at the time was Assistant Commissioner Michael Condon. After Michael Condon transferred in the latter part of 2018, I reported to Assistant Commissioner Alan McCarthy. Both Assistant Commissioners are now retired from the QPS. During these periods, Chief Superintendent Steve Dabinett would act from time to time in the Assistant Commissioner's role while the substantive was away. I reported to Acting Assistant Commissioner David French during 2021/2022. The substantive, Shane Chelepy, was involved in the QPS response to COVID.
- 5. Those that reported to me included: -

Dale Frieberg

- a) My support officer Sergeant Karen Heit (2017/2018 and 2021/2022);
- b) Coronial Support Unit Detective Inspector Simon Palmer (2017/2018) / Detective Inspector Larissa Miller (2021/2022);
- c) Forensic Technology Unit– Acting Inspector Troy O'Malley (2017/2018);
- d) Fingerprint Bureau– Inspector Brendan Keleher (now retired) (2017/2018);
- e) DNA Management Unit–Inspector Phil Stevens then Acting Inspector Ewen Taylor, and then Inspector Dave Neville (2017/2018). On my return to FSG in 2021/2022, the Fingerprint Bureau and DNA Management had been combined to form the Biometrics Unit – Inspector Dave Neville;
- f) Scientific Section Inspector Darren Pobar;
- g) Quality Management Section –Inspector Dave Keatinge (2017);
- h) Photographic and Electronic Recording Section (Now Forensic Imaging Section) –Inspector Adrian Freeman (2017) and Inspector Phil Stevens (2018). On my return in 2021/2022 Inspector Gai Bolderow was in charge of the area;

SENSITIVE

Witness

THE PEACE

3

- Forensic Manager for Central Region Inspector Artie VanPanhuis. In 2021/2022 this position was relieved by Acting Inspector Tania Spiteri for the majority of my time back at the FSG in 2021/2022;
- j) Forensic Manager for Southeast Region Acting Inspector Ken Koplick and then Acting Inspector Donna Stewart (2017/2018). On my return in 2021/2022, Inspector Duncan McCarthy was the substantive Inspector;
- k) Forensic Manager for South Brisbane -Inspector Paul Baker. On my return in 2021/2022, there were a number of relieving members in the Acting Inspector role including Peter Bushell and Andrew Stanley;
- Forensic Manager for North Brisbane/Sunshine Coast –Inspector Keatinge (2017/2018) followed by Inspector Adrian Freeman (until 2021prior to my return to the FSG). During 2021/2022, Acting Inspector Pip Kemp performed the role at North Brisbane and Sunshine Coast Regions; and
- m) Forensic Manager for Northern and Far Northern region Inspector Don
  McKay (2017) who is located in Cairns and travels as required to Townsville
  / Mt. Isa and other areas located in the Northern and Far Northern Regions.
- 6. My general responsibilities included:
  - a) Provide leadership to the Forensic Services Group and its membership;
  - Manage the strategic and operational risks, opportunities and response of forensics in support of investigative functions of the QPS;
  - c) Manage the diverse range of forensic services to support frontline police to investigate, solve and stop crime; and
  - Represent QPS Forensic Services / participate in national forums and committees to benchmark forensic standards and practices.



- 7. In addition to my general duties, I am also required to liaise with various stakeholders in regard to:
  - a) Disaster investigations requiring QPS DVI (Disaster Victim Identification) whereby I undertake a role as the Commander and chief scientific officer;
  - b) Human Resources and Financial responsibilities under the *Financial* Accountability Act 2009; and
  - c) Reporting obligations to Executive Management of the QPS.
- 8. I officially commenced in the role with the FSG on Monday, 7 August 2017.
- 9. In the week prior to this, I liaised with Acting Superintendent Scott McLaren who provided me with a Handover Briefing Document in relation to the DNA Management Section and Quality Management Section. I do not have any specific notes in my official diary or elsewhere of that handover process. A copy of that Handover Briefing Document is attached and marked 'Exhibit 3''.
- At the conclusion of my relieving period in 2018, I liaised with Superintendent Bruce McNab and provided him with a Handover Briefing Document. I do not have any specific notes in my official diary or elsewhere of that handover process.
- 11. On 5 October 2021, and upon entering the Superintendent position in the FSG, I liaised with Inspector Duncan McCarthy who had been relieving in the Superintendent's role and provided me with a Handover Briefing Document During that briefing, I made notes on the Handover Briefing Note provided to me by Inspector Duncan McCarthy. I do not recall and have not been able to locate any other notes, emails or other documents related to that handover. A copy of that Handover Briefing Document attached and marked 'Exhibit 4'.
- 12. On 22 February 2022, I liaised with Superintendent Bruce McNab via telephone and provided him with a briefing on the FSG. I do not recall and have not been able to locate any other notes, emails or other documents related to that handover. A copy of the

SENSITIVE

With

Dale Frieberg

5

typed notes I referred to for the handover to Superintendent Bruce McNab are attached and marked 'Exhibit 5'.

- 13. During my conversation with Superintendent Bruce McNab on 22 February 2022, I don't recall making any comment regarding turnaround times for DNA. However, I do recall speaking with him regarding the SAIK (Sexual Assault Investigation Kit) working group the Executive Briefing Note (EBN) I submitted to the Executive and issues with Dr Griffin of Queensland Health. A copy of that EBN is attached and marked "Exhibit 6".
- 14. During 2017 and 2018, there were over 500 members in the FSG including 13 people who reported directly to me in my position as the Superintendent of the FSG being 12 Inspectors and 1 Sergeant support officer. The structure of the FSG did not change during that period, with the exception of the Forensic Technology Unit following the resignation of Troy O'Malley in 2018. A chart of the organisational structure of the FSG for the period 2017 to 2018 is attached and marked 'Exhibit 7".
- 15. There were no specific changes to the role of Superintendent of the FSG between the time I relieved in 2017/2018 and my return in 2021/2022. There were, however, changes to the structure of the group with the inclusion of additional units due to service re-alignment, along with some changes in the staff and boundaries. An additional position answered to the Superintendent at the time of my arrival in 2021/2022. This was a Project Officer who directly reported to the Superintendent (Senior Sergeant Simone Quig).

## Backlogs

Dale Frieberg

16. I believe there were reported backlogs at the time I took over as Superintendent of the FSG in each of 2017 and 2021 and also from time to time while I was in the role of Superintendent of the FSG during the periods 2017 to 2018 and 2021 to 2022. I cannot recall the specific details of conversations if any that I had with QHFSS, however, I recall the backlog at one stage reached 60 days, as compared with a 10-day turnaround time.

SENSITIVE

Witness

6

- 17. I recall Inspector Dave Neville as the person who reported on the backlogs and challenged the turnaround times with Queensland Health Forensic and Scientific Services (QHFSS). I don't recall this being raised by any other officer performing the Inspector's role in DNA however it is possible that those performing Inspector or Officer in Charge duties may well have raised issues directly with QHFSS.
- 18. From time-to-time Inspector Dave Neville emailed me regarding DNA turnaround times, thresholds for testing and DNA sample triaging. I also recall conversations between myself and Inspector Neville over the duration of my tenure at FSG. I do not recall the specifics of each of the conversations, but I had confidence in Inspector Dave Neville to manage the turnaround times as part of his responsibilities as the Officer in Charge of the DNA Unit.
- 19. On my return to the Superintendent position in 2021/2022, I recall discussions regarding the current status of DNA testing and turnaround times, with Inspector Dave Neville raising concerns in relation to turnaround times and the thresholds for testing. I raised the issue with the Assistant Commissioner and an Executive Briefing Note (EBN) was prepared and submitted to the Acting Assistant Commissioner in February of 2022. A copy of that EBN is attached and marked 'Exhibit 8'.
- 20. On the 18<sup>th</sup> of November 2021, I attended a meeting with Lara Keller (Acting Executive Director for QHFSS), Justin Howes (Acting Manager for QHFSS), Inspector Dave Neville and myself to discuss various issues including the DNA testing turnaround times. During that briefing, I made notes the following notes at pages 184 to 185 official diary K24470 which states:

QHFSS and QPS meeting – present ED Keller / Acting Manager QHFSS Justin Howes, Inspector Dave Neville and self – discussed current status of DNA testing and turnaround times / status of Forensic Register testing and expected enhancements, illicit drugs and other items. There was an appreciation for the stats and the turnaround times with QH recognising there was some room for improvement. Discussed they had some priority jobs (Blackburn) – agreement that Inspector Neville

Witnes

SENSITIVE

Dale Frieberg

THE PEACE

ICE & ATTOR

7

would email stats to QH at the beginning of each week and that they would continue to monitor to improve.

A copy of pages 184 to 185 of my official diary (K24470) are attached and marked **'Exhibit 9'**.

## Communication between the FSG and QHFSS

- 21. During my handover period with Acting Superintendent McLaren in 2017, I met with QHFSS staff at Coopers Plains. From my recollection Cathie Allen, Paul Csoban and Acting Superintendent McLaren were present. The purpose of the meeting was to introduce me. Regular meetings occurred during my period with the FSG in 2017/2018 (possibly on a monthly basis). There were also emails between QPS members and QHFSS staff, often Cathie Allen and primarily with DNA / Forensic Register Staff.
- 22. On my return to the FSG in 2021, Cathie Allen contacted me with a view to reestablishing the regular meetings.
- 23. The meetings with QHFSS were, at times, held in person during my time at the FSG in 2017/2018. On my return in 2021/2022 meetings were generally conducted using Microsoft Teams and not in person. The Acting Executive Director (ED), Lara Keller, was also involved in those meetings.
- 24. The meetings were generally held to discuss matters either QHFSS or QPS needed to raise such as the Forensic Register; DNA; SAIKs; Procedures regarding QPS members attending autopsies; bar code changes and implications for the Forensic Register requiring updating; and DNA testing kits.
- 25. I can recall two meetings relating to SAIKs during my time as Superintendent in 2021/2022. This related to the non-compliance of QHFSS with the guidelines for taking of reference samples and to discuss training and expansion of locations where samples could be taken. Minutes were taken on both occasions, with the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting recorded electronically.



8

- 26. I personally did not experience any communication problems with QHFSS staff and on my return in 2021/2022. I found the Acting ED, Lara Keller easy to communicate with. In my view, she appeared to work to ensure there was good communication and relationship between the two agencies.
- 27. The communication between QHFSS and QPS was professional and ongoing. In 2022 Acting ED Keller indicated to be me that she found Inspector Dave Neville to be very professional. In saying that, it appeared to me there was an obvious rub in personalities between Inspector Dave Neville and Cathie Allen. I am not aware of the history behind this however, I recall Cathie Allen was disappointed when Inspector Dave Neville was appointed to the DNA portfolio.
- 28. I cannot recall any specific steps taken by myself to improve communication between QPS and QHFSS, nor did I feel a need too. Communication between the parties occurred through meetings and conversations or by responding to emails, as required. I was of the view that, whilst there was a personality rub, Inspector Dave Neville was proactive in performing his role and challenging issues with QHFSS where necessary.
- 29. My relationship with Cathie Allen during each period I worked as Superintendent of the FSG was always professional.

#### The Forensic Register

Dale Frieberg

- 30. The Forensic Register (FR) is an information management system that was built inhouse within the FSG (by Troy O'Malley when he was employed by the QPS). QPS entered into a managed service arrangement (MOU) with QHFSS with respect to their access and use of the FR. I had no involvement in discussions regarding the managed service arrangement as this was already in place on my arrival in 2017/2018.
- 31. On my return in 2021/2022, new contractual arrangements regarding the FR were in place. I was involved in regular monthly meetings between the FSG and BDNA who are a technology systems integrator and business advisory consultancy. These meetings did not require QHFSS to be present. Superintendent Bruce McNab navigated the current arrangements.

SENSITIVE

THE PEAC

CE & ATTOP

Witness

9

- 32. The only issues brought to my attention in relation to the FR were in relation to succession planning and protection of the coding of the FR. When Troy O'Malley resigned from the QPS in 2018 and moved to BDNA, the QPS had to engage BDNA to provide ongoing support as they were now the only provider with expertise in the functions and capabilities of the FR.
- 33. Prior to his resignation, Troy O'Malley was the Acting Inspector in charge of the Forensic Technology Unit. He had been relieving in that role for 8 years continuously. He was the Forensic Register as a result of it being his design and him being the primary administrator over a long period of time.

## **The Options Paper**

Dale Frieberg

- 34. I first became aware of the report entitled, 'A review of the automatic concentration of DNA extracts using Microcon Centrifugal Filter Devices: Options for QPS consideration (January 2018)' (the Options Paper) via an email from Cathie Allen. In that email she stated that she and Paul Csoban were going to discuss it as an agenda item at a set meeting between QHFSS and QPS in 2018. I cannot recall any discussions with QHFSS surrounding the Options Paper prior to 30 January 2018. On receipt of the Options Paper, I forwarded it to the Acting Inspector of the QPS DNA Management Unit, Ewen Taylor, requesting advice. A copy of correspondence regarding the Options Paper is attached and marked 'Exhibit 10'.
- 35. On 2 February 2018, I recall having a meeting with QFHSS to discuss the Options Paper. Whilst I cannot specifically recall this meeting, I made notes of it at pages 54 to 56 of my official diary K20405. A copy of my diary entry is attached and marked 'Exhibit 11'.
- 36. After the meeting with QHFSS on 2 February 2018, I sent an email to Cathie Allen and others confirming my understanding of the issues and my position in regard to them. Attached and marked 'Exhibit 12' is a copy of an email dated 2 February 2018 regarding the Options Paper.

**SENSITIVE** 

Witness

10

- 37. I cannot recall any further conversation relating to the Options Paper other than what was recorded in my diary notes or emails.
- On advice of the subject matter experts, QHFSS, whom QPS pay \$3M a year for advice and guidance in best practice, in addition to Acting Inspector Taylor, I accepted Option 2 of the Options Paper.
- 39. I am not a scientist and relied on and trusted advice provided by the subject matter experts. I acted on the advice believing it was the best option at the time. My understanding was that the option would be of benefit to the QPS, being more productive as well as being a more efficient choice. I was also under the impression that DNA staff could continue to request additional processing as it was received by investigators, therefore did not anticipate an impact on DNA testing results. As a result of the choice, I was also under the impression it would provide the opportunity to concentrate on samples yielding more DNA to assist in the solvability of cases.
- 40. I cannot recall if the changes proposed by the Options Paper were put into practice.
- 41. I cannot recall whether there was any internal QPS communication surrounding the implementation of the Options Paper.
- 42. At the time of accepting Option 2, I was of the opinion that the selection made would enable QHFSS to provide the best service for the QPS. However, based on subsequent advice from, and conversations with, Inspector Neville and having regard to the approaches he has made to QHFSS over time, it appears that there may be DNA that would yield results should the testing thresholds be revisited and changed.

## **Olivia McIntyre**

- 43. Olivia is a staff member who works in the DNA unit. I am not aware of the role she performs or what her responsibilities are.
- 44. I have no knowledge of any involvement Olivia may have had in 2018 or beyond as it relates to the Options Paper.



11

- 45. In relation to the **Section** investigation, I became aware of the news coverage and podcast series through Inspector Dave Neville. Inspector Dave Neville notified me of an email trail on 25 November 2021 regarding concerns raised by a former QHFSS employee involved in a podcast series called **Story**. On 25 November 2021, I forwarded the email to Acting Assistant Commissioner David French. I also forwarded some suggested dot points for a Possible Parliamentary Question (PPQ) prepared by Inspector Dave Neville to Assistant Commissioner David French's office. I understand Inspector Dave Neville discussed the dot points with the Acting ED of QHFSS, Lara Keller, as a courtesy. A copy of my email set on 25 November 2021 to Assistant Commissioner David French and the dot points prepared by Inspector Dave Neville are attached and marked **Exhibit 13**'.
- 46. On 29 November 2021, I received an email from Inspector Neville following a conversation he had with Superintendent Craig Morrow of the Homicide Investigation Group regarding the findings of Dr Kristy Wright. On 2 December 2021, I forwarded this email to Acting Assistant Commissioner David French and also advised him about the ongoing media coverage around . The email discussed a number of issues. It recorded the fact that Inspector Neville had raised an issue in relation to another murder, that of , which had some similarity to the investigation in so far as DNA samples provided to QHFSS were deemed to be DNA insufficient and on further testing had yielded results. The email also recorded a concern raised by Inspector Neville that Cathie Allen had suggested it was incumbent on the QPS to prioritise testing and monitor results and request reworks when a sample yielded an unusual result. In the email I raised the concern that police are not DNA experts and would not have the knowledge of the likelihood of a particular sample yielding a profile based on a quantification threshold; this relied on the expert advice of the scientist who had provided advice previously there was insufficient DNA to get a result. At the conclusion of my email, I advised the Assistant Commissioner that Inspector Neville had queried whether there needed to be a review of the threshold

Witness

SENSITIVE

Dale Frieberg

12

value, to which Cathie Allen had indicated there was no need as they had ample data to support their processes. A copy of the email is attached and marked 'Exhibit 14'.

47. On 2 December 2021, Detective Inspector Larissa Miller (Coronial Support) forwarded an email to me regarding the coronial inquest, which I forwarded to the Acting Assistant Commissioner. The Acting Assistant Commissioner later acknowledged receipt of my earlier email of 2 December 2021 and noted that the inquest was to be re-opened. Those emails are attached and marked **'Exhibit 15'**.

48. On 6 December 2021, ED Keller and I were included in an email to Cathie Allen which followed up on Inspector Neville's previous inquiries. That email also advised Cathie Allen that Coroner O'Connell had scheduled a meeting with Investigators, which QHFSS were not aware of or privy to. A copy of email trails with Cathie Allen relating to this issue and dated 6 December 2021 are attached and marked **'Exhibit 16'**.

- 49. On 6 December 2021, Cathie Allen emailed me and proposed a Peer Review of the Forensic DNA Analysis casefile. ED Keller and Inspector Neville were included in the email. I raised issues regarding QHFSS releasing case information without the consent of QPS as there had been no consultation regarding the approach. A copy of my email to Acting Assistant Commissioner French is attached and marked 'Exhibit 17'.
- 50. On 7 December 2021, I sent an email to Cathie Allen advising that, as a result of the brief to the coroner being scheduled for the following day, QHFSS were not to send the file for peer review. A copy of the email incorporating my response to Cathie Allen dated 7 December 2021 is attached and marked **'Exhibit 18'**.
- 51. I recall that during this time, Inspector Neville additionally also raised concerns with me over information being released by QH on an RTI request without consultation.
- 52. On 9 December 2021, I emailed ED Keller and then called her personally to advise that the coroner had instructed that he did not support QH conducting a peer review and that it was not to occur. I left ED Keller to advise Cathie Allen. A copy of that email is attached and marked 'Exhibit 19'.

SENSITIVE

Dale Frieberg

13

- 53. At my request dot points were forwarded from the Forensic Manager Central Region to the Assistant Commissioner's office to provide a comprehensive brief of the meeting with the coroner. A copy of that email is attached and marked **'Exhibit 20'**.
- 54. On 14 December 2021, I received a request for Dr Matt Krosch to provide some background information to Dr Kirsty Wright regarding research he had conducted (his research was at that time released and available publicly). I believe Dr Krosch responded to the request. A copy of the emails relating to this matter are attached and marked **'Exhibit 21'**.
- 55. Inspector Dave Neville shared the email information with Cathie Allen and ED Keller as a courtesy. Cathie Allen provided a response via email. A copy of the email from Cathie Allen is attached and marked **'Exhibit 22'**.
- 56. On 20 December 2021, I was copied on an email from Cathie Allen to Inspector Dave Neville regarding an article that appeared in The Australian on 19 December 2021. A copy of that email, together with further emails between Inspector Neville and Cathie Allen the following date, are attached and marked 'Exhibit 23'.
- 57. On 22 February 2022, an EBN regarding QHFSS and DNA sample triaging, along with a draft letter under the hand of the Commissioner of Police to the Director-General at Queensland Health was sent to my office (authored by Inspector Dave Neville). The content of the briefing note was supported and submitted to the Assistant Commissioner's office. I am not aware as to what occurred following this as I finished with FSG shortly after. A copy of that EBN is referred to at paragraph [19] above and attached as **Exhibit 8.** A copy of the draft letter under the hand of the Commissioner of Police to the Director General of Queensland Health (dated 25 July 2022) is attached and marked as '**Exhibit 24''.** I note that the date of 25 July 2022 would be an automated date generated by the computer and would not have been the real date on which this document was drafted because our usual practice is to leave the date blank.

Dale Frieberg

THE PEA

Witness

SENSITIVE

14

58.	I do not independently recall	I am aware now that it was
_	the Homicide Investigation of	
_		

59. I do not recall having any involvement the homicide investigation.

60. I do not recall having any communication within the FSG or with QHFSS regarding this operation.

## Investigation into the death of

- 61. I became aware of the investigation into the death after receiving two emails, one from Tania Spiteri dated 26 November 2021 and an email dated Monday 29 November 2021 from Inspector Dave Neville. A copy of these emails are attached and marked 'Exhibit 25'.
- 62. I received another email from Inspector Dave Neville dated 6 December 2021, where DNA testing thresholds were addressed by him. This formed part of the EBN that was submitted to the Assistant Commissioner in February 2022. A copy of the email by Inspector Dave Neville and attached email trail is attached and marked **'Exhibit 26'**.
- 63. The Acting Assistant Commissioner advised me to raise it as a customer service issue, with QHFSS, in first instance. I conveyed that advice to Inspector Dave Neville to approach accordingly.
- 64. I believe Inspector Neville raised the issue with Cathie Allen, as requested, and later an Executive Briefing Note was prepared for submission to the Assistant Commissioner.A copy of the email trail with Cathie Allen is attached and marked 'Exhibit 27'.
- 65. A summary was provided as part of the weekly brief to the Assistant Commissioner's office regarding the **and matters**. A copy of this summary is attached and marked **'Exhibit 28'**.
- 66. I do not recall any further involvement in this matter.



#### **Forensic Medical Examinations**

Dale Frieberg

- 67. A Sexual Assault Investigation Kit (SAIK) is used in the examination of a victim who has been subject to a sexual assault (Rape). Two samples are taken from a victim exposing the victim to two separate forensic procedures. The first procedure is conducted in order to take samples (for evidentiary purposes) from the victim using the SAIK. The second, 'a reference sample' is a procedure that occurs later, where a DNA reference sample (usually a mouth swab and on occasion a blood sample) is taken from the victim. The reference sample is completed several days or even a week following the first procedure and is (currently) taken by a police officer.
- 68. On my return to the FSG in October 2021 I received an email from Inspector Gai Bolderow dated 8 October 2021 titled, "Issues experienced with Sexual Assault Forensic Procedures". It discussed ongoing issues that the Child Abuse and Sexual Crime Group were having with QH regarding the provision of forensic examinations of sexual assault victims by Hospital and Health Services. The email was authored by Detective Inspector Dave Briese and highlighted the non-compliance with the Queensland Government Interagency Guidelines (the Guideline) of 2014 (a document signed by the Chief Executive Officer of each of QPS, QH, DJAG and the Department of Communities, Child Safety and Disability Services). A copy of the email by Inspector Gai Bolderow dated 8 October 2021 is attached and marked **'Exhibit 29'**.
- 69. Inspector Peter Bushell of Forensic Services forwarded an email to me on 11 October 2021 outlining the issues around reference samples which are taken as part of the forensic medical examination. A copy of the email by Inspector Peter Bushell is attached and marked 'Exhibit 30'.
- 70. Following the emails, I met with Inspector Bushell and Inspector Dave Briese in person and on the phone to discuss the issues further from a victim-centric perspective.
- 71. On 17 November 2021, a discussion in relation to SAIK issues occurred with Inspectors Dave Neville and Peter Bushell and ED Keller. The conversation concerned who needed to be involved. The parties previously engaged in conversations were identified as being Dr Adam Griffin / Dr Keith McNeil. It was agreed to meet in 1 weeks' time,

SENSITIVE

Witness

THE PEACE

16

with my office to set a meeting. I advised ED Keller that we were in the process of escalating the issues up through our chain of command. ED Keller seemed supportive of compliance with the Guideline. It was noted that Dr Griffin reports to her and that Cathie Allen was currently on Recreation Leave. A copy of my diary (page 188 of diary K24470) regarding my notes of this conversation is attached and marked **'Exhibit 31'**.

- 72. On Thursday 18 November 2021, there was a further discussion with Acting Assistant Commissioner Dave French and Assistant Commissioner Kath Innes regarding concerns around SAIKs and non-compliance with the Guideline. Present also was myself and Inspectors Dave Briese, Peter Bushell and Dave Neville. The Assistant Commissioners were invited to attend a meeting with ED Keller. It was determined that an MBN would be provided - as reference material - prior to meeting. It was also suggested that a working group form and that there be an agency meeting between QH and QPS. A copy of my notes of this conversation (page 202 of diary K24470) are attached and marked 'Exhibit 32'.
- 73. On 24 November 2021, I sent an email to Assistant Commissioner Kath Innes briefing her as to the issues to be raised in the meeting later that morning with ED Lara Keller. A copy of my email to Assistant Commissioner Kath Innes and Inspector Dave Briese enclosing the MBN is attached and marked 'Exhibit 33'.
- 74. A copy of my diary (page 215 of diary K24470) regarding additional preparation / consideration notes for the briefing document and working group agenda on SAIKs is attached and marked 'Exhibit 34'.
- 75. Two working group meetings occurred between QHFSS and QPS. The 1<sup>st</sup> was held on Tuesday, 7 December 2021. Those present at the meeting which was held via teams is outlined on the agenda. Attached and marked 'Exhibit 35' is a copy of the agenda and minutes from this meeting.
- 76. On distribution of the minutes, there was some contention around the contents. Attached and marked **'Exhibit 36'** is a copy of relevant emails relating to this issue as well as notes from my official diary K24470 at pages 273 to 278.

SENSITIVE

Dale Friekerg

Λ

OF THE PEACE

17

- 77. As a result of the comments made regarding the minutes from the 7th of December meeting, I made the decision that any future working group meetings would be electronically recorded for accuracy.
- 78. Dr Griffin and Detective Inspector Dave Briese had met on a number of occasions. I was not privy to those meetings, but I understand that there were discussions around SAIKs and QH locations.
- 79. Dr Griffin is the Director and Senior Forensic Physician of the Clinical Forensic Medical Unit (CFMU) at Queensland Health. I had not met Dr Griffin prior to the meeting on the 15<sup>th</sup> of December 2021.
- 80. Dr Griffin was an apology for the 1st Working Group meeting. He attended the second Working Group meeting which was held on the 15<sup>th</sup> of December 2021 over Microsoft Teams. I found him to be difficult and belligerent. As a result, it seemed apparent to me that the working group was not going to progress, so I interjected and terminated the meeting early. Dr Griffin did not appear interested in progressing issues. He made comment that there was a typographical error in the guideline document which, if it had been corrected, would remove their (Queensland Health medical staff) responsibility from being involved in the taking of reference samples. He also stated that he did not have confidence in his Medical Doctors to take a reference sample. Attached and marked **'Exhibit 37'** is a copy of this meeting agenda and transcript.
- 81. The following day or so, ED Lara Keller reached out to me and Inspector Dave Neville for a meeting to move forward with the issues and the working group. She indicated she would keep the working group at practitioner level. I do not recall whether ED Lara Keller reached out to me via email or telephone or some other method but do recall that Dave Neville alerted me to the fact and the meeting was set.
- 82. A briefing was then provided by me to both Acting Assistant Commissioner David French and Assistant Commissioner Kath Innes.



83. As a result of the apparent difficulties in progressing issues of non-compliance with the guidelines by QH out of the working group (meeting on 15 December 2021), an EBN was compiled and submitted. It was progressed to Deputy Commissioner Tracy Linford who was a committee member of the Women's Safety Justice Taskforce. I was later advised by Assistant Commissioner Kath Innes that matters had been progressed to the Commissioner. I do not recall if there were any other issues regarding forensic medical examinations during my time with the FSG.

## Other issues

Dale Frieberg

- 84. I am aware that, at the time I commenced as Superintendent of the FSG in 2017, there were some issues around the PowerPlex 21 kit (PP21), namely amplification issues which affected the results. The turnaround times also increased. Cathie Allen forwarded an email to this effect in April of 2018. It appeared to be a manufacturing issue with new kits provided by the manufacturer, however the issue continued. It appeared from advice from QHFSS that other jurisdictions experienced similar issues which confirmed the issues were kit-based rather than an issue within QHFSS. During this issue, Cathie Allen provided regular updates to the QPS with a view to resolve the issues. Attached and marked **'Exhibit 38'** are copies of relevant emails pertaining to this issue.
- 85. Other than the issues already identified, I recall Inspector Neville identified an issue regarding the rate of DNA sampling being undertaken by QPS officers. That is arresting officers were not collecting DNA samples from offenders as often as they could have been. This may have had flow on impacts on crime clear up rates. The issues were raised to Executive Level with the issue communicated to District Officers and Regional Assistant Commissioners.
- 86. I cannot recall whether there were any changes in policy or processes about, or the training related to, DNA collection, transportation or storage during my time in the FSG.

SENSITIVE

Witness

- 19
- 87. During my time in the FSG I recall that issues were raised by QHFSS during the 2021 SAIK working group meetings as it related to reference samples and packaging of same / concerns of contamination. These were captured in the relevant minutes as provided.
- 88. I recall Inspector Dave Neville having a conversation with me regarding the retraction or changing of DNA results by QFHSS however I cannot recall if this was during my time as the Superintendent or while Superintendent McNab was in the role. While I cannot recall the specifics on the conversation, I do recall him indicating that Queensland Health had on more than one occasion withdrawn their previous position on DNA findings. Attached and marked **'Exhibit 39'** is a copy of an email sent to me by Inspector Dave Neville in September 2018 regarding the recall of results by QHFSS.
- 89. From a policing perspective, the consequence of retracting results could compromise the outcome of an investigation or prosecution as well as potentially jeopardise current and historic cases. The consequences could also include loss of confidence of the community and government.

**TAKEN AND DECLARED** before me at Brisbane in the State of Queensland this day of September 2022







# STATEMENT OF DALE FRIEBERG INDEX TO EXHIBITS

Exhibit no.	Description	
1.	Notice number 2022/00035 – Requirement to give information in a written statement	
2.	Resume of Dale Jennifer Frieberg – Chief Superintendent Application - undated	
3.	Handover briefing documents from Scott McLaren to Dale Frieberg - 2017	
4.	Handover briefing documents from Duncan McCarthy to Dale Frieberg $-05/10/2021$	
5.	Handover briefing document from Dale Frieberg to Bruce McNab - 2022	
6.	Executive Briefing Note – Non-Compliance of 2014 Queensland Government Interagency Guidelines – Response to people who have experienced sexual assault	
7.	Forensic Services Group Organisational Chart – July 2017	
8.	Executive Briefing Note – Potential issues with testing of DNA by Queensland Health Forensic and Scientific Services – undated	
9.	Official Diary No. K24470 pp 184-185	
10.	Email from Cathie Allen (QHFSS) to Dale Frieberg dated 30/01/2018	
11.	Official Diary Notes regarding Options Paper – 02/02/2018	
12.	Email from Dale Frieberg to Cathie Allen (QHFSS), Troy O'Malley (QPS), Ewen Taylor (QPS) & Paul Csoban (QHFSS) titled: RE: Options Paper for consideration – 02/02/2018	
13.	Email from Dale Frieberg to Acting Assistant Commissioner French enclosing email chain from Justin Howes (QHFSS) titled: FW: Forensic DNA lab in the news – 25 November 2021 and email from David Neville to Dale Frieberg titled: RE: PPQ Forensic DNA lab in the news	
14.	Email from Dale Frieberg to Acting Assistant Commissioner French titled: FW: Blackburn matter $-02/12/2021$	
15.	Emails between Dale Frieberg and Acting Assistant Commissioner French titled: FW:      and RE:    matter - 02/12/2021	
16.	Email chain Tania Spiteri (QPS), David Neville (QPS), Cathie Allen (QHFSS), Justin Howes (QHFSS) & Dale Frieberg titled: RE: URGENT REQUEST: Full casefile request from QHFSS – - 06/12/2021	
17.	Email from Dale Frieberg to Acting Assistant Commissioner French enclosing email chain Cathie Allen (QHFSS), David Neville (QPS) & Dale Frieberg titled: FW: Peer Review of Forensic DNA Analysis casefile – 06/12/2021	

18.	Email to Cathie Allen (QHFSS) from Dale Frieberg titled: RE: Peer Review of Forensic DNA Analysis casefile $-07/12/2021$
19.	Email to Lara Keller (QHFSS) from Dale Frieberg titled: PEER REVIEW OF DNA – 09/12/2021
20.	Email from Dale Frieberg to Acting Assistant Commissioner French titled: FW: case – overview of meeting with Coroner – 09/12/2021
21.	Email chain David Keatinge (QPS), Jenna De Marco (QPS), Dr Matt Krosch (QPS), & Dr Kirsty Wright (Institute of Health and Biomedical Innovation) titled: RE: Enquiry from Dr Kirsty Wright re: DNA success rates paper and attaching emails from Dr Kirsty Wright – 16/12/2021
22.	Email chain Cathie Allen (QHFSS), David Neville (QPS), Dr Kirsty Wright (Institute of Health and Biomedical Innovation) & Dr Matt Krosch (QPS) titled: RE: Enquiries from Ms Kirsty Wright – 17/12/2021
23.	Email chain Cathie Allen (QHFSS), David Neville (QPS) and others titled: FW: story – latest article from the Australian – 20/12/2021
24.	Draft letter under hand of Commissioner of Police, Katarina Carroll (QPS) to Director- General of Queensland Health, Dr John Wakefield - 25/07/2022
25.	Email from Tania Spiteri (QPS) titled: Closure of – Homicide of – 26/11/2021 and email chain David Neville and Dale Frieberg (QPS) titled: RE: DNA testing – 29/11/2021
26.	Email from David Neville (QPS) to Dale Frieberg titled: RE: DNA testing - 06/12/2021
27.	Email chain David Neville (QPS) and Cathie Allen (QHFSS) titled: Re: - 17/12/2021
28.	Operations Support Command: Weekly Summary and Matters of Note – 29/11/2021
29.	Email from Gai Bolderrow (QPS) to Dale Frieberg titled: RE: Issues experienced with Sexual Assault Forensic Procedures – 08/10/2021
30.	Email from Peter Bushell (QPS) to Dale Frieberg titled: RE: Issues experience with Sexual Assault Forensic Procedures – 11/10/2021
31.	Official Diary No. K24470 regarding SAIK issues - 17/11/2021
32.	Official Diary No. K24470 regarding SAIK concerns - 18/11/2021
33.	Email from Dale Frieberg to Assistant Commissioner Katherine Innes (QPS) & David Briese (QPS) titled: FW: DOC21/1934056 - MBN – BREACH OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES -
34.	Official Diary No. K24470 regarding consideration notes for briefing note and working group agenda on SAIKS (pp 215-216)
35.	Agenda and Minutes for SAIK Working Group Meeting (07/12/2021)

36.	Various emails regarding RE: Updated: SAIK working group Minutes 07.12.2021 and notes from Official Diary No. K24470
37.	Agenda and Minutes for SAIK Working Group Meeting – 15/12/2021
38.	Various emails regarding issue with PP21 kit
39.	Email from David Neville (QPS) to Dale Frieberg titled: recall of results by FSSQHS $-10/09/2018$

EXHIBIT 1

# Notice number: 2022/ 000 35

## COMMISSION OF INQUIRY INTO FORENSIC DNA TESTING IN QUEENSLAND

Section 5(1)(d) of the Commissions of Inquiry Act 1950

## REQUIREMENT TO GIVE INFORMATION IN A WRITTEN STATEMENT

To: Dale Freiberg

Of: Queensland Police Service

I, Walter Sofronoff QC, Commissioner, appointed pursuant to Commissions of Inquiry Order (No. 3) 2022 to inquire into certain matters pertaining to forensic DNA testing in Queensland require you to attend to give a written statement to the Commission pursuant to section 5(1)(d) of the *Commissions of Inquiry Act 1950* in regard to your knowledge of the matters set out in the Schedule annexed hereto.

YOU MUST COMPLY WITH THIS REQUIREMENT BY:

Giving a written statement prepared either in affidavit form or verified as a statutory declaration under the *Oaths Act 1867* to the Commission of Inquiry on or before **5.00 pm Monday 1 August 2022**, by delivering it to Level 21, 111 George Street, Brisbane.

A copy of the written statement must also be provided electronically by email at with the subject line "Requirement for Written Statement".

If you believe that you have a reasonable excuse for not complying with this notice, you will need to satisfy me of this by the above date.

DATED this	18th	day of	July	2022
Walter Sofronoff QC				
Commissioner				
Commission of Inquir	y into F	orensic DNA Te	esting in Queen	sland

## Notice 2022/ 000 35

## Schedule of topics for statement

## Superintendent Dale Freiberg

1. State your current rank and position in the QPS.

## Qualifications and experience

- 2. List your post-graduate qualifications, the year obtained, and the institute from which the qualifications were obtained.
- Provide your work history since you commenced in the QPS. Include the year you commenced, each position you held, and the location and year(s) each position was held. In providing the work history:
  - (a) Explain the role you held as Superintendent of the Forensic Services Group (the FSG) in 2017 and 2018, including your responsibilities and duties. Include the people you reported to and the people who reported to you. Include each person's name, rank and position.
  - (b) Include information about the handover you received entering the Superintendent position in the FSG in 2017 and the handover you gave when leaving the position. Identify, in particular, any issues relating to the collection and testing of biological material. Identify the people by name, rank and position that you took over from and who took over from you. Attach a copy of any handover brief/emails/file notes/diary notes.
  - (c) For when you were Superintendent of the FSG in 2021 and 2022, advise if any of the responsibilities or duties of the role had changed since you were in the position in 2017 and 2018.
  - (d) Include information about the handover you received entering the Superintendent position in the FSG in 2021 and the handover you gave when leaving the position. Identify, in particular, any issues relating to the collection and testing of biological material. Identify the people by name, rank and position that you took over from and who took over from you. Attach a copy of any handover brief/emails/file notes/diary notes.
- 4. Attach a current CV.
- 5. Explain the structure of the FSG when you worked there in 2017 to 2018.

## Backlogs

- 6. At the time you took over as Superintendent of the FSG in each of 2017 and 2021, were there any DNA testing/reporting backlogs?
- During your time in the role as Superintendent of the FSG in each of 2017 to 2018 and 2021 to 2022, were there any DNA testing/reporting backlogs?
- 8. Did anybody explain to you or to other members of the QPS what the reasons were for any backlogs, and what rectifying steps were to be taken? Was there still a backlog when you left the position of Superintendent of the FSG?

## Communication between the FSG and QHFSS

- 9. Each time you worked as the Superintendent of the FSG, did you communicate with any staff at Queensland Health Forensic and Scientific Services (**QHFSS**)? If so, which staff members did you communicate with, what did you typically speak to them about, and how frequent was the communication? Identify what method of communication you used (telephone, email and/or some other method).
- 10. Each time you commenced working as the Superintendent of the FSG, were there regular meetings between the FSG and QHFSS? If so, did you attend the meetings? If you did attend, what were the title/purpose of the meetings, how regularly were they held and were minutes/records kept of the meetings? Attach a copy of the minutes/records.
- 11. In your time as the Superintendent of the FSG, were any communication problems with QHFSS raised with you?
- 12. Did you ever set about improving the communication between the FSG and QHFSS? If yes, how? Do you have any records regarding your attempts to improve the communication? If yes, attach copies.
- 13. Describe your relationship with Cathie Allen during each period you worked as Superintendent of the FSG.

## The Forensic Register

14. Identify your understanding of the role and functions of the Forensic Register. During your time working in the FSG, did QHFSS commence also using the Forensic Register? If so, outline your role in dealing with the process of QHFSS commencing use of the Forensic Register.

- 15. Identify if there were any other issues, problems or matters with the Forensic Register that were brought to your attention while you worked in the FSG. If there were, provide details of each matter.
- 16. What role did Troy O'Malley have when you worked in the FSG? What involvement did Troy O'Malley have with the development and implementation of the Forensic Register?

## **The Options Paper**

- 17. Explain how you first became aware of the report entitled A review of the automatic concentration of DNA extracts using Microcon Centrifugal Filter Devices: Options for QPS consideration (January 2018) (the Options Paper).
- 18. Identify what discussions, if any, you had with staff at the QHFSS surrounding the Options Paper or topics discussed in the Options Paper prior to 30 January 2018.
- 19. Identify what steps you took once you received the Options Paper. Identify who you discussed the Options Paper with within the QPS, and what you discussed. Include the name, rank and position of each person you discussed the paper with.
- 20. Attach any correspondence you were party to regarding the Options Paper.
- 21. What meetings did you have with QHFSS regarding the Options Paper? When were the meetings held and who attended the meetings? What representations were made by QHFSS about the Options Paper at those meetings?
- 22. Attach any file note/diary note you made/have/possess relating to the Options Paper or meetings about the Options Paper.
- 23. What discussions/conversations/telephone calls did you have with the authors of the Options Paper about the Options Paper? Attach any file note/diary note you made, have or possess relating to those conversations.
- 24. When was the Options Paper accepted, how was it accepted and by whom (name, rank and position)?
- 25. At the time the Options Paper was accepted, what was your understanding of the Options Paper? What was your understanding of the consequences (both positives and negatives) of accepting each of the options presented to you/QPS and of the option finally accepted by the QPS?
- 26. When were the changes proposed by the Options Paper put into practice and how were they put into practice?

WIT.0035.0001.0027

- 27. To your knowledge, what were/are the consequences (positive and negative) of the QPS having accepted the Options Paper?
- 28. Was there any internal QPS communication surrounding the implementation of the Options Paper/changes in testing (i.e. to investigators, scenes of crime officers, scientific officers)? If so, to who, by who, in what format (email, QPRIME entries) and when?

## **Olivia McIntyre**

- 29. Who is Olivia McIntyre and what position does she hold within the QPS? What role does she perform? What are her responsibilities?
- 30. What involvement, if any, did Olivia McIntyre have with respect to the Options Paper?
- What actions, if any, did you take in response to the news coverage of the investigation and/or the Story podcast in 2021 and 2022?
- 32. What discussions and/or communication did you have within the QPS, including with David Neville, as a result of that news coverage? What discussions and/or communication did you have with QHFSS, including with Cathie Allen or Lara Keller, as a result of that news coverage? Attach any copies of such communication, and notes of any conversations or meetings.
- 33. Explain what role, if any, you had in preparing and/or approving an Executive Briefing Note (EBN) and/or Ministerial Briefing Note (MBN) in response to the news coverage?
  What ultimately happened to that EBN/MBN? Attach a copy of the EBN/MBN.
- 34. Outline what \_\_\_\_\_\_ was and who it related to. Include the month and year when the death/murder occurred.
- 35. If you became aware of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_ while working in the FSG, outline the circumstances in which you became aware of that operation. Explain what role you had with respect to the testing and/or further testing of biological material in that operation.
- 36. Attach any copies of your communication within the FSG and with QHFSS about

WIT.0035.0001.0028

5

## Investigation into the death of

- 37. Outline the circumstances in which you became aware of the investigation into the death of while working in the FSG. Explain what role you had with respect to the testing and/or further testing of biological material in the operation.
- 38. Attach any copies of your communication within the FSG and with QHFSS about the investigation into the death of

## **Forensic Medical Examinations**

- 39. Explain what a Sexual Assault Investigation Kit (SAIK) is, and what 'reference sampling' is.
- 40. Identify if there were any issues, problems or matters about SAIKs and/or reference sampling that came to your attention when working in the FSG? If so, provide details of those matters, who raised them, and when they came to your attention.
- 41. Explain what actions you took, if any, in response to those matters being raised with you? Were any new policies or guidelines about SAIKs and/or reference sampling developed or adopted when you worked in the FSG? If yes, provide details.
- 42. Identify the role of Dr Adam Griffin, and explain what involvement he had (if any) with the matters discussed in the immediately preceding three paragraphs.
- 43. When you worked in the FSG, identify if you were aware of or dealt with any other problems or issues regarding forensic medical examinations.

## Other issues

- 44. At the time you commenced as Superintendent of the FSG, were there any substantive issues or problems regarding DNA collection or testing?
- 45. During your time in the role as Superintendent of the FSG, were there any substantive issues or problems regarding DNA collection or testing?
- 46. During your time in the FSG, were you involved with or aware of any changes in policies or processes about, or the training related to, DNA collection, transportation or storage? If so, what were they?
- 47. During your time in the FSG, did QHFSS or any other stakeholder raise any issues with the methods, systems and processes of DNA collection employed by the QPS?
- 48. During your time in the FSG, were any issues raised with you regarding the retraction or changing of results by QHFSS, that is, the reporting of likelihood ratios in the billions

49. What was the consequence from a policing perspective of the retraction of results in such circumstances?

## EXHIBIT 2

RESUME OF DALE

FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

#### Vacancy Details

Closing Date: 5 August 2019 Designation: Chief Superintendent

## **Applicant Details**

Name: Rank: P

Address: Telephone:

Command:

Referees

Internal:

External:

	Dale	Frieberg	5			
	Superinten	dent				
	Commande	er, Recruit a	and Cons	stable Tra	ining	
		1				
				_		
		_				
					_	

#### **ESSENTIAL SELECTION CRITERIA**

#### ESC 1

The integrity and professionalism displayed throughout my career, acknowledged by QPS and externally through receipt of the Australian Police Medal (Queens birthday honours list 2018), National Police service Medal, National Medals and clasps and the QPS Medal for diligent and ethical service, in addition to recognition and acknowledgement of my exceptional achievements, enhancing standing of women (QPS). Maintain highest standard personal integrity, placing high value on my reputation which has afforded me opportunities to develop beyond core duties. Personally selected by Governor of Qld to represent her 1<sup>st</sup> full time QPS Aide-de-Camp, continuously displayed exemplary conduct, professionalism and integrity in my duties (highest office in Qld), leading by example by modelling behaviours, resulting, 7 continuous years QPS officers following in my footsteps.

#### ESC 2

I have attained a number of tertiary qualifications during my service, including but not limited to a Master's degree in leadership and Management.

1

# RESUME OF DALE FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

Service History		
Rank	Location	Period
Acting Chief Superintendent	People Capability Command Project Manager Inclusion & Diversity Restorative Engagement & Cultural Reform Program (Juniper)	June 2019 — present (relieving) (previous relieving in this position - December 2018 to January 2019)
Superintendent	People Capability Command Commander Recruit & Constable Training	24/9/2018 - present
Superintendent	Operations Support Command Commander Forensic Services Group	7/8/2017 – 21/9/2018
Inspector	Operations Support Command Manager Weapons Licensing Branch	6 week relief period 2017
Inspector	Community Contact Command Strategy & Performance Officer	17/6/2013 – 7/8/20917 (substantive position)
Inspector	Ethical Standards Command Investigator, Internal Investigations Branch	1/1/2010 – 16/6/2013
Inspector	Office of the Governor <i>Aide-de-Camp</i>	27/4/2009 -31/12/2009
Acting Inspector	Office of the Governor <i>Aide-de-Camp</i>	February 2009 – 27/4/2009
Acting Inspector	Commissioner's Office Staff Officer to Commissioner	December 2008 – February 2009
Acting Inspector	Commissioner/Minister's Office QPS Senior Departmental Liaison Officer	February 2008 – December 2008
Senior Sergeant	Deputy Commissioner's Office (operations) Senior Project Officer/Staff Officer	June 2007 – February 2008
Senior Sergeant	Brisbane City Station Senior Project Officer – BCD Emergency Plan Project	October 2006 – June 2007
Acting Inspector	Fortitude Valley Station Inspector, Patrol Services	July 2006

# RESUME OF DALE

# FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

Senior Sergeant	Fortitude Valley Station Officer In Charge	February – September 2006
Acting Inspector	Metropolitan North Region	January – February 2006
	Regional Duty Officer	
Acting Inspector (total 20 weeks)	Drug and Alcohol Coordination Unit, OSC Manager / Inspector in Charge	2005
Senior Sergeant	Brisbane Central District Events Coordinator / Field Commander – Bridge 2 Brisbane & RNA Ekka policing response	August 2005
Senior Sergeant	Drug and Alcohol Coordination Unit, OSC Senior Project Officer	February – August 2005
Senior Sergeant	Assistant Commissioner's Office, Metropolitan North Region Project – Risk Management Review of MNR Prostitution Unit	October 2004 – January 2005
Senior Sergeant	Fortitude Valley Station Officer In Charge	October 2004 (1 month)
Senior Sergeant	Brisbane Central District Events Coordinator / Field Commander – Bridge 2 Brisbane & RNA Ekka policing response	June – August 2004
Senior Sergeant	Brisbane Central District District Brief Manager (substantive position)	14/7/2003 – June 2007
Senior Sergeant	Brisbane Central and Brisbane West Districts District Brief Manager	February 2003
Sergeant	Brisbane City Station Shift Supervisor – General Duties (substantive position)	1/7/1999 – 14/7/2003
Sergeant	CHOGM Motorcade Commander	25/2/2002 - 6/3/2002

RESUME OF DALE	FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

A/Senior Sergeant	Brisbane City Station Officer In Charge / Administrator	September – November 2002
Sergeant	Brisbane Central District PCYC – Lang Park <i>Officer In Charge</i>	December 2002 (1 month)
A/Senior Sergeant	Brisbane City Station Team Leader – General Duties	August – September 2000 & November – December 1999
Sergeant	Brisbane Police Prosecutions OSC Senior Police Prosecutor (substantive position)	15/5/1995 – 1/7/1999
A/Senior Sergeant	Brisbane Police Prosecutions OSC OIC Duties Brief Manager DPP Central Committals Module Court 5 Prosecutions Brief Checking Unit Training Assessor Court 1 Prosecutions (Call Over Court)	15/10/1998 – 11/10/1998 12/10/1998 - 26/10/1998 10/08/1998 – 11/9/1998 14/09/1998 – 21/09/1998 March & April 1998
Sergeant	Brisbane Police Prosecutions Brisbane Children's Court Officer In Charge	February 1997 – February 1998
Acting Sergeant	Inala Police Prosecutions Metropolitan South Region Senior Prosecutor / Officer In Charge	13/12/1994 – 27/01/1995
A/Sergeant	Metropolitan South Region Prosecution Corps at Inala, Cleveland & Holland Park Senior Prosecutor / Officer In Charge	1993 – 1995
Senior Constable	Metropolitan South Region Prosecution Corps Police Prosecutor	31/5/1993 – 15/5/1995
Constable	Brisbane Police Prosecutions Trainee Police Prosecutor	5/10/1992 - 30/02/1993
Constable	Capalaba Police Station Metropolitan South Region	April – October 1992

RESUME OF DALE	FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPER	INTENDENT APPLICATION
	General Duties Officer & Inquiry Office Duties	
Plain Clothes Constable	Missing Persons Bureau State Crime Operations Command Investigate & Locate Missing Persons	May 1990 – April 1992
Plain Clothes Constable	Camp Hill Juvenile Aid Bureau Metropolitan South Region Juvenile Investigations	January – February 1990
Constable	Indooroopilly Police Station Metropolitan North Region General Duties Policing	February – June 1990
Plain Clothes Constable	Missing Persons Bureau State Crime Operations Command Investigate & Locate Missing Persons	November – December 1989
Constable	Brisbane City Watchhouse Metropolitan North Region Watchhouse Duties (processing of offenders)	August – September 1989
Constable	Brisbane City Station Metropolitan North Region General Duties Policing	June – August 1989
Probationary Police Constable	Queensland Police Service Academy, Oxley Probationary Police Constable	22/11/1988 – 9/6/1989

Relevant External Qualifications & Courses				
Course	Year	Institution		
Masters in Leadership and	Completed 2018	Australian Graduate School of		
Management – Policing and		Police Management -Charles		
Security		Sturt University		
		÷		
Mentor - QBalance	2018 and 2019	People Capability Command,		
	90°	QPS through the Australian		
		Institute of Police Management		
Graduate Certificate in Applied	2017	Australian Institute of Police		
Management (Policing and		Management		
Emergency Services)				
Completed with Distinction				

# RESUME OF DALE

# FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

Foundation Subjects – Company Directors Course Subjects: Finance for Directors Strategy & Risk for Directors Governance for Directors	2016	Australian Institute of Company Directors (AICD)
Graduate Diploma in Leadership and Management Graduated with Distinction	2005 - 2008	Australian Graduate School of Police Management – Charles Sturt University
Diploma in Teaching – English and Home Economics	1985/1986 (not completed)	Kelvin Grove Teachers College (now QUT)

Relevant Internal Qualifications & Courses		
Course	Year	
Masters in Leadership and Management Policing and Security	Graduated December 2018	
Australian Institute of Police Management – Graduate Certificate of Applied Management	November/December 2017	
QPS/AIPM Phase 1, 2 & 3 Command Course Disaster Management Arrangements	2017/2018	
Chandler Macleod Superintendent Selection Assessment Centre	2017	
Australian Institute of Police Management – Balance: Women Leaders in Public Safety Program 2016	19 July – 27 October 2016	
Assessment Centre Program (Senior Sergeant to Inspector)	November 2007 (M/M+ / Grading of 31)	
Prince 2 Project Management Course	October 2007	
Incident Command Course	December 2006	
Career Planning Course	February 2006	
Mental Health Intervention Course	January 2006	
Leadership & Mentoring Program for Women	2005	
Disaster Management Arrangements (QLD DES)	2005 Obtained knowledge of arrangements of the Qld Disaster Management system/WOG & Multi-agency roles & responsibilities/stages of DRM Process & Issues relating to DRM within a community	

RESUME OF DALE

# FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

Introduction to Disaster Risk Management (QLS DES)	2005
	Developed knowledge of differences
	between risk management as applied in
	an organisation & to a
	community/benefits associated with
	using DRM system
Undertake Emergency Planning – Residential program	2005
/ course (Emergency Management Australia – Mt.	Gained knowledge & demonstrated
Macedon, Victoria)	ability to effectively research, conduct
Watedon, Victoria)	analysis, plan, develop, document,
	validate, monitor & review Emergency
	Plans in accordance with national
	industry competency standards.
· · · · ·	Collaboratively develop new/revised
	emergency plans by organisations such
	as: local government, emergency services
	or government agencies and
	departments; event organisers;
	managers or utilities, critical
	infrastructure or high occupancy
	buildings; and service providers.
Senior Sergeant Advancement Course	1st – 4th March 2005
	Strategic preparation course for Senior
	Sergeants applying to attend Assessment
· ·	Centre for promotion to Commissioned
	rank
Regional Duty Officers Course	2004
	Development of skill and knowledge to
	perform role of regional duty
	Commissioned Officer – to provide
	advice, direction and leadership to
	members performing operational duties
Peer Support Officers Course	2003
	Obtained knowledge to assist with
	members with goal to:
	Provide an empathic ear
	- provide a peer perspective and
	approach, having an
	understanding of local dynamics
	that may influence any personal
	and work-related difficulties,
	Provide low level psychological
	intervention - PSOs may provide
	practical support and assistance
	following critical incidents
	(Psychological First Aid),
	Identify colleagues who may be
	at risk to themselves or other -
	they are available to discuss
	issues, offer support, and

7
RESUME OF DALE FRIEBERG - 0	CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION
	<ul> <li>provide information about additional resources</li> <li>Facilitate pathways to professional help - may liaise with management or facilitate a referral to a QPS Senior Psychologist / Social Worker, Police Chaplain, or other service/agency to provide more specific assistance if you request them to.</li> </ul>
Disciplinary Investigations Course	2003 Develop skills to assist with the implementation of the Service's discipline system through obtaining knowledge to ensure the discipline system operates efficiently and effectively
Mental Health Train the Trainer (Qualified)	2001 Provided training to members to enhance their response options when faced with acute crisis situations that include aggressive & disturbed behaviours including mental health
Operational Supervisors Course	2001
Panel Members Course	2001 Develop HR skill, capability and knowledge in order to perform duties as a member of a selection panel.
Certificate IV Workplace Training	1999/2000
26 <sup>th</sup> Trainee Police Prosecutors Course	1992/1993 26 week course – provided required skills and knowledge to perform competently as a police prosecutor in a Queensland court of summary jurisdiction in accordance with jurisdictional laws and procedure, and QPS policy.
Field Training Officers Course	1992 Obtain qualification to perform role of a Field Training Officer to train, supervise and mentor First Years Constables in the workplace.
23 <sup>rd</sup> Juvenile Aid Bureau Course (84% average)	1991 Intensive residential course qualifying me to perform duties as a Juvenile Aid Bureau Officer to conduct criminal and other investigations and maintain proactive activities in the area of juvenile justice.

RESUME OF DALE	EF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION
<ul> <li>Management Development Program</li> <li>Levels 2 &amp; 3) <ul> <li>Legal Studies in Policing 2</li> <li>Management in Policing 2 – Leadership &amp; Management</li> <li>Management in Policing 3 – Leadership &amp; Management</li> <li>Legal Studies in Policing 3 – Research Assignment – Strategic Capability and Supervision</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	2001 - 2004 • RPL • Credit • Distinction • Distinction Obtain management knowledge, understanding and skills necessary to progress to Commissioned Rank within the Queensland Police Service through modelling excellence in management practice and develop through the exploration and critical analysis of historical and contemporary management and legal issues.
Operational Skills Training	On going in accordance with QPS policy

### Additional Duties beyond substantive position

President, Commissioned Officers Union - 4 July 2017 to present -

- Lead QPCOUE through EB Negotiations (EB9) currently occurring
- Provide personal welfare support to membership legal matters
- Lead team of 9 Executive members
- Advocate for membership on operational, corporate and contentious issues
- Media responses on behalf of Union
- Monthly liaison meetings with Commissioner and Deputy Commissioners & COO Public Safety Business Agency
- Member and Union representative of the Our People Matter Steering Committee
- Member and Union representative on the Inclusion & Diversity Working Group and Steering Committee
- Member of the Intergovernmental Discipline Reform Steering Committee chaired by Mr MacSporran, Crime and Corruption Commission
- Member of the Queensland Police Service Police Memorial Steering Committee
- Attend and present at Recruit/Constable Graduation Ceremonies/retirement functions
- Present at various forums throughout the state including but not exhaustive of Union AGM

**Mentor** 2018 & 2019 – QBalance - 6-month Leadership program for women across the Public Safety Portfolio. Mentoring women in Public Safety Agencies (QPS/QAS/QFES/Corrective Services) (current program in phase 2 of 3 phases)

Associate member of the Executive Leadership Team (by invite of Commissioner – period of 6 months from September 2018 to February 2019)

Executive Member, Commissioned Officers Union (2 years 2016/2017)

Commissioned Officers Union Representative -

Sick Leave Bank Committee;

ES				

### FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

- Queensland Police Service Uniform Committee;
- The Government Election Commitment 400 Police Promotions Advisory Group/Committee
- Queensland Police Service Part-Time Policing Review Committee

**Chair Public Safety Portfolio 2017** International Women's Day Core Planning Group (Membership in numerous committees over past decade)

Panel Member - Recruit Panel and general Panel selection duties (non-commissioned officers)

**Mentor** to male and female members of the QPS (sworn and unsworn) – ongoing in both formal and informal capacities

#### Awards

Australian Police Medal (Queens Birthday Honours Recipient 2018)

**Superintendent Dale Frieberg** has demonstrated outstanding dedication and commitment during her career with the QPS. She has displayed exceptional leadership, innovation and adaptability throughout her career, and has worked tirelessly in committing herself to the implementation of positive organisational change, developing and mentoring junior officers and fostering future focused collaborative relationships. Her professionalism, strategic thinking and ability to rapidly understand her community have seen her excel in various roles including the QPS Ministerial Liaison Officer and Aide-de-Camp to the Governor of Queensland. Her innovative leadership and an unshakable commitment to the Queensland community has seen Superintendent Frieberg progress to the position of Operational Commander, Forensic Services Group, leading over 500 officers in the specialist forensic fields. Superintendent Frieberg's commitment to her fellow officers has seen her elected as the current President of the Queensland Police Commissioned Officers' Union of Employees. Acknowledged as a role model for many officers within the QPS, Superintendent Frieberg's professional and personal qualities reflect the high standards expected of officers within the QPS.

National Police Service Medal

National Medal and Clasps

Queensland Police Service Medal and Clasps

Queensland Police Credit Union **Everyday Hero Award** – Awarded for "Dedication" – resulting from raising the awareness of Leukaemia through participation in the Leukaemia Foundations World's Greatest Shave, raising in excess of \$20,000 for the foundation (2015)

Leukaemia Foundations World's Greatest Shave – Awarded 2015 – Queensland's Top 30 (fundraiser)

**Jim O'Sullivan Awards** – In recognition and acknowledgement of your exceptional achievements in enhancing the standing of women in the QPS

**Achievement Award** for contribution as a Working Party Member in the initiative "Essential Life Skills Conference" (awarded 8/3/2007)

-	the second se	-	22 E	NЛ	-	-	$\Lambda$	LE

### FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

**Certificate of Encouragement** for contribution to the preparation and conduct of an annual forum for senior women within the Queensland Police Service promoting professional development, enhancing well-being and increasing the access of women to opportunities (awarded 8/3/2006)

#### **Career Highlights and Experience**

Demonstrated career diversity / breadth of experience in a range of policing fields (both operational and corporate) gained over 30+ years through:

### 2018/2019

Acting Chief Superintendent/Project Manager, Inclusion & Diversity, Restorative Engagement and Cultural Reform Program (Juniper) – (relief periods December 2018/January 2019; 17 June 2019 – present) – A humancentric approach to resolving unacceptable behaviour under the 'Our People Matter' banner, Juniper is a restorative engagement focussed program designed to provide QPS employees, both past and present, with the confidence and confidentiality they need to share or report issues of workplace bullying, unlawful discrimination, sexual harassment and predatory behaviour which have occurred during their employment with the organisation. Leading a team of highly professional members engaged with the organisation across the state focusing on intervention and healing through the delivery of proactive educational presentations tailored to individual workplaces. Guide/provide advice regarding investigations into negative workplace behaviours/co-chair joint assessment case meetings with ESC making determinations with respect to complaints received/ownership and responsibility for driving the QPS Inclusion & Diversity Action Plan 2019 – 2020. Membership on I&D working group and both the I&D and OPM steering committees.

**Example:** As Acting Chief Superintendent of Juniper, I role model impartiality and inspire a culture that respects policy frameworks and governance ensuring I remove myself from possible conflicts of interest that may arise between my role and that of Union President by implementing governance strategies/policies that align with member, service and community expectation in all aspects of the Juniper program, in particular the joint assessment committee decisions with respect to complaints made by members to ensure confidence and credibility in the process (current and former with respect to sexual harassment, sexual discrimination and bullying in the workplace).

#### 24 September 2018 – present

Superintendent Recruit and Constable Training, People Capability Command (portfolio includes Recruit Training – Responsibility for Oxley and NQ Academies (including Cultural & Linguistically Diverse and Indigenous Recruit, Police Liaison training), Constable Services (Development Program & First Year Constable program), Operational Skills training.

**Example:** In driving accountability and outcomes I identified gaps in success of CALD recruits with high rate of failure in driver training skills leading to higher than normal percentage being placed in a 'Show Cause' situation and at jeopardy of losing their employment contract and status as Police Recruit with the QPS. A number of examples of newly sworn first year constables with the CALD background had also been highlighted in regions as a result of near accidents whilst on duty contributed to lack of attention and compliance with the road rules. Identified possible causal issue being the varied licensing standards and governance in attaining driver licenses between countries in contrary to standards of driving skill expected by Qld Department of Transport of Australian nationals as opposed to immigrants to the country (recruits not having basic driving skills). Due to the possible risk and liability to the QPS and other government agencies, I identified and initiated an interdepartmental working group to be chaired by the Inspector Operational Skills with key stakeholders including the OIC of Driver Training, Inspector Recruiting, Multicultural Society, Department of Transport, Immigration and other

### FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

government/non-government agencies to identify key issues with a view producing some tangible outcomes to lower risk and keep the community safe. Committee recently formed, and work is ongoing.

## 7 August 2017 – 23 September 2018

Superintendent/Commander Forensic Services Group/Chief Scientific Officer QPS, Operations Support Command – Member of and QPS representative on numerous ANZPAA (national) forensic steering committees, Disaster Victim Identification Commander for QLD Responsibility for the strategic management of FSG including Scientific Section, Fingerprint Section, Forensic Imaging and Electronic Recording Section, DNA Management Section, Quality Management Section, Coronial Support Unit and Scene's of Crime Units. The Forensic Services Group (FSG) provides a diverse range of field and laboratory based forensic services to assist police officers in criminal investigations. FSG comprises more than 500 highly trained officers, both sworn and non-sworn, working from 37 facilities across Queensland. Each facility holds accreditation to the international standard for laboratories (ISO/IEC 17025) with the National Association of Testing Authorities (NATA). *Examples:* 

- Identified risk to service delivery at FSG, I drove best practice procurement processes to enable appropriate management of contractual arrangements on behalf of the QPS and Queensland Health through the provision of services of the Forensic Register to ensure risk management strategies were addressed and there was provision for the delivery of a case management system for Forensic officers in support of their duties to capture evidentiary material to solve crime on an ongoing basis.
- I identified and implemented policy to ensure members attending developmental opportunities shared that knowledge and expertise gained through presentations to the leadership team and colleagues, strengthening future skills and capability, additionally providing the member empowerment and ownership within the portfolio. This initiative has created an ability to continue to build engagement through recognition and celebration and facilitation of opportunities to share stories of success of members.

#### Supporting Comment FSG Inspector regarding my leadership:

'Dale, You obviously have an integral role to play in the strategic future of the QPS. Not unexpected. While driving though the region this week I reflected on the positive change in support you have personally brought to our team since your arrival. For that I am truly thankful. On a person note, I thank you from my heart for giving our workers some much needed respect and credibility. And for showing courage in making tough decisions – fairly and equitably. We will miss you'.

#### June – August 2017

*Inspector, Weapons Licensing Branch* – Lead team at Weapons Licensing with overall responsibility of providing licensing and permit services direct to members of the public and regulates businesses involved in the use of firearms. Guided staff in the providing of support, training and advice to internal operational units of the Queensland Police Service and external clients on weapons control matters; and co-ordinating the Queensland Police Service Firearm Security Inspection and Audit Program which requires the inspection by operational police of the licence holder's safe storage facilities. Quickly grasped a working knowledge of relevant legislation, key issues often of a politically sensitive nature representating QPS at regular meetings with Police Minister/gun lobbyists and activists.

## 17 June 2013 – June 2017

*Inspector, Strategy and Performance Officer* – Strategy/Performance Officer newly formed command following 2013 QPS restructure. Chosen for professionalism and leadership qualities, established command office through my ability to focus strategically and harness relevant information, conduct

### FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

internal/external needs analysis to identify and articulate operational requirements and vision for command through effective communication. Built organisational capability and responsiveness of command office identifying gaps and managing resources, formulating teams to meet evolving environment. Demonstrated versatility and ability to embrace change. My natural leadership qualities led to my selection as project manager (QPS Implementation Program). Steered successful transition, Media/Public Affairs Group back to QPS following PSBA review in line with recommendations adopted by government. Proactively influenced terms of SLA for shared media content services across public safety portfolio, delivering successful outcomes within designated timeframes, accepted by QPS/government.

*Outcomes: \*Drive development/implementation of command purpose/mission/priorities \*Ensured alignment of priorities to QPS Strategic Plan/Government priorities \*Efficiency of Services* 

### 1 January 2010 – 16 June 2013

**Inspector/Investigator – Internal Investigations, Ethical Standards Command** – Investigator and team leader Internal Investigations ESC, consistently demonstrated my ability and tenacity to be flexible and lead others in a dynamic and complex workplace. Took responsibility for deploying resources astutely as politically sensitive and complex investigations arose. Consistently provided direction and leadership to investigators, while assessing risk of reputational damage to the organisation. Provided clear guidance and direction to investigators and consulted support services and union representatives. Consulted with and briefed QPS Senior Executive and media while ensuring compliance with legislation, OPMs and modern IR/HR processes. Considered and mitigated risks, outlined expectations, reviewed evidence and assumed accountability for the investigation. Actively ensured I maintained my obligations to the C&CC/Court proceedings/Coroner (accepting/adopting my recommendations) reviewing results in order to drive continuous cultural integrity and change within the organisation in line with community expectations and government priorities.

Outcomes: \*Delivered services with fairness/integrity \*Protect/support the community preventing/detecting crime \*Upholding and administering law bringing offenders to justice; Built/maintained relationships \*Stop crime and make Qld safer

### February – December 2009

## Aide-de-Camp – Office of the Governor of Queensland

Represented QPS in the highest office in Queensland. Personally chosen by Governor of Queensland as first full-time QPS Aide-de-Camp after clearly articulating my experience and abilities in both a written application and subsequent interview with the Governor. My exceptional communication skills gave me the advantage and ability to negotiate and be influential in the decision-making process on behalf of the Governor's office with State/Local Government representatives, Organisational CEO's and not-for-profit sectors, ensuring successful outcomes for the Governor in her role as Head of State. **Outcome:** \* **Provide high quality advice, briefings/written correspondence, delivered within timeframes \*Influenced decisions at organisational and whole-of-government level \*Sustainable internal/external relationships established/maintained.** 

#### January – December 2008

#### Ministerial Liaison Officer - Minister/Commissioner's Office (12 months)

Demonstrated high level of judgement. Identify key issues – potential to impact on the QPS and Government – considering broader organisational and ethical values. Consider sensitivities and implications of issues, options, contingencies and recommend courses of action consistent with Service position. Brief Commissioner, Senior Executive and Minister's office.

Receive daily requests – QPS perspective to inquiries from Department of Premier and Cabinet, Ministerial portfolio's, opposition and media, with tight timeframes. Analyse requests, identifying key issues (consider broader issues – government / service priorities, policy/procedures, transparency, confidentiality issues and if compromises current QPS/C&CC operations/imposed embargo's).

Identified and approached appropriate areas – QPS, alerting relevant region/command/QPS Media to request relevant information / on receipt of same, discuss/evaluate information with relevant staff – Commissioner / Deputy Commissioner's office. Prior to responding, analyse response ensuring information is appropriate, rational, logical, addresses the request and formatted for easy interpretation/dissemination by Ministerial staff, providing interpretation as required.

Receipt of sensitive inquiries from community, MP's and media – often relating to major news events (e.g. murders / child sex offences and subsequent release of offenders into the community). Consistently addressed inquiries, provided firm advice to Ministerial staff while considering sensitivities/confidentiality of matters consistent with Service position and legislation. Ensured recording/reporting of information following numerous calls from volatile members to the public making threats. Provide immediate/concise advice to Commissioner/Deputies office and Media and Public Affairs Group.

Outcomes: Demonstrated understanding of broader socio-political context in which the QPS operates; Accurate/timely advice to Senior Executive/ministerial staff allowing operational and organisational strategies at QPS and Government levels; Demonstrated ability to evaluate relevant facts, make informed decisions and exercise appropriate judgement whilst considering operational/organisational issues from a service perspective; Ability to recommend realistic/workable solutions within the framework of QPS requirements & WoG policy structure \*

### 2005 - 2008

#### Manager - Drug and Alcohol Coordination Unit -Operations Support Command

Planned and prepared the Drug and Alcohol Coordination Unit's (DAC) Operational Performance Review (OPR) response in consultation with staff and the OPR unit. Conducted analysis of key OPR priorities. Identified OPR priorities relevant to DAC (Client Service / Unique and Emerging Issues / HRM / Financial Management) in line with the unit's future directions statement, operational plan, Command priorities and the QPS Strategic Plan. Developed performance indicators for the unit / provided strategic overview of unit's response to the Senior Executive. Developed processes to assist in preparation of the unit's response / conducted research using qualitative and quantitative measures to address the priorities.

Managed / monitored three separate annual budgets. Coordinated funds between daily operations of the unit and management / allocation of funding to state and national projects / initiatives. Overviewed, provided input and assistance with state-wide, recruit and VSM training, reviewed feedback assessing unit's performance. Monitored compliance audits – Drug Diversion program (significant increases in compliance). Provided support, coordinated and directed activities of staff, in accordance with HRMM / WPH&S legislation maintaining productivity and ensuring the continual development of drug and alcohol policy and programs.

Prepared comprehensive Briefing Notes, Possible Parliamentary Questions, Cabinet Submissions and correspondence under the hand of the Assistant Commissioner (AC), Commissioner and Minister on Local, State and National Drug and Alcohol related issues. Liaised extensively with and provided advice to the AC, representatives of Federal and State Government and non-Government agencies and QPS Ethical Standards Review and Evaluation team, on numerous nationally and State focused projects (e.g. 'Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Illicit Drug Use Study' and the National Drug Strategy 2004 – 2009).

Outcomes: \*Reviewed current policies/conducted research, developed/prepared operational plan consistent with command priorities statement \*Unit achievements highlighted/recognised by Senior Executive at OPR \*Prepared responses, attended and advised AC on conference agenda items (National Intergovernmental Committee on Drugs) \*Progressed recommendations in line with

### FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

# National Strategic frameworks and approaches to social issues (Drink Spiking/Inhalant use/Monitoring of alcohol/tobacco advertising)

**Regional Duty Officer - Metropolitan North Region -** As Regional Duty Officer, I maintained an effectively and efficiently functioning workplace - I was selected by and represented Senior Executive at Regional level. I managed and overviewed service delivery and allocation of regional resources to meet Service policies and procedures in line with the QPS and Regional Strategic and Operational plans. I liaised with duty officers within the districts and at police communications and monitored calls for service over four districts ensuring timely responses to allocated jobs in line with community expectations. Overviewed and provided advice on client service issues. Personally attended scenes – supported staff – involved them for their ideas, influenced their decision making processes, listened to them, ensured staff were aware I briefed Senior Executive of good work. Followed up with staff who were injured through liaison and use of QPS welfare network and Senior Executive.

### Senior Sergeant – Officer in Charge - Fortitude Valley Police Station

Effectively managed one of the largest divisions within Qld. Identified resource strengths/policing needs within division; prioritised workloads meeting operational commitments, maximising capacity. Encouraged staff to make operational decisions; provided support/advice throughout process ensuring consistency maintained with district/service priorities. Ensured consistency/transparency in my own leadership. Managed performance encouraging & promoting a fresh approach to policing within the division. Identified/resolved workplace conflict & minor disciplinary issues expediently to maintain a collaborative & productive work environment. **Example:** *Excessive Complaints against police – Identified excessive assault related complaints (75-80%) against police (prior to CMC profiling). Conducted analysis of complaints, conferred with District Inspector/PPM. Identified officers working from same team (60 – 65% complaints) & primary location for allegations (Police Beat). Conducted performance monitoring, planned/implemented strategies addressing risk. Conducted TNA, identifying developmental deficiencies in team leader & some members.* 

Outcome: \*Conducted review - performance related data (QPS systems/PPAs) resulting in redeployment (HRMM), training & subsequent up-skilling of members dealing with confrontational situations \*Implemented new SOPs (Police Beat), reviewed performances, provided strategy plan to ESC Assault related complaints reduced in excess of 50%.

Identified & managed work performance issues with staff. Implemented guidance/ performance monitoring. Identified suitable mentor to overview & offer guidance. Conducted regular meetings with members & supervisors. Identified internal/external factors impacting on performance. Consulted HRM, DETO, HSO, Chaplain, external agencies, maintained file notes & provided confidential briefings to Inspector & District Officer.

Outcome: \*HR issues resolved to satisfaction of members & Service.

Committed to implementing & driving change & continuous improvement. **Mental Health Coordinator RBWH** – Implemented & established district coordinator & divisional liaison roles. Participated in development/implementation of regional protocols approved by A/Commissioner. Shaped MH liaison meetings with key internal/external stakeholders. Worked collaboratively, participated in, overviewed & co-chaired monthly interagency meetings.

Outcome: \*Consulted with stakeholders ensuring effective partnerships maintained \*Developed & overviewed local SOPs, protocols & local policies - successfully implemented, resulting in sharing of information \*Negotiated/Implemented intervention & case management plans with local MHU.

Conducted review of operational & administrative compliance & risk management processes. Identified high level of non-compliance within station. Identified need for meaningful & developmental opportunities for staff & easing process of risk management compliance for OIC.

RESUN		

## FRIEBERG - CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

Researched & assessed suitable models. Introduced simplified reporting processes overviewing & reporting exceptions.

Outcome: \*Identified & considered strengths, weaknesses, developmental goals of staff when assigning portfolios \*Developed streamlined risk management model (QPS standards). Implemented model, assigned portfolios, provided training. Successfully implemented - 100% compliance

District Officer - Comment: 'You have worked...to promote a new and fresh approach to policing in your division. This energy and commitment has emanated through to the staff working under you and is evident in the change in the activities in the Valley precinct'.

Popular entertainment hub & one of most diverse culturally/ethnically mixed divisions catering to substantial transient/residential population. Researched environmental factors, identified crime trends/hot spots reviewing daily, intelligence, operational logs, calls for service & consult staff. Participated in/contributed to weekly planning meetings with management, CIB/CPIU/TB/PLO's/TCS, neighbouring districts & specialist support units. Overviewed planning/operational orders/action plans. Prioritised/directed policing resources addressing emerging crime trends, patterns & concerns to community. Conducted staff meetings, attended daily team briefings, provided advice/feedback/direction. Took complete operational/administrative responsibility for performance of staff enabling them to focus on core policing functions contributing to reduction in offences of OPR crime classes across district.

Outcome: \*Effectively managed functions & resources of large area of responsibility in operational environment consistent with service quality expectations & strategic operational policing objectives \*Maintained & enhanced positive work environment with improved productivity/station cohesiveness.

## Senior Sergeant – Project Management - Risk Management Review – Regional Prostitution Unit, Metropolitan North Region (MNRPU)

Managed Project - Reviewed professionalism of officers & risks associated with policing street prostitution. Developed project plan - set timelines & objectives. Researched/analysed external reports/reviews relating to policing of prostitution in Queensland. Consulted extensively with officers, managers & Senior Executive on current QPS policy/procedures, reviewing local SOPs. Consulted with/worked alongside external agencies (SQWISI) who provide services to workers in legal/illegal prostitution industry. Networked, established credibility & interviewed sex workers obtaining honest feedback regarding conduct & professionalism of police.

*Outcome:* \*10 recommendations made addressing selection processes/training/best practice strategies to ensure safe working environments & minimise risk to QPS & its members.

## \*Recommendations supported by Assistant Commissioner and forwarded for implementation. Comment: 'You demonstrated you could identify risks, issues & best practice for police...producing a final document of a high standard...'

**POPP Initiative** - MNRPU – Identified, developed, produced & delivered aide memoir for operational police to assist in their approach to enforcement activities in policing of illegal prostitution. Conducted review of procedures & subsequent move on directions used by MNRPU. Researched legislation requirements/relevant court decisions.

Outcome: \*Designed/developed A3 posters & notebook cards, outlining relevantlegislation & correct (court accepted) move on direction wording \*Approved & endorsed by A/Commissioner. \*Provided briefing to QPS Senior Executive \*Material distributed & accepted service wide allowing consistent & professional investigation of prostitution offences.

RES	-		87 A VE 12	
	2 200			1000

### FRIEBERG – CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT APPLICATION

AC Comment: 'A difficult project done very well. The recommendations for improvement were well constructed and led to a much safer work place'.

*Strategic Planning/Initiative/Vision* - Lead syndicate/identified issue - operational police women attending calls for service involving the male Muslim community (barriers stemming from perceived cultural beliefs). Adopted proactive approach/identified importance of forging partnerships with community. Developed objectives/recommendations in line with OPR priorities addressing need to 'Build Positive Relationships Between the Muslim Community & QPS'. Presented initiative to Senior Executive. Identified key internal/external links/stakeholders to address recommendations currently being progressed in partnership with OOC, QPS Equity & Diversity & Muslim Community.

Outcome: - \*Federal Funding grant obtained/Research proposal submitted/Griffith University providing Academic Validation/Networks & steering committee established with membership from National & State Government agencies, Griffith University & Islamic Community

AC Comment: 'Dale, I am not sure that I articulated to you just how impressed I was with your syndicate. It was outstanding and right up with the sort of outcomes we wanted to achieve. Hit the strategic levels and had the appropriate linkages'.

### Senior Sergeant – Events Coordinator / Field Commander

Planned & prepared operational orders, commanding numerous major events attracting media attention, all requiring significant policing responses (RNA, B2B, Riverfire & May Day). Throughout planning process I consulted, liaised & negotiated with key stakeholders (internal/external).

Outcome: \*Ability to communicate effectively at high level demonstrated consistently during multiagency meetings \*Provided clear/concise & accurate briefings - CEOs, Board members, Union delegates, publicists, media representatives & Senior Executive \*Provided extensive/detailed briefings to large contingents of police & representatives from external agencies \*RNA - contributed to daily interagency briefings, provided sound operational advice on appropriate responses & methodologies to incidents & offered resolutions to issues.

AC Comment: 'Your planning and interactive personal skills are quality reflected by your successful policing of the RNA in which you played the most significant role'.

## EXHIBIT 3

× ...

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent:	McLaren.ScottA[OSC] Wednesday, 26 July 2017 12:33
To:	

Cc:

Linford.TracyJ[SPECOPS]; Gollschewski.StephanW[SPECOPS]; Frieberg.DaleJ[CCC] Change within the Leadership Team - Forensic Services Group

Subject:

Good afternoon, I wanted to take the opportunity to advise you of changes within the leadership team of Forensic Services Group. Assistant Commissioner Condon upon taking up the stewardship of Operations Support Command, gave a commitment to ensure that the command continued to develop and further enhance the capabilities of its specialist groups. In the last 18 months a number of commissioned officer have been rotated through the various portfolios in an effort to continually improve the performance our of command, in providing state-wide specialist support to front line services. In what is a very challenging and ever changing environment.

Assistant Commissioner Condon and I meet with the Commissioned Officers yesterday, discussing the AC's vision moving forward and the opportunities this provided for revitalisation within our group. I am very pleased to advise you of the following rotations within FSG, that will take effect from Monday 2<sup>nd</sup> October:

- 0 Inspector David Keatinge - Quality Management Section;
- Inspector David Neville DNA Management Section; 0
- 0 Inspector Adrian Freeman - North Brisbane;
- Inspector Phillip Stevens Photographic and Electronic Recording Section. 0

It is important to note the outstanding commitment and dedication that these Commissioned Officers have contributed to our successes and I have no doubt that they will continue to innovate and provide strong leadership across the state, ensuring the delivery of high quality forensic services.

Regards,

Scott McLaren Acting Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service



QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE



FORENSIC SERVICES GROUP

## **Handover Briefing Document**

Forensic Area DNA Management Section
--------------------------------------

Overview of the area, including responsibilities and portfolios:

The DNA Management Section operates within Forensic Services Group under Operations Support Command and is responsible for the efficient and effective coordination and management of DNA services for the Queensland Police Service and other agencies.

Its individual unit's primary role is the management and quality assurance of DNA person and crime scene information and links obtained from searching on the National Criminal Investigation DNA Database (NCIDD) and with the management retention and destruction of DNA profiles. This profile management is conducted within a strict legislative framework.

DMS also liaises closely with other national and international jurisdictions as well as Queensland Health and Forensic Scientific Services (QHFSS) who are at present our sole service provider providing DNA analytical services for the Queensland Police Service.

Work Units:

The DNA Management Section is divided into 3 work units and a number of work teams:

- DNA Sample Management Unit
- o Person Sampling Team
- o Liaison Team
- DNA Results Management Unit
- o Results Management Team
- o Interstate Liaison Team
- DNA Quality & Administration Office



- o Quality Assurance Manager
- o Profile Management Team

## Sample Management Unit

The Sample Management Unit is often the first point of contact for most police and acts as a liaison between the QPS and QH. The main role of the unit is the receipt and QA of all DNA person samples to be submitted to QH for analysis and uploading to NCIDD. This QA is largely to ensure that each sample has been taken as per legislation. This unit also manages the court requests for DNA evidence between the QPS and QH.

The Liaison Team provides a liaison between the investigators and the Queensland Health case scientists in relation to crime scene exhibits. This team overviews the submission and prioritisation of crime scene exhibits from around the state and acts as the point of inquiry for both police and QH staff in relation to turn around times and court requirements.

## **Results Management Unit**

The Results Management Unit (Result Management Team) is responsible for the receipt, collation and quality assurance of DNA match results. The unit ensures the legality of the QPS records and accuracy of the information transferred by QH before facilitating the timely dissemination of those results into QPRIME and investigators.

## Profile Management Team

The Profile Management Team manages the profile retention, interstate DNA links, requests and inquiries between Queensland and other jurisdictional DNA databases through NCIDD and direct requests. The Interstate Liaison Team is a role that is performed by staff from the Results Management Team and Profile Management Team also manages the DNA links and inquiries between Queensland and other jurisdictional DNA databases through NCIDD and direct requests.

- Liaising with Service personnel and interstate jurisdictions in relation to the dissemination of DNA results.
- Monitor, administer, review and develop quality assurance procedures and associated policies related to the sharing of DNA results with other jurisdictions.
- Manage DNA and forensic information received from other jurisdictions and provide appropriate responses or add information to the Forensics Register for release on QPRIME.

The Unit (Profile Management Team) is also responsible for the processes surrounding the retention or destruction of DNA profiles in line with QPS legislative requirements.

Q

## **Quality Assurance:**

PMU work in a role that consists of supplying ongoing advice in relation to all matters relating to the recording on Qprime of the taking and processing of DNA samples. The knowledge required in PMU is to be able to identify how errors have occurred and an in-depth knowledge of the Ident/Fingerprint page on Qprime. Advice is given to all areas of policing including IU Investigations and external stake holders including individuals and legal practices representing clients. Training is constant with staff and not only individuals are trained on the different levels of Quality Assurance, but also group training when new matters are identified or advice supplied from the Police Solicitor

## **Quality & Administration Office**

This Unit's (the DNA Quality Manager) role includes the review, develop and implement policies and procedures to ensure the Service meets legislative and interjurisdictional requirements for the collection, analysis, retention and dissemination of DNA information, as well as cold and current case conferencing.

# Human Resources

Ċ





# International/National/Local Representations

Name	Frequency	Location	QPS Rep	Purpose & Overview

# Projects and/or Research

and the second

Project/Research Title	Date approved	Brief Overview

Т¥



# International/National/Local Training (Provided/Attending)

## (FORENSIC SPECIFIC)

Course Name	Attendee/Provider	Course Overview	Duration and freq
L			

# Contact List

QPS Position	Name	Contact Details
Commissioned Officer		and a second
Senior Sergeant – Quality Management	Ruben Collopen	
Senior Sergeant – Results Management	Ewen Taylor	

# Business Partners Contacts (QHFSS/NATA/ACIC/etc)

Name	Position	Contact Details
QLD Health.		

-35



QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE



FORENSIC SERVICES GROUP

## **Handover Briefing Document**

Forensic Area Quality Management Section	Forensic Area		Quality Management Section
--	---------------	--	----------------------------

Provide overview description of the area including responsibilities etc:

The Quality Management Section is responsible for:

-Development, validation and control of all FSG technical methods in compliance with NATA requirements and ISO standards.

-Development and control of the all policies and procedures that ensure the quality of service delivery and reliability of results including establishing and monitoring use of quality controls.

-Managing proficiency testing of individuals and work units as per NATA requirements.

-Establishing and monitoring standards for facilities and equipment.

-Monitoring compliance with the policies and test methods and ensuring appropriate corrective action is taken with non-conforming work occurs. This involves managing an internal audit program.

-Training for all Scenes of Crime. This includes initial training and all ongoing professional development.

-Researching emerging technologies and methodologies and implementing them within FSG.

-All liaison with NATA to ensure accreditation is maintained.



## Human Resources



Handover Briefing Document Forensic Services Group, Operations Support Command







International/National/Local Representation	1
	44

Name	Frequency	Location	QPS Rep	Purpose & Overview
NATA Board of Directors	Quarterly	Sydney	David Neville (Elected by NATA membership)	Governance of NATA
NATA Forensic Science Accreditation Advisory Committee	Biannual	Melbourne	David Neville (Elected by Australian forensic laboratories)	Establishing accreditation requirements within Australia (Requirements that are supplementary to ISO and AS standards)
Standards Australia Forensic Science Committee CH041	Biannual	Melbourne	David Neville (Represents QPS as a stakeholder agency)	Establishes content of Australian standards for delivery of forensic science services.
ISO Forensic Science Committee TC272	Biannual	International	David Neville (Elected by CH041 to represent Australia)	Establishes content of international standards for delivery of forensic science services.



# Projects and/or Research

in the second se



jõ.

# **Operational/Service Delivery**





# **Training Delivered**

## (FORENSIC SPECIFIC)

Course Name	Attendee/Provider	Course Overview	Duration and freq
Scenes of Crime Development Program	Focused at new SOC Officers. Delivered by QMS. Academy is the RTO	This is the initial training course for SOC Officers.	1 year program with 17 weeks of face to face training. Runs twice a year.
Crime Scene Investigation Skills Enhancement Program (CSISEP)	Aimed at senior SOC Officers. Delivered by QMS. Accredited by CIT.	This course is designed to enhance the skills of SOC Officers to equip them to deal with complex and major crime events	This is a 12 month program with 9 weeks of face to face training. Runs twice a year
Advanced Scenes of Crime Training	Aimed at all SOC Officers.	This course is a refresher course designed to cover professional development requirements of NATA	One week of face to face training. This program ran on a biennial basis. It has been discontinued due to budget reallocation.
Crime Scene Management Course	Aimed at all senior FSG members. Coordinated by QMS.	This course enhances skills at managing complex scenes that require a multidisciplinary	As required.

-85

		response	
Forensic Services Training Officer Course	For SOC Training officers. Delivered by QMS.	This training is designed to equip senior SOC officers with the skills to assess trainees as part of the RTO requirements.	On needs basis

## **Contact List**

()

Name of

QPS Position	Name	Contact Details
Commissioned Officer	David Neville	
Training Unit S/Sgt	1	
Projects Officer S/Sgt	S	
Monitoring Unit S/Sgt	E	

## **Business Partners Contacts (QHFSS/NATA/ACIC/etc)**

Name	Position	Contact Details

1 39

,

## HANDOVER - 05/10/2021 - Supt Dale Frieberg

Median

-

**,**ø:

OFFICIAL

WIT.0035.0001.0066

۵.



WIT.0035.0001.0067

e P



κ,

ς,

## 11. Meetings

- . ESG management once a month next one in Oct.
- FSLG Forensic Services Liaison reference DNA samples from victims of sexual assault, QPS want QHealth to take them
- FSS

WIT.0035.0001.0071

ľ

SENSITIVE

EXHIBIT 5

## Handover to Bruce McNab

QH / QHFSS

- SAIKS -- Working Group Recent meeting (recorded) -- Dr Griffin / Joint EBN to AC x 2
- DNA / DNA Peer review (Cathie) Coroner Central Region

SENSITIVE
SENSITIVE

# EXECUTIVE BRIEFING NOTE

# SUBJECT: NON-COMPLIANCE OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES – RESPONSE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED SEXUAL ASSAULT

# PURPOSE:

 To ensure the Queensland Government Interagency Guidelines for Responding to People who have Experienced Sexual Assault are adhered to by all responsible agencies to ensure an efficient victim centric approach is adopted in line with the "Prevent, Support, Believe – Queensland Framework to Address Sexual Violence", when obtaining reference DNA samples for analysis of sexual assault investigation kits.

# BACKGROUND:

- 2. In June 2014 a Government Interagency Working Group published the policy document Response to Sexual Assault Queensland Government Interagency Guidelines for Responding to People who have Experienced Sexual Assault (co-signed by CEO's of QPS, QH, DJAG and the Department of Communities, Child Safety and Disability Services copy attached). The purpose of the Guideline was to prevent unnecessary trauma being caused to the victims including during subsequent forensic medical examinations. It recommends that victim DNA reference samples, usually a mouth swab (on occasion a blood sample) should be taken routinely as part of the forensic medical examination.
- 3. Currently in Queensland, victims are subjected to two separate forensic procedures which is contrary to the guidelines. They are first subject to a forensic medical examination conducted by trained doctors and nurses, where samples are collected using a Sexual Assault Investigation Kit (SAIK). This is followed by a later procedure where a DNA reference sample is taken at the direction of a police officer. The second procedure is often completed several days or even a week following the first.
- 4. The collection of DNA by police can increase stress for the victims at a time they are most vulnerable due to fear of how the information may be used by authorities. Queensland is the only Australian jurisdiction where police are involved in the collection of reference samples. In all other jurisdictions the reference sample is taken as part of the forensic medical examination as recommended in the Guideline. This ensures that the victim is subject to only one invasive procedure, thereby minimising trauma.
- 5. Since the Guideline was published, the QPS has been liaising with Queensland Health to have the process altered so that it is consistent with the national best practice and aligns with the standing guidelines. All requests to implement change

SUBJECT: NON-COMPLIANCE OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES – RESPONSE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED SEXUAL ASSAULT

have been declined by Dr Adam Griffin who manages the forensic medical program within Queensland Health.

- 6. Enquiries have been conducted with all Australian jurisdictions which identified that Queensland and Western Australia are the only jurisdictions where the reference sample was taken by the victim, under the direction of a police officer. In all other states and territories, the reference sample is taken by the attending medical practitioner.
- 7. In January 2016, the then QPS South Brisbane Forensic Manager (FM), Acting Inspector Peter Bushell consulted with Dr Gary Hall, Acting Director of Queensland's Clinical Forensic Medicine Unit, Dr Cathie Allen, Managing Scientist Police Services Stream Queensland Forensic Health Scientific Services (QHFSS) and Ms Majcen, Sexual Assault Team Leader Royal Brisbane and Women's Hospital. All parties were in agreeance that it would be in the victims' best interest to have all invasive procedures conducted during the one process.
- 8. In November 2016, Senior Sergeant Bushell and Acting Sergeant Tresise of South Brisbane District Forensic Services (QPS) consulted the substantive Director of Queensland's Clinical Forensic Medicine Unit, Dr Adam Griffin and Dr Cathie Allen of Queensland Health and during this discussions doctors Griffin and Allen declined to change the process stating various concerns. These included it was not best practice, inability of rural doctors to take a reference sample and that it would create contamination issues.
- 9. In 2017, Acting Inspector Taylor, QPS DNA Management Unit consulted Dr Cathie Allen who again declined to adopt the Guidelines.
- 10. In 2018, Inspector Neville, QPS DNA Management Unit contacted Dr Griffin who declined to adopt the 2014 Guidelines where the reference sample of the victim should be taken as part of the forensic medical examination.
- 11. On 26 October 2020, a Forensic Services Liaison Group meeting attended by Acting Assistant Commissioner Connors, Operational Support Command; Superintendent McNab, Forensic Services Group, Executive Director Dr Doherty, QHFSS and Director of Public Prosecutions, Mr McCarthy, agreed that the taking of the victim reference sample was the treating clinicians' responsibility, in turn reducing trauma and improving analysis efficiency.
- 12. On 14 December 2020, correspondence was sent to the Executive Director, Forensic and Scientific Services, QHFSS advising of the agreement between agencies, that the taking of the reference sample was the clinician's responsibility to prevent further trauma to the victim.

SUBJECT: NON-COMPLIANCE OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES - RESPONSE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED SEXUAL ASSAULT

- 13. The attending parties of Forensic Services Liaison Group meeting held on 27 January 2021, agreed that the process of the taking of the victim reference sample was to transition to the responsibility of Queensland Health clinical staff with a proposed transition date of 1 July 2021.
- 14. This date has since passed without the endorsement of the Director of Queensland Health Forensic Medicine Unit, Dr Griffin.
- 15. On 27 October 2021, Detective Inspector David Briese and Ms Debbie Jones representing CIC and the QPS presented to the QH Forensic Nurses and Medical practitioners on the role of the Sexual Violence Liaison Officers and the Sexual Violence Prevention Strategy. Dr Adam Griffin was in attendance at this conference affording Inspector Briese to raise issues around The Guideline and taking of reference samples. At the time of this conversation, Dr Griffin provided several reasons as to his belief as to why this process did not occur in Queensland, including:
  - *i.* That he believes there may be an issue with cross contamination from saliva and semen in the victim's mouth that would prevent a buckle swab from being taken at the time of the SAIK;
  - ii. That even though another person's saliva only takes 8-10hrs to disappear from a DNA sense inside a victim's mouth, he does not want to have different processes for his staff of taking DNA depending on whether they may have mouth DNA contamination – he wants one process for uniformity;
  - iii. He stated that with the current process of police obtaining the sample a few days later, it means that there is zero chance of contamination by that stage and thus this is his preferred process;
  - iv. He is also concerned about the possible contamination of samples if placed into the same SAIK kit for analysis;
  - v. He does not believe that a re-attendance to the victim by police and obtaining of the buckle swab would increase or add to the trauma being experienced by a sexual assault victim.
- 16. On 17 November 2021, Acting Executive Director, Ms Lara Keller of QHFSS was consulted regarding the expiry of the proposed transitional date. Ms Keller agreed with the guidelines, that it would be in the best interest of the victim and for national consistency to have the sample taken by medical personnel as part of the forensic medical examination.

# **ISSUES:**

17. The current process exposes the victim is to an unnecessary secondary procedure involving police after they have undergone a forensic medical examination.

SUBJECT: NON-COMPLIANCE OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES – RESPONSE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED SEXUAL ASSAULT

- 18. This creates more psychological trauma for the victim, which is actively mitigated by all other jurisdictions by taking the reference sample during the forensic medical examination.
- 19. The testing of the SAIK is conducted by Queensland Health which involves DNA analysis. Such analysis cannot be undertaken until a DNA reference sample is available. The involvement of police in the sampling process as a third party also causes unnecessary delays in the testing. The timely testing of the SAIK becomes pertinent where offences are random, are connected to a series of offences and offender/s are not known to the victim.
- 20. There are no legal impediments to the victim reference sample being taken by trained medical personnel. There are no provisions within the *Police Powers Responsibilities Act 2001* that specify that police must take victim reference samples. Victim consent can be obtained from the medical officer performing the forensic medical examination.
- 21. Dr Griffin has raised numerous potential contamination risks in his repeated objection to complying with the Guideline. All of these risks can be removed through appropriate collection and packaging processes which have been adopted in other jurisdictions.
- 22. On 7 December 2021, the first meeting of the SAIK Working Group was held. Representation from both the QPS and QH (FSS) attended the meeting to discuss the Queensland Government Interagency Guidelines and non-compliance with a view to discuss a victim centric approach, the agenda items including the responsibility of collecting reference samples, SAIK and reference sample procedures, Packaging of SAIK reference samples and Management of the exhibit.
- 23. The working group chaired by Superintendent Frieberg, QPS Forensic Services Group (FSG) was attended by the Acting Executive Director of QH(FSS), Ms Lara Keller, QH Scientists and practitioners in addition to experts within the QPS FSG (Biometrics) and QPS members within the Crime and Intelligence Command (Child Abuse and Sexual Crime Group). Apologies at the first meeting included Dr Adam Griffin from QH. The agenda for this first meeting was distributed for items, however it was only QPS who contributed to the agenda, of which written minutes were taken (Copy attached).
- 24. On distribution of the minutes, there appeared to be some contention as to the accuracy on what was or was not agreed to. As a result, it was decided that any future working group meetings would be digitally recorded. Further, a decision was made to include the feedback from all parties in the minutes.
- 25. The SAIK Working Group met for the second occasion on Wednesday 15 December 2021 with the meeting electronically recorded (A copy of the transcript is attached).

# SUBJECT: NON-COMPLIANCE OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES – RESPONSE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED SEXUAL ASSAULT

Dr Griffin who was in attendance at this meeting was unreserved in his views to the point of conflict which caused for the Chair to conclude the meeting early and a verbal briefing being provided to the AC's of OSC and CIC. Dr Griffin at this meeting repeated a number of his concerns but also added:

- That the 2014 policy, which he stated he was a co-author on, included a typographical error in respect to the obtaining of the mouth swab at the same time as the sexual assault examination;
- *ii.* That he believed it would be difficult and labour intensive to train medical practitioners in the taking of the mouth swab;
- iii. That unless actual complaints had been made by victims of sexual assault in respect to the mouth swab being obtained days later by police, he did not see a reason as to why the existing process should change;
- iv. That he suspected this was a "cost shifting" exercise on behalf of the QPS.
- 26. ED Lara Keller following the meeting reached out to Superintendent Frieberg and Inspector Neville and as a result, the parties met on Friday 17 December 2021. Ms Keller indicated in this meeting that she is on board with the QPS and wished to work through issues raised with a view to work toward a suitable solution. It was agreed that a smaller working group would continue (practitioner involvement) and a meeting was set for January 2022.
- The Guideline is to be reviewed in the near future. Advice received indicates DPP prosecutor Mr Todd Fuller and Dr Adam Griffin will be involved in the future review of the Guideline.

# **RECOMMENDATION:**

- 28. It is recommended an Executive member of the QPS is involved in any working group/committee that is to review the 2014 Queensland Government Interagency Guidelines for Responding to People who have Experience Sexual Assault, given the current representation and subsequent recommendations of the Women's Safety and Justice Taskforce.
- 29. It is recommended that all responsible agencies have a victim centric approach to victims to ensure adherence to the Guidelines is adopted by all interagency representatives when obtaining reference DNA samples for analysis of sexual assault investigation kits.
- 30. It is recommended the content of this briefing note is read and noted.

Content of Briefing Note approved by insert name/rank/designation of relevant Assistant Commissioner/Director on insert date (Include this statement only if there is no original or scanned signature)

# SUBJECT: NON-COMPLIANCE OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES - RESPONSE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED SEXUAL ASSAULT

# DAVID FRENCH ACTING ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OPERATIONS SUPPORT COMMAND

Contact Officer: Dale Frieberg Rank/name: Superintendent

NOTED / SUPPORTED / APPROVED	NOTED / SUPPORTED / APPROVED
Comment:	Comment:
DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (CRIME, COUNTER-TERRORISM & SPECIALIST OPERATIONS) / /	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (REGIONAL QUEENSLAND) / /
NOTED / SUPPORTED / APPROVED	NOTED / SUPPORTED / APPROVED
Comment:	Comment:
1	
DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (SOUTHERN QUEENSLAND)	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (STRATEGY & CORPORATE SERVICES) / /
NOTED / SUPPORTED / APPROVED	
Comment:	



# EXECUTIVE BRIEFING NOTE

# SUBJECT: POTENTIAL ISSUES WITH TESTING OF DNA BY QUEENSLAND HEALTH FORENSIC AND SCIENTIFIC SERVICES

## PURPOSE:

1. To inform the Commissioner of potential issues reported in the media relating to the testing of DNA samples by Queensland Health Forensic and Scientific Services.

# **BACKGROUND:**

- 2. Queensland Health Forensic and Scientific Services (QHFSS) undertakes DNA testing on behalf of the Queensland Police Service (QPS). Since November 2021 QHFSS has received continuous criticism in *The Australian* newspaper about the DNA testing it performed as part of the investigation into the murder of . The scope of the criticism has now widened to the threshold value used by QHFSS to determine if testing of a sample should continue.
- 3. In February 2018 QHFSS made a recommendation to QPS that testing of samples containing less than 0.008ng/uL of DNA should discontinue because the chance of obtaining a profile would be less than 2%. QHFSS advised that QPS could request testing to continue if the sample was critical to a case. Except for 'Priority One' samples, the QPS agreed to discontinue testing at that point as a matter of routine based on the advice.
- 4. Prior to this threshold being established, it was routine for samples with low amounts of DNA to undergo a process of concentration to improve the likelihood of attaining a profile. It is understood that the removal of this process as a matter of routine resulted in a significant cost saving for QHFSS.
- 5. On 14 November 2018 Inspector David Neville raised concern with Ms Cathie Allen, Managing Scientist, QHFSS that the triage process may be problematic after 3 out of 4 below threshold samples from a murder investigation yielded a result after QPS requested testing to continue. At that time QHFSS provided reassurance that the success rate would be lower than 2% and that the matter should be treated as an aberration.
- 6. On 26 November 2021 police investigating the murder of raised concerns about 33 samples that were initially reported as having 'insufficient DNA for further testing'. When QHFSS was requested to continue with testing, 10 of them yielding a full profile.
- 7. Based on the results of the case, the DNA Management Section undertook a wider review of results achieved when the QPS requested testing to continue during the period of July to December 2021. This revealed 51 out of 160 samples provided a profile when the QPS requested testing to continue. This equates to a 30% success for samples that did not meet testing threshold.
- 8. As a result of the internal review, on 13 December 2021 Inspector Neville requested an explanation from Ms Allen as to why police were observing a 30% success rate for samples that were initially reported as 'insufficient DNA for further testing'. A request was also made for the threshold value to be reviewed to ensure it remained valid.

# SUBJECT: POTENTIAL ISSUES WITH TESTING OF DNA BY QUEENSLAND HEALTH FORENSIC AND SCIENTIFIC SERVICES

9. On 17 February 2022 *The Australian* published another article relating to the case claiming that thresholds used by QHFSS to triage testing are too high. It claims that the Queensland lab requires crime scene samples to have the equivalent of at least 22 cells to be fully tested, otherwise they are deemed to have insufficient DNA. It claims that the threshold is double the 11 cells required in NSW, and almost three times the eight cells that the product manufacturer has used to obtain good quality DNA profiles. It alleges there is potentially a very large number of cases where offenders aren't being identified when they should be.

## **ISSUES:**

- 10. Over the past 12-month period approximately 4500 samples were reported by QHFSS as having 'insufficient DNA for further testing'. This would include samples from both volume and major crime matters. The results of the internal review indicate a significant number of these (up to 30%) may have produced a profile if the samples were concentrated and testing continued.
- 11. QHFSS indicated that it has moved the portion of the budget previously used to fund the sample concentration process to another area of the business. As a result, it may seek additional funding from the QPS if the process is reimplemented as a matter of routine.
- 12. The truncation of testing of low concentration samples will also have saved significant processing and interpretation time within the laboratory. A lowering of the threshold for testing to continue will mostly likely increase testing turnaround times.
- 13. QHFSS is yet to address the concerns raised by Inspector Neville other than indicating they will respond in due course. These concerns were raised prior to this issue around thresholds being raised in the media.
- 14. A review of the sample triage processes undertaken at QHFSS is recommended to ensure the thresholds for further testing remain valid. A letter under the hand of Commissioner requesting such review is attached for consideration of signing.

## **RECOMMENDATION/S:**

- 15. That the content of the briefing note be noted.
- 16. That the Commissioner sign the attached letter requesting an interdepartmental review of the sample triage processes implemented for DNA testing.

D FRENCH A/ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OPERATIONS SUPPORT COMMAND Contact Officer: Inspector David Neville Inspector, Biometrics

# SUBJECT: POTENTIAL ISSUES WITH TESTING OF DNA BY QUEENSLAND HEALTH FORENSIC AND SCIENTIFIC SERVICES

NOTED / SUPPORTED / APPROVED	NOTED / SUPPORTED / APPROVED
Comment:	Comment:
DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (CRIME, COUNTER-TERRORISM & SPECIALIST OPERATIONS) / /	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (REGIONAL QUEENSLAND) / /
NOTED / SUPPORTED / APPROVED	NOTED / SUPPORTED / APPROVED
Comment:	Comment:
DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (SOUTHERN QUEENSLAND) / /	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (STRATEGY & CORPORATE SERVICES) / /
NOTED / SUPPORTED / APPROVED	
Comment:	
COMMISSIONER	



## WIT.0035.0001.0085

\_\_\_\_\_202/\_ 184 (year) DATE PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED 1300. OHFESS + OPS muling RIEO Larakilles aurent status DNA testing & TAT status of FRI Histing & expected unhance Justin - illicit drugs appendinities pour collaboration Howes. - other items Daul OHFSS appreciation for stats - THT. Mevilla -----DNAY Lully Harris ( project) MPS. Luke Ryan co-ordinating Vriseauls project ..... ( ancestary OH - realise there room for imprave alot of court regules for pouro aundiat Storiall 16 loot hely/anguot 7 eath up an request 1 all

### WIT.0035.0001.0086

2021. 185 (year) DATE PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED nouty ples ADMU Priorty eg- Mackay miantes . QH Dave to email stats acomm of each week. OH will continue to monitor to implique. Forenoic DNA yodarle - FR. info lith old + sew transfer of of lugo inoning of Zul . Chemistry darroj same. Not serving any mus a look under to 2022 y new sustem TR KODULO impacked Q H Juncherality 6

NS

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]
Tuesday, 30 January 2018 21:37
Taylor.EwenN[OSC]
Support Officer FSG
FW: Options Paper for consideration
Review of efficacy of Microcons_options for QPS.doc

Ewen,

.

.....

Can you please take a look and provide advice.

D

Dale Frieberg	
Superintendent	
Operations Commander	
Forensic Services Group	
Operations Support Command	
Queensland Police Service	
(E	
(W)	
	YEARS OF
	PHOTOGRAPHIC
	SERVICES
PHOTOGRAPHIC SECTION, FORENSIC	
PhotoGRAPHIC SECTION, TOACHSIC	
From: Cathie Allen [mailto	
Sent: Tuesday, 30 January 2018 4	:56 PM
To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <fr< td=""><td>&gt;; O'Malley.TroyS[OSC]</td></fr<>	>; O'Malley.TroyS[OSC]
<	>; Taylor.EwenN[OSC] < >
Cc: Paul Csoban <	>

Subject: Options Paper for consideration

Hi Dale

Please find attached an Options paper regarding concentration of major crime samples that we have prepared for your consideration. I'd like to discuss this on Friday with you.

Cheers Cathie



# **Cathie Allen** Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health



HSQ's vision [ Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

#### \*\*\*\*\*\*\*

This email, including any attachments sent with it, is confidential and for the sole use of the intended recipient(s). This confidentiality is not waived or lost, if you receive it and you are not the intended recipient(s), or if it is transmitted/received in error.

Any unauthorised use, alteration, disclosure, distribution or review of this email is strictly prohibited. The information contained in this email, including any attachment sent with it, may be subject to a statutory duty of confidentiality if it relates to health service matters.

If you are not the intended recipient(s), or if you have received this email in error, you are asked to immediately notify the sender by telephone collect on Australia +61 1800 198 175 or by return email. You should also delete this email, and any copies, from your computer system network and destroy any hard copies produced.

If not an intended recipient of this email, you must not copy, distribute or take any action(s) that relies on it; any form of disclosure, modification, distribution and/or publication of this email is also prohibited.

Although Queensland Health takes all reasonable steps to ensure this email does not contain malicious software, Queensland Health does not accept responsibility for the consequences if any person's computer inadvertently suffers any disruption to services, loss of information, harm or is infected with a virus, other malicious computer programme or code that may occur as a consequence of receiving this email.

Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

\*\*\*\*\*\*



WIT.0035.0001.0090

	anse .	
	ATE PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED	
	Diburioni Hi: noticino Provi	- T
[]	Ribeumion Ke: aptions Raper te: auto - Microcon' frounes for	
	Lilletion - ophon 2. Adland op usin imail to Carhie Paul confirm	
	ush mail to lathie Paul confirm	ine,
D		J

-

0018. 55 (year) DATE PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED H Businins continuity Ream Revolew. BARU. Hono mieting with MC he: FR. Mamonto. aubure. status papet inust: = qun. П. visit yamanto A/C PB MU. Concurranois - Dave neville. 1145 Line 1200 attended to imails & return phone 1215 calls. Conusation 1230 V Continued with maits Boss approvals. 1400. Meeting. U: DNA + QH. Cathie allen Paul Golan Ewan/ Ing Not Alephen, Peter, Suzam

2018 56 (year) ÷ DATE PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED Discunion Ke: aptresis Paper re: 'auto - michocan' prounes fo Priority 2 (major arme) comples. Allection - aphon 2. followed up email to Cathie Paul confihming Paul Program procense - uhere pollan. am changes do un go? FR helloct. 2 ather arres hexicology data nity OPS / hand cope straight forward alles DPRIME DPRIME 11 prontally) PRI Formoic medical imi 12-13) werk Deulepment project p - Iraining - 60 L Mucious (Iroy , Mere), Barinic User manual -Verste acros system Specific training for each all print requirements. hando en - 12' Acoping still regulter indian analyris M. . . . .

# Taylor.EwenN[OSC]

From:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]
Sent:	Friday, 2 February 2018 15:38
То:	Cathie Allen; O'Malley.TroyS[OSC]; Taylor.EwenN[OSC]
Cc:	Paul Csoban
Subject:	RE: Options Paper for consideration

Hi Cathie and Paul,

Thank you for your time this afternoon and for discussion around this options paper. Thank you also to both Troy and Ewen with your assistance and expertise/advice around the paper.

As discussed, I am in agreement that:

- There is clear data that it is not an efficient use of time and resources to continue with the 'auto-microcon' process for Priority 2 (*Major Crime*) samples.
- Option 2. "Cease the 'auto-microcon' process for Priority 2 casework...." Would appear to be a more productive & efficient choice.
- Scientists time and resources would be better spent working samples with a higher DNA yield and more potential.
- It would be beneficial to amend the Forensic Register to provide an automated Q-Prime update advising the Investigators of the option to request further 'Auto-microcon' processing for those samples for unsolved crime, which may prove worthwhile.
- DNA staff can request this additional processing if/when a request is received from the investigators.

I trust this is of assistance.

Kind regards,

Dale.



From: Cathie Allen [mailto:		
Sent: Tuesday, 30 January 2018	3 4:56 PM	
To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <f< td=""><td></td><td>&gt;; O'Malley.TroyS[OSC]</td></f<>		>; O'Malley.TroyS[OSC]
<0	>; Taylor.EwenN[OSC] <	
Cc: Paul Csoban <		
Subject: Options Paper for cons	sideration	×

Hi Dale

Please find attached an Options paper regarding concentration of major crime samples that we have prepared for your consideration. I'd like to discuss this on Friday with you.

Cheers Cathie



#### Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

Any unauthorised use, alteration, disclosure, distribution or review of this email is strictly prohibited. The information contained in this email, including any attachment sent with it, may be subject to a statutory duty of confidentiality if it relates to health service matters.

If you are not the intended recipient(s), or if you have received this email in error, you are asked to immediately notify the sender by telephone collect on Australia +61 1800 198 175 or by return email. You should also delete this email, and any copies, from your computer system network and destroy any hard copies produced.

If not an intended recipient of this email, you must not copy, distribute or take any action(s) that relies on it; any form of disclosure, modification, distribution and/or publication of this email is also prohibited.

Although Queensland Health takes all reasonable steps to ensure this email does not contain malicious software, Queensland Health does not accept responsibility for the consequences if any person's computer inadvertently suffers any disruption to services, loss of information, harm or is infected with a virus, other malicious computer programme or code that may occur as a consequence of receiving this email.

Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]
Sent:	Thursday, 25 November 2021 12:18
To:	French.DavidA[OSC]
Cc:	Support Officer FSG[OSC]; Strategy and Performance OSC
Subject:	FW: Forensic DNA lab in the news
Attachments:	Australian_25Nov2021_p_1_7.pdf

## OFFICIAL

AAC

Further to our discussion this morning.

The below has been shared with us from QH – their internal dot points.

D

Dale Frieberg APM Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service |

OFFICIAL

From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] Sent: Thursday, 25 November 2021 12:15 To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < Subject: FW: Forensic DNA lab in the news

Dale

The below is not from Lara, rather it from Justin. I think it explains the situation quite well. He sent this to his colleagues in the DNA world but it is relevant for our purposes. Justin is a very approachable and helpful always.



David Neville

Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

From: Foxover.StephanP[OSC] Sent: Thursday, 25 November 2021 12:12 To: Neville.DavidH[OSC] Subject: FW: Forensic DNA lab in the news From: Justin Howes < Sent: Thursday, 25 November 2021 10:50 To: Cc: Lara Keller < Subject: Forensic DNA lab in the news

**CAUTION:** This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi all

I am sure many of you would have read the attached article already. I am sending some info on to you in the expectation that some of your staff will have read the article already too, and may have questions.

We received some questions this week from the author of a Podcast ( y' through The Australian) that related to some work conducted in on the murder of . We didn't feel any obligation to answer as there was no RTI, subpoena etc and have been supported in this by QH Legal and our division.

We expected something more, and today this article arrived.

We are not concerned with the information presented and are working in collaboration with QPS on briefing points.

Dr Wright was employed in QLD and left around 2007. She was not here at the time of this matter, no was she here when we introduced 'No DNA Detected' workflow, nor was she here when we implemented PP21/STRmix in Dec 2012.

We are not concerned with the material presented in the media. We are concerned with the details in this matter, nor with any processes in the laboratory at the time. There is a podcast to sell afterall, and this type of media may go some way to help that. Unfortunately, that is at a cost to our lab and staff, but we will keep moving on and will get through this.

Please let me know if you want any more information to help with any questions that you may get from your own staff.

Regards Justin



**Justin Howes** A/Managing Scientist

Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services Prevention Division, Queensland Health



/ www.health.gld.gov.au/healthsupport/businesses/forensic-and-scientific-services

## \*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

Disclaimer: This email and any attachments may contain legally privileged or confidential information and may be protected by copyright. You must not use or disclose them other than for the purposes for which they were supplied. The privilege or confidentiality attached to this message and attachments is not waived by reason of mistaken delivery to you. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not use, disclose, retain, forward or reproduce this message or any attachments. If you receive this message in error, please notify the sender by return email or telephone and destroy and delete all copies. Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

Queensland Health carries out monitoring, scanning and blocking of emails and attachments sent from or to addresses within Queensland Health for the purposes of operating, protecting, maintaining and ensuring appropriate use of its computer network.

\*\*\*\*\*

Message protected by MailGuard: e-mail anti-virus, anti-spam and content filtering. https://www.mailguard.com.au/mg

Report this message as spam



rogram, ce from an issue

because nk is a 17 And me from

s achiev-leynolds n Page 4

Js

ve Care Felicity tralasian . "Given .19 pan-s contin-

EXCLUSIVE	STORY		cases from rapes to murders. Her findings are detailed in
DAVID MURBAY NATIONAL CRIME CORRESPONDENT			Story, the investigative podcast series examining the unsolved murder of as she walk- ed home from work in Mackay in
A police investigation into the sav- age murder of a young woman stabled to death has been serious- ly compromised by forensites failures in Queensland's govern-		17 01 9	February 2013 "This is serious. This is really serious. It's diabolical," Dr Wright told the series. The lab should im- mediately stop producing evi- dence, stop producing DNA brofiles. There needs to be a thor-
a DNA expert. After months examining hun-	Three episodes this week	Luminol tests showed potential samples of blood in the	ough and independent investi- ar gation of what's gone on."
dreds of pages of relevant docu- ments from the case, Kirsty	TISD:/OUTION	but the government laboratory said no DNA was detected	d Dr Wright is confident major changes to the lab's equipment
Wright is convinced critical prob- lems were distorting the lab's test-	Dr Wright, the former national head of Australia's criminal DNA	dented in her professional sion, or a public inquiry.	unis- and software introduced just weeks before murder
ing, thwarting its ability to generate DNA profiles from	database, said the errors and obvi- ous problems in the lab during the	experience. The forensic biologist sai Dr Wright urged an indepen- less the isb ceased testing im	nedi-ability to obtain DNA profiles.
crime scenes and potentially al- lowing a killer to escape.	2013 and 2014 forensics investi- gations after the slaying of	dent investigation to be overseen ately, there would be an on by a body such as Queensland's risk of more errors in cri	
			<ul> <li>Statistical data in the second se</li></ul>
Short-term no	wer hill snike	Force gets first female chi	COMMENTARY PIL BUSINESS PI3-21

bydrokowst 25 we better Two-thirds of the most serious admitted to ICU within four hours had dromoed to fust 26.7 mercent.

wantin "ehevaid

# Shut it down: laboratory murder probe's forensic failures 'diabolical'

accepted it

As a result, the iner that acquit-

car that was there but

ħ.

Dr. Wright co-wrote a peer-

reviewed scientific paper that set

ted Mr of mur-

wasn't blood

#### Continued from Page 1

include the lab's highly unusual failums to find any trace DNA of former boyfriend

the main police sampect in the murder, on the surfaces of his own dirty Toyota Hillux ute. The vehicle was almost 20 years old when 10.25 killed, and Mr travallast

many thousands of trilometres a year in it. His DNA should have carneted the utebut the lab said no Street outter where trace DNA was detected on police swahe and tane lifts from the steering wheel handbrake, gear shift, driver's seat and front-door handles and window wind - all sumptive test for blood - and it resurfaces that as the driver he regu-Indu touched

That's very, very strange to not get any of his DNA from the inside of a vehicle that hasn't been recently cleaned." Dr Wright said. "You would emert to see at least on a counte of those samples ... the DNA of the driver of that vehicle but there's a complete absence of that DNA."

Dr Wright has been working with The Australian's national chief correspondent Hedley Thomas to investigate unsolved murder.

The issues she has identified

could provide an explanation for sated to be tested for this case all of the absence of any forensic evidence linking Mr. to the murder - or alternatively, explain the lack of forensic evidence linkin Mr ing someone else to the crime. One of the biggest red flags for

Dr Wright was a sample called S14. collected by emerienced police scientific officer rom what he noted as being a "pool of blood". It was from the Boddington

stopped moving as blood seeped from her knife wounds. performed a

hiond

Combur test - an immediate preturned a result of being positive for When the lab tested the sample

for DNA, it came back with ansuspected. other blank: "No DNA detected." Dr Wright said: "That's an absolutely incredible concern, because if you've got nice, fresh

whole blood - presumably good quality and a lot of quantity - and you're not getting a DNA profile, there is no way you are going to get carefully wiped away. It is a strong indicator of blood

DNA from any trace amounts. "So that means there's something very, very wrong within that laboratory. And that means that all the samples that were attemppositives.

them that didn't return a profile, it puts a big question mark on them." It can also be revealed 12 areas tar tested meanintively positive to blood when sprayed a fine mist of Luminol over the vehicle.

He collected and labelled as blood examines from the steering wheat imition front naresnose's side footwell: handbrake well: clutche accelerator and brake nedals: a rear-door handle, window wind and door trim; and the rear of the driver's seat-back

Police were looking for I blood, believing it would have likely been transferred to the car if Mr was the killer and drove the vehicle immedi-DNA was detected in the 12 samstely after the murder, as they oles so

Mr emphatically denies involvement in the crime

When Luminol falls on a surder in less than two hours in 2017 face where there's blood, it causes was never told about the potential a chemical reaction and produces blood evidence. a distinctive blue colour, showing With the lab's results now up even when the blood has been under a cloud. Dr Wright says: "The question is, was there trace DNA potentially from in

but not conclusive arnof as chemicals in other substances can react wasn't detected." with Luminol 10 produce false

true-crime nodeast Binge it today on The Australian's mobile app. Go to shandse com au to find out more. Subscribers get episodes early, plus all our exclusive stories on this grioping cold case.

EPISODE7 OUT NOW

Australia's favourite

The government lab said no out the sensitivity of four different presumptive tests for detecting blood Luminol was easily the most likely to detect blood, and the least likely to return a false nositive with an overall misclassification rate of 7 ner cent

7 were three or four areas that notes that were Lumithere."

nol positive and it reacted very fast and very intense. So that's a good indication that it's a true positive result." Dr Wright said. sent a total of 51 samples from Hilury

ute to the government lab. The lab decided to test 33, of

which 27 came back as blanks. labelled "no DNA detected" Of the remaining six four were found to have minimizes of DNA meaning more than one person's DNA

The lab said these mixtures were "unsuitable for meaningful interpretation" so they were effectively useless for police The only DNA that came back of the car's owner and driver was from a water bottle and cigarette

butt in the car. The Oueensland Health Forensic and Scientific Services lab runs separately and indepen-

dently from the police service. Police collect forensic evidence complex from exima comos and do.

'n.

liver them to the lab, reiving on the expertise of forensic biologists who do the testing and their sonhisticated instruments and software

Dr Wright is very familiar with the lab as she previously worked In December 2012, just weeks

before murder, the lab implemented a new computer program for DNA profiling called STRmix, and a new DNA profiling kit called PowerPlex 21.

"With the introduction of the new DNA profiling kit and the new DNA mixture software, I DNA DOUBTS think that in some instances they may have actually even profiled NO TRACEDUA OF DRIVER the offender's DNA but they've IN SUC AND CASE missed it - they haven't been able kilometres a year in his Toyota

to interpret it properly because of the prohlems " che said Dr Wright says there needs to be an external inquiry and the lab's results, processes and eminment should be independently audited by reputable scientists.

What these issues and mistakes suggest to me is there's systemic errors occurring. "And systemic errors occur when a lab is thoroughly broken at

many levels," she said "A lab that is thoroughly broken at many levels cannot selfinvestigate and then correct that." Coroner David O'Connell Inet vearfound did bill

harn but did not find fresh and NO DNA FROM POTENTIAL compelling evidence required to RIGODINCAR charge him again under double Twelve or tas in presumptively positive to blood leopardy laws.

Oucensland Health declined to when a police scientific officer answer any of The Australian's 15 sprayed Luminol on the vehicle. detailed questions about the case. Somplet were collected and labelled as blood by the officer. centiast week.

2

The sourcement lob sold no DNA Anyone with information about was detected, leading the officer to the number of Shandee Blockhurn occept it wasn't blood, but the can contact Hedley Thomas at regults are now under a cloud.

DNA.

shandee(a)theoustrakion.com.au

Υ.

covered thousands of

bill overta and his fibl & should

have shown up all over the vehicle.

but the lab had not found his trace.

DNA in one sumplet taken from

NO DNA INSAMPLE FROM

a sample from a fresh "pool of

blood". It was from the gutter where stopped moving

A police scientific officer collected

at blood served from her wounds.

cur beend

1 A

\* .........

In a sample colled St4 from this

pool of blood, the lab found no

undoors of the our

POOLOFBLOOD

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Subject: Neville.DavidH[OSC] Thursday, 25 November 2021 14:30 Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC] RE: PPQ Forensic DNA lab in the news

# OFFICIAL

I ran this by QH (Lara) too for courtesy



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

From: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <	
Sent: Thursday, 25 November 2021 14:28	
To: Neville.DavidH[OSC] <	>; Supt FSG
Si	

Subject: Re: PPQ Forensic DNA lab in the news

OFFICIAL

Supported Jenna

Dale Frieberg APM Superintendent /Commander Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] < Sent: Thursday, November 25, 2021 2:14:56 PM To: Supt FSG < Subject: PPQ Forensic DNA lab in the news

Supt

Suggested dot points for PPQ

- Queensland Health Forensic and Scientific Services (QHFSS) undertakes DNA analysis of samples collected at scenes of crime by members of the Queensland Police Service (QPS).
- Numerous samples were collected and submitted for DNA testing however DNA evidence did not play a major role in this case.

- It is not unusual for samples taken surfaces to yield no DNA, particularly when there is no visible material present. When there is a visible stain, sometimes the properties of the substrate material can inhibit a meaningful DNA profile from being produced.
- QHFSS holds NATA accreditation which requires an independent assessment of technical competency every three years. It must meet rigorous international standards to maintain such accreditation.
- QHFSS has provided and continues to deliver high quality DNA testing services to the QPS.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]
Sent:	Thursday, 2 December 2021 12:08
То:	French.DavidA[OSC]
Cc:	Neville.DavidH[OSC];
Subject:	FW:
Attachments:	FW: ; DNA testing

OFFICIAL

Morning AAC

Please see below link - a lot of media on this topic and it is continuing as you would be aware.

Attached also are emails pertaining to DNA and the matter.

Cathie Allen who is the Managing Scientist, Police Services Stream, Forensic and Scientific Services (Prevention Division) of Queensland Health. Part of her area of responsibility revolves around DNA.

Dave has raised an issue with regard to another murder which has some similarity to the murder currently being featured regularly in the media. In the case of DNA samples provided to QH were deemed to be DNA insufficient. On further testing they yielded results.

In conversation this week that Dave has had with Cathie Allen, Cathie has in Dave's view attempted to shift risk/blame back to the QPS indicating it is incumbent on the QPS to prioritise testing and that we should be monitoring all results and request reworks when a sample yields an unusual result. The concern here for us is that police are not DNA experts and would not have knowledge of the likelihood of a particular sample yielding a profile based on a quantification threshold (relying on the expert advice of the scientist – who has provided advice previously there was insufficient DNA to get a result – contrary to the outcome when retested).

Ms Allen in her conversation also made an accusation that there must be someone from thew QPS leaking information to the media in the most recent press regarding their processes.

On a side note, Dave has raised also whether there needs to be a review of what the threshold value should be – Cathie advised there was no need as they had ample data to support their processes.

For information in event something comes QPS way.

D

Dale Frieberg APM
Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service |

OFFICIAL

1

From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] < Sent: Thursday, 2 December 2021 10:15

To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < Subject: Blackburn matter

## Dear Supt

This matter remains in the Australian news paper everyday. There have been repeated requests to the Premier to undertake a review of QHFSS. The were the most recent to interject themselves, today making a plea to the Premier to commit to a review. I have included a link to the series below. My concern is that if there is an issue here, QH is already manoeuvring to shift responsibility for the testing decisions to the QPS.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]		
From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Thursday, 2 December 2021 12:20 French.DavidA[OSC] FW:	
	OFFICIAL	
AAC		
FYI – This is additional to the inf	ormation I just sent regarding QHFSS (DNA).	
D		
<i>Dale Frieberg APM</i> Superintendent   Foren	sic Services Group   Queensland Police Service   u	
From: Miller.LarissaN[OSC] < Sent: Thursday, 2 December 203 To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < Subject: n	OFFICIAL 21 12:13 >	
Supt,		
Supt		
For your information		
The       coronial matter has received a lot of media attention: <a href="https://www.abc.net.au/news/2020-08-21/queensland-coronial-inquest">https://www.abc.net.au/news/2020-08-21/queensland-coronial-inquest</a> On       was stabbed to death in         In 2017 her former partner       was found not guilty of her murder.		
In 2017 her former partner	was tound not guilty of her mulder.	
21/8/2020 Central Coroner, Ma	gistrate O'Connell handed down his findings:	
<ul> <li>a. Who the deceased person</li> <li>b. How the person died – N incident involving violer</li> </ul>	liss died due to injuries sustained in an	

- instrument<sup>401</sup>, c. When the person died 9 February 2013<sup>402</sup>, d. Where the person died Mackay Base Hospital<sup>403</sup>, and e. what caused the person to die Multiple stab wounds<sup>404</sup>

# https://www.courts.gld.gov.au/ data/assets/pdf file/0007/656044/cif- 1-sr-20200821.pdf

15/10/2021 –Investigative Journalist Hedley Thomas launched a podcast- Story. In this he produced the opinion of Dr Wright who believed advised the Queensland government's forensic lab has been making significant errors over a long period of time in the analysis of DNA samples.

 25/11/2021 – Family of
 called for an independent review regarding the processing of evidence

 in Ms
 matter.

It is my understanding Mackay CIB was investigating the matter and Lisa Elkins (now DS at Dutton Park CIB) was the investigator.



Larissa Miller Detective Inspector | Assistant to the State Coroner Coronial Support Unit Forensic Services Group

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Subject: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Thursday, 2 December 2021 12:27 French.DavidA[OSC] RE: matter

OFFICIAL

Yes interesting

 Dale Frieberg APM

 Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service |

 6

# OFFICIAL

From: French.DavidA[OSC] < Sent: Thursday, 2 December 2021 12:22 To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Subject: RE: matter

Thanks Dale,

I see the announcement (the Australian) that the inquest is being re-opened.



David French | Acting Assistant Commissioner Operations Support Command Queensland Police Service

Co Address: Police HQ - Roma St., Brisbane I Email





ISM





From: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < Sent: Thursday, 2 December 2021 12:08 To: French.DavidA[OSC] < Cc: Neville.DavidH[OSC] <

Strategy and Performance OSC

Subject: FW: matter

OFFICIAL

Morning AAC

<

Please see below link - a lot of media on this topic and it is continuing as you would be aware.

Attached also are emails pertaining to DNA and the matter.

Cathie Allen who is the Managing Scientist, Police Services Stream, Forensic and Scientific Services (Prevention Division) of Queensland Health. Part of her area of responsibility revolves around DNA.

Dave has raised an issue with regard to another murder which has some similarity to the murder currently being featured regularly in the media. In the case of DNA samples provided to QH were deemed to be DNA insufficient. On further testing they yielded results.

In conversation this week that Dave has had with Cathie Allen, Cathie has in Dave's view attempted to shift risk/blame back to the QPS indicating it is incumbent on the QPS to prioritise testing and that we should be monitoring all results and request reworks when a sample yields an unusual result. The concern here for us is that police are not DNA experts and would not have knowledge of the likelihood of a particular sample yielding a profile based on a quantification threshold (relying on the expert advice of the scientist – who has provided advice previously there was insufficient DNA to get a result – contrary to the outcome when retested).

Ms Allen in her conversation also made an accusation that there must be someone from thew QPS leaking information to the media in the most recent press regarding their processes.

On a side note, Dave has raised also whether there needs to be a review of what the threshold value should be – Cathie advised there was no need as they had ample data to support their processes.

For information in event something comes QPS way.

D

Dale Frieberg APM			
Superintendent	Forensic Services Group	Queensland Police Service	

OFFICIAL

From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] < Sent: Thursday, 2 December 2021 10:15 To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < Subject: Blackburn matter

Dear Supt

This matter remains in the Australian news paper everyday. There have been repeated requests to the Premier to undertake a review of QHFSS. The were the most recent to interject themselves, today making a plea

to the Premier to commit to a review. I have included a link to the series below. My concern is that if there is an issue here, QH is already manoeuvring to shift responsibility for the testing decisions to the QPS.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command




David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

To: Cathie Allen Cc: Harris.Libby/	y, 1 December 2021 15:03 <; Justin Howes <
Hi Justin and Ca Is this somethin	thie g that can be provided to Tania please.
ER.	David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command
To: DNA Liaison Cc: Neville.David Savage.JackT[CF	ay, 1 December 2021 13:35 and Major Crime < > > > > > > > > > > > > > > > > > >
Good afternoon	l,
Re. Cold Case H	omicide
I have been req	uested to review the forensic evidence in regards to this casefile

Can I please request the full case file from QHFSS, including the Quantification values, remaining volumes of samples (if possible) and a audit of exhibits that they have on hand in regards to this case.

If you have any queries please let me know.

Kind Regards, Tania



Tania SPITERI A/Inspector Forensic Inspector Central Region Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

# **OPERATIONS SUPPORT COMMAND**

*Our purpose: Enhancing frontline policing through the delivery of specialist capability* 

PROFESSIONALISM COMMUNI INTEGRITY Our values are at the core of who we are and what we do each day

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Neville.DavidH[OSC] Monday, 6 December 2021 14:54 Cathie Allen Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]; Lara Keller; Spiteri.TaniaM[OSC] FW: URGENT REQUEST: Full casefile request from QHFSS

Hi Cathie

I am sorry, however the Coroner politely declined the request for Rhys to be involved at this stage. Please see below for further information.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

From: Spiteri.TaniaM[OSC] < Sent: Monday, 6 December 2021 14:47 To: Neville.DavidH[OSC] < Subject: RE: URGENT REQUEST: Full casefile request from QHFSS -

Good afternoon Inspector,

I have heard back from D/Sgt ELKINS in regards to Rhys attending the meeting that Coroner O'CONNELL has scheduled and this is the response –

Hi Tania,

I have spoken to Mr. O'Connell about Rhys Parry wanting to be involved in our meeting and he has politely declined stating that it would not be necessary at this time. He did say that if he has any specific questions for QLD Health he will arrange an appropriate meeting and would prefer this be just for the investigative group at this stage.

Thanks

Lisa Elkins Detective Sergeant Ph: /

If you have any further queries please let me know.

Kind Regards, Tania

> Tania SPITERI A/Inspector Forensic Inspector



Central Region Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

# **OPERATIONS SUPPORT COMMAND**

Our purpose: Enhancing frontline policing through the delivery of specialist capability



 From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] 

 Sent: Monday, 6 December 2021 14:35

 To: Cathie Allen 

 Cc: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] 

 Spiteri.TaniaM[OSC] <</td>

 Subject: FW: URGENT REQUEST: Full casefile request from QHFSS

## Hi Cathie

A request has been made to the Coroner regarding Rhys's attendance at the meeting. Tania will let us know soon.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

From: Spiteri.TaniaM[OSC] < Sent: Monday, 6 December 2021 14:13 To: Neville.DavidH[OSC] < Subject: RE: URGENT REQUEST: Full casefile request from QHFSS -

Hi Dave,

I have spoken to Lisa ELKINS to contact the Coroner to see if that is what he wants – ultimately he has requested the meeting with the RO, so it will be up to him to decide, once I know I will let you know.

The results were as follows -

If there is any queries please let me know.

Cheers, Tania



Tania SPITERI A/Inspector Forensic Inspector Central Region Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

# **OPERATIONS SUPPORT COMMAND**

Our purpose: Enhancing frontline policing through the delivery of specialist capability



From: Neville.DavidH[OSC]				
Sent: Monday, 6 December 20	)21 12:39			
To: Cathie Allen <				
Cc: Harris.LibbyA[OSC] <		Spiteri.TaniaM[OS	SC]	
	>; Frieberg.DaleJ[OS	5C] <		; Justin Howes
	>; Lara Keller <		>	
Subject: RE: URGENT REQUES	T: Full casefile request fro	om QHFSS		

Hi Cathie

Yes the meeting with Magistrate O'Connell was a surprise to me too today. Hence the increased urgency. If you can provide whatever you can to Tania now that would be great. I will leave it with Tania to liaise with the investigators and the Coroner to see if Rhys can be involved but that makes sense to me.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command



CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

## Hi David

Thank you for making us aware of the meeting between Magistrate O'CONNELL and Investigators this Wednesday, as we were not aware of this. Is it possible for our case scientist Rhys Parry to be a part of this meeting (if its via MS Teams)? Given it may assist in resolving/dismissing recent media concerns surrounding the DNA results produced by our laboratory.

The casefile was provided under subpoena in January 2017, however additional items have been submitted and testing since it was provided. We are working on including the additional pages to the scanned copy of the casefile, so that a complete copy of the file is provided. Given we won't be able to provide the additional information by the meeting on Wednesday, we endeavour to provide what we currently have.

The quantitation process used in 2013 did not provide information such as degradation so this information is not available. Additionally, gathering this data would be labour intensive for us to extract this information, if it were available. This data is gathered manually when it has been requested.

Cheers Cathie



## Cathie Allen Bsc, MSc (Forensic Science) (She/Her\*) Managing Scientist

Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the Australian and New Zealand Forensic Science Society (ANZFSS), Brisbane, 11 – 15 Sept 2022

Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services Prevention Division, Queensland Health

p a 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108

e www.health.qld.gov.au/fss

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here



From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] <		
Sent: Monday, 6 December 2	2021 11:01 AM	
To: Cathie Allen <	>	
Cc: Harris.LibbyA[OSC] <	; Spiteri.TaniaM[OSC]	
<	u>; Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < <u>F</u>	; Justin Howes
<	>; Lara Keller < <u>L</u>	
Subject: URGENT REQUEST:	Full casefile request from QHFSS	
Importance: High		

This email originated from outside Queensland Health. DO NOT click on any links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi Cathie

I need to follow up on my email to you below dated 1 December

Apparently Magistrate O'CONNELL has scheduled a meeting with investigators this Wednesday (8/12/21). I have attached a copy of an email request I have received from Tania

little

Given the timeframe, could you please advise the best way forward to provide the information.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

 From: Neville.DavidH[OSC]

 Sent: Wednesday, 1 December 2021 15:03

 To: Cathie Allen 

 Cc: Harris.LibbyA[OSC] 

 Subject: FW: Full casefile request from QHFSS

Hi Justin and Cathie Is this something that can be provided to Tania please.



 From: Spiteri.TaniaM[OSC] 

 Sent: Wednesday, 1 December 2021 13:35

 To: DNA Liaison and Major Crime 

 Cc: Neville.DavidH[OSC] 

 Savage.JackT[CR]

 C

 Savage.JackT[CR]

 Comparison

 Subject: Full casefile request from QHFSS 

 Good afternoon,

Re. Cold Case Homicide

I have been requested to review the forensic evidence in regards to this casefile

Can I please request the full case file from QHFSS, including the Quantification values, remaining volumes of samples (if possible) and a audit of exhibits that they have on hand in regards to this case.

If you have any queries please let me know.

Kind Regards, Tania



Tania SPITERI A/Inspector Forensic Inspector Central Region Forensic Services Group

**OPERATIONS SUPPORT COMMAND** Our purpose: Enhancing frontline policing through the delivery of specialist capability



\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

Disclaimer: This email and any attachments may contain legally privileged or confidential information and may be protected by copyright. You must not use or disclose them other than for the purposes for which they were supplied. The privilege or confidentiality attached to this message and attachments is not waived by reason of mistaken delivery to you. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not use, disclose, retain, forward or reproduce this message or any attachments. If you receive this message in error, please notify the sender by return email or telephone and destroy and delete all copies. Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

Queensland Health carries out monitoring, scanning and blocking of emails and attachments sent from or to addresses within Queensland Health for the purposes of operating, protecting, maintaining and ensuring appropriate use of its computer network.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]
Sent:	Monday, 6 December 2021 12:24
То:	French.DavidA[OSC]
Cc:	Strategy and Performance OSC; Support Officer FSG[OSC]
Subject:	FW: Peer Review of Forensic DNA Analysis casefile

## OFFICIAL

AAC

I will call you about this, but I agree with Dave. There has been no consultation with us regarding this approach by QH.

D

 Dale Frieberg APM

 Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service |

OFFICIAL

From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] <
Sent: Monday, 6 December 2021 12:10
To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <
Subject: FW: Peer Review of Forensic DNA Analysis casefile

Dale

I would like to raise my concerns about QHFSS releasing case information to a third party without the consent of the QPS. This information including everything in the casefile is confidential in nature and should not have been released without the permission of the QPS.

The QPS has agreed for testing to be undertaken by QHFSS on the condition that it meets the requirements of ISO17025. That includes:

4.2.1 Maintaining confidentially of information provided to it by the customer or created during laboratory testing.

7.1.1 c) Obtaining customer approval before activities are to be performed by an external provider.

It is a breach of the standard for QHFSS to have made this decision without our approval. It may also breach Qld information privacy laws.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

From: Cathie Allen < Sent: Monday, 6 December 2021 11:19 To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Cc: Lara Keller < >; Neville.DavidH[OSC] Subject: Peer Review of Forensic DNA Analysis casefile

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi Dale

Recent negative media articles regarding the work undertaken in the Forensic DNA Analysis laboratory for an unsolved homicide case has generated a number of enquiries from the Minister's Office, the DG's office, the Coroner and the QPS.

With respect to the DNA analysis aspect of this case, FSS feel it prudent to have the DNA casefile peer reviewed by an independent DNA practitioner, and as such, we have engaged with

as agreed to assign a forensic DNA expert to peer review the casefile, with a view to re-reviewing the reported DNA outcomes, provide any recommendations regarding any new processing that could be undertaken and place the laboratory in a good position if a new Inquest date is set in the future. If recommendations regarding new processing are put forward, FSS will engage with the QPS regarding their desire to undertake this, prior to any work being done (given the case is unsolved, and may use any remaining DNA extract).

We will be providing the casefile to **sector**, with the understanding that the review is being undertaken around their operational requirements, given no new Inquest date has been set.

Please let me know if you have any queries regarding this.

Cheers Cathie



## Cathie Allen BSc, MSc (Forensic Science) (She/Her\*) Managing Scientist

Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the Australian and New Zealand Forensic Science Society (ANZFSS), Brisbane, 11 – 15 Sept 2022

Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services Prevention Division, Queensland Health



Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here



#### \*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

Disclaimer: This email and any attachments may contain legally privileged or confidential information and may be protected by copyright. You must not use or disclose them other than for the purposes for which they were supplied. The privilege or confidentiality attached to this message and attachments is not waived by reason of mistaken delivery to you. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not use, disclose, retain, forward or reproduce this message or any attachments. If you receive this message in error, please notify the sender by return email or telephone and destroy and delete all copies. Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

Queensland Health carries out monitoring, scanning and blocking of emails and attachments sent from or to addresses within Queensland Health for the purposes of operating, protecting, maintaining and ensuring appropriate use of its computer network.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]
Sent:	Tuesday, 7 December 2021 13:02
То:	Cathie Allen
Cc:	Lara Keller; Neville.DavidH[OSC]; French.DavidA[OSC]; Spiteri.TaniaM[OSC]
Subject:	RE: Peer Review of Forensic DNA Analysis casefile

## OFFICIAL

Thanks Cathie, appreciated.

Dale Frieberg APM Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service |

## OFFICIAL

 From: Cathie Allen 

 Sent: Tuesday, 7 December 2021 12:51

 To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]

 Cc: Lara Keller 

 Neville.DavidH[OSC] 

 French.DavidA[OSC] <</td>

 Subject: RE: Peer Review of Forensic DNA Analysis casefile

**CAUTION:** This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

## Hi Dale

Thank you for the advice. We will wait for further information from you regarding this.

## Cheers Cathie



## Cathie Allen BSc, MSc (Forensic Science) (She/Her\*) Managing Scientist

Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the Australian and New Zealand Forensic Science Society (ANZFSS), Brisbane, 11 – 15 Sept 2022

Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services Prevention Division, Queensland Health

> QLD 4108 www.health.qld.gov.au/fss

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here



From: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <	
Sent: Tuesday, 7 December 2021 9:47 AM	
To: Cathie Allen <	>
Cc: Lara Keller <	>; Neville.DavidH[OSC] <
French.DavidA[OSC] <	>; Spiteri.TaniaM[OSC] < >
Subject: FW: Peer Review of Forensic DNA A	nalysis casefile

This email originated from outside Queensland Health. DO NOT click on any links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

0	F	F	I	С	IA	L.
~	•	•	,	~	11	

Cathie,

As a result of the brief to the Coroner tomorrow regarding this matter, I request that until I know the outcome of that meeting and the Coroner's view, that this file is not sent out for a peer review at this stage. I will come back to you as soon as I am aware of the position.

D

Dale Frieberg APM	
Superintendent   Forensic Services	
	OFFICIAL
From: Cathie Allen <	
Sent: Monday, 6 December 2021 15:55	
To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <	
Cc: Lara Keller;	Neville.DavidH[OSC]
French.DavidA[OSC] <	
Subject: RE: Peer Review of Forensic DNA Analy	sis casefile

**CAUTION:** This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi Dale

Thank you for making further enquiries.

To ensure that both organisations have the same information regarding the Forensic DNA Analysis casefile – FSS provided a copy of the casefile under an RTI request **and the set of the set** 

Cheers Cathie

e



Cathie Allen BSc, MSc (Forensic Science) (She/Her\*) Managing Scientist

Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the Australian and New Zealand Forensic Science Society (ANZFSS), Brisbane, 11 – 15 Sept 2022

Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services Prevention Division, Queensland Health

a 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108

w www.health.gld.gov.au/fss

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here

PAN	25TH INTERNATEMAL SYMPOSIUM	MARK YOUR DIARY
	ANZF55 BRISBANE SAR BO22	HOSTED BY Answering the Soland

 From: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <</td>

 Sent: Monday, 6 December 2021 3:35 PM

 To: Cathie Allen

 Cc: Lara Keller 

 Neville.DavidH[OSC] 

 French.DavidA[OSC]

Subject: Re: Peer Review of Forensic DNA Analysis casefile

This email originated from outside Queensland Health. DO NOT click on any links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Thanks for the response Cathie. I will make some inquiries and come back to you tomorrow.

⊳:

Dale Frieberg APM Superintendent /Commander Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

From: Cathie Allen < Sent: Monday, December 6, 2021 3:09 pm To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Cc: Lara Keller; Neville.DavidH[OSC]; French.DavidA[OSC] Subject: RE: Peer Review of Forensic DNA Analysis casefile

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

## Hi Dale

The QPS have previously engaged with for this case and provided case context ( Given the QPS's

engagement with **second** on this case, the request to peer review the DNA components of the casefile was not seen as being outside of this.

To move forward on this, could you please advise how you would like me to proceed?

#### Cheers

Cathie

Cathie Allen BSc, MSc (Forensic Science) (She/Her\*) Managing Scientist Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the

Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the Australian and New Zealand Forensic Science Society (ANZFSS), Brisbane, 11 – 15 Sept 2022 Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services

w www.health.gld.gov.au/fss

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here



From: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <	>
Sent: Monday, 6 December 2021 12:28 PM	
To: Cathie Allen < >	
Cc: Lara Keller < >; Neville.Dav	idH[OSC] <

4

French.DavidA[OSC] < Subject: RE: Peer Review of Forensic DNA Analysis casefile

This email originated from outside Queensland Health. DO NOT click on any links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

OFFICIAL

Hi Cathie,

While I understand the predicament you are in, I would like to raise concerns about QHFSS releasing case information without consent of the QPS. There has been no consultation with the QPS regarding this approach. I understand the QPS has agreed for testing to be undertaken by the QHFSS on the condition that it meets the requirements of ISO17025, which includes:

4.2.1 Maintaining confidentially of information provided to it by the customer or created during laboratory testing.

7.1.1 c) Obtaining customer approval before activities are to be performed by an external provider.

I may also have a flow on to the Qld information privacy laws.

Could you please provide advice about what information will be provided and whether there is concern it may contravene above? Is this a practice that QHFSS would normally understake?

D

Dale Frieberg APM Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service |

OFFICIAL

From: Cathie Allen < Sent: Monday, 6 December 2021 11:19 To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < Cc: Lara Keller < Neville.DavidH[OSC] Subject: Peer Review of Forensic DNA Analysis casefile

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi Dale

Recent negative media articles regarding the work undertaken in the Forensic DNA Analysis laboratory for an unsolved homicide case has generated a number of enquiries from the Minister's Office, the DG's office, the Coroner and the QPS.

With respect to the DNA analysis aspect of this case, FSS feel it prudent to have the DNA casefile peer reviewed by an independent DNA practitioner, and as such, we have engaged with

has agreed to assign a forensic DNA expert to peer review the casefile, with a view to re-reviewing the reported DNA outcomes, provide any recommendations regarding any new processing that could be undertaken and place the laboratory in a good position if a new Inquest date is set in the future. If recommendations regarding new processing are put forward, FSS will engage with the QPS regarding their desire to undertake this, prior to any work being done (given the case is unsolved, and may use any remaining DNA extract).

We will be providing the casefile **management**, with the understanding that the review is being undertaken around their operational requirements, given no new Inquest date has been set.

Please let me know if you have any queries regarding this.



\*\*\*\*\*

HOSTEDBY

Australia and Arm Zasland

Disclaimer: This email and any attachments may contain legally privileged or confidential information and may be protected by copyright. You must not use or disclose them other than for the purposes for which they were supplied. The privilege or confidentiality attached to this message and attachments is not waived by reason of mistaken delivery to you. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not use, disclose, retain, forward or reproduce this message or any attachments. If you receive this message in error, please notify the sender by return email or telephone and destroy and delete all copies. Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

Queensland Health carries out monitoring, scanning and blocking of emails and attachments sent from or to addresses within Queensland Health for the purposes of operating, protecting, maintaining and ensuring appropriate use of its computer network.

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]
Sent:	Thursday, 9 December 2021 08:37
To:	Lara Keller
Cc:	French.DavidA[OSC]; ; Neville.DavidH[OSC];
	Spiteri.TaniaM[OSC]
Subject:	PEER REVIEW OF DNA

## OFFICIAL

Morning Lara,

I will call you regarding this email.

The Coroner met with the investigating officer and our forensic manager from Central Region yesterday for a case conference around the **Section**. The Coroner has instructed that he does not support QH conducting a peer review and has indicated this not to occur.

Could you please provide the advice to Cathie Allen.

D

Dale Frieberg APM Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service |

OFFICIAL

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]
Sent:	Thursday, 9 December 2021 09:37
To:	French.DavidA[OSC]
Cc:	
Subject:	FW: case - overview of meeting with Coroner
Attachments:	exhibits 2 - Coroner.xlsx

## OFFICIAL

## AAC

Further to our discussion this morning, a more comprehensive brief regarding the meeting yesterday with Coroner, IO and FM.

## D

Dale Frieberg APM	
Superintendent   Forensic Services Group   Queensland	Police Service

## OFFICIAL

>

.

From: Spiteri.TaniaM[OSC] < Sent: Thursday, 9 December 2021 09:23 To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < Cc: Elkins.LisaM[BR] < Subject: - overview of meetir

; Neville.DavidH[OSC] < - overview of meeting with Coroner

Good Morning Supt.,

Key points from meeting with Coroner O'CONNELL yesterday -

If you have any queries please let me know.

Thanks for your time.

Kind Regards, Tania



Tania SPITERI A/Inspector Forensic Inspector Central Region Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command M

# **OPERATIONS SUPPORT COMMAND**

*Our purpose: Enhancing frontline policing through the delivery of specialist capability* 



# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Keatinge.DavidJ[OSC]
Sent:	Thursday, 16 December 2021 09:13
То:	Support Officer FSG[OSC]
Cc:	Wilson.JadeK[OSC]; Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]
Subject:	RE: Enquiry from Dr Kirsty Wright re: DNA success rates paper

Thank you.

Regards Dave



David Keatinge Inspector Quality Management Section Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command



From: Support Officer FSG[OSC] <
Sent: Thursday, 16 December 2021 08:14
To: Keatinge.DavidJ[OSC] <
Cc: Wilson.JadeK[OSC] <
Subject: RE: Enquiry from Dr Kirsty Wright re: DNA success rates paper

Good morning Dave,

I discussed this matter with Superintendent Frieberg yesterday and she is supportive of the contents of Dr Krosch's response.

This request is approved.

Regards,



Administration Officer Office of the Superintendent Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command Queensland Police Service



I am positively bedeviled with meetings et cetera....



Our values are at the core of who we are and what we do each day

From: Keatinge.DavidJ[OSC] < Sent: Tuesday, 14 December 2021 06:56 To: Frieberg.DaleJ{OSC] < Cc: Support Officer FSG[OSC] < Subject: FW: Enquiry from Dr Kirsty Wright re: DNA success rates paper

Supt

Dr Matt Krosch has been asked by Dr Kirsty Wright to provide some background information concerning a paper that he published on DNA success rates. Dr Wright is currently doing some research into QH lab issues relating to the Blackburn case and asked Matt some specific questions relating to some points raised in his paper. I consider Matt's response is appropriate given Kirsty's current involvement in the case to date.

You happy for this to be forwarded to Dr Wright?

Regards Dave



David Keatinge Inspector Quality Management Section Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command



From: Krosch.MattN[OSC] < Sent: Monday, 13 December 2021 13:46 To: Keatinge.DavidJ[OSC] < Subject: Enquiry from Dr Kirsty Wright re: DNA success rates paper

Inspector,

As discussed, for your approval and forwarding to the Supt. Please find attached two enquiries from Dr Kirsty Wright concerning my DNA success rates paper, in the context of the case and recent media attention. Please find my proposed response below.

Dear Kirsty,

Thank you for your inquiry. Regarding your specific questions, sexual assault sample results included both fractions (where relevant), and I am not sure about AP/microscopy results for the semen swabs. More broadly, however, the purpose of the paper was to provide some insight for crime scene examiners about the likelihood of generating a useable profile from a particular sample type based on the substrate and collection technique and thereby inform their decision-making at the point of collection. The study was never designed to evaluate the efficacy of the testing laboratory and it would be inappropriate to use the data for that purpose. Any attempt to do so would be significantly flawed. There are numerous caveats around these data and the appropriateness or otherwise of comparing these with previous studies, many of which are discussed in the paper. It would not be appropriate for me to comment more broadly on these matters.

Kind regards, Matt



**Dr Matt Krosch** Research Officer Quality Management Section Forensic Services Group Operation Support Command Queensland Police Service



## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Subject: Kirsty Wright < Monday, 13 December 2021 08:21 Krosch.MattN[OSC] DNA Profiling Success Article

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

## Hi Matt,

I'm doing some research into the lab issues that were affecting the \_\_\_\_\_\_ case after the introduction of PP21 and STRMix. I found your 2020 paper in AJFS about DNA profiling success rates. I don't want to draw any incorrect or unfair conclusions from the data, so can I ask you some questions just to clarify a couple of points? Eg for the sexual assault samples, were these only the male fractions? For semen samples, were these AP+ and micro+? Please let me know if this is OK, and when would be a good time to talk.

## **Best wishes**

**Dr Kirsty Wright** Visiting Fellow

[ES	C]
From:	Kirsty Wright <
Sent:	Monday, 13 December 2021 11:00
To:	Krosch.MattN[OSC]
Subject:	Some Further Analysis from your Paper
Attachments:	DRAFT No DNA Profile Comparison.xlsx

**CAUTION:** This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

## Hi Matt,

I did some further analysis from the data in your paper. Rather than doing the comparison on full profiles or single profiles, which may not include information gained from mixtures from the more sensitive PP21 kit as you have suggested, I did the comparison on 'no DNA' profiles. I used the same papers for the comparison, but some of the categories either dropped out or new ones were included depending on how sure I could be of the results (see attached), so it won't be the same as your Table 4.

Does this look right to you? There appears to be a large difference between the proportion of 'no DNA' from Qld compared to all other studies. There aren't any categories where Qld are getting better results, and Qld appear to be using the more sensitive kit, which you would think would decrease the 'no DNA' results.

## **Best wishes**

**Dr Kirsty Wright** Visiting Fellow

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Cathie Allen < Friday, 17 December 2021 12:47 Neville.DavidH[OSC] Lara Keller; Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] **RE: Enquires from Ms Kirsty Wright** 

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi David

Thank you for providing the email trail regarding Dr Wright's enquiries.

When Dr Krosch provided the draft paper to FSS for review, significant feedback was given regarding our concerns. No advice was provided to FSS before the journal article was published and that our concerns had not been taken onboard.

It would be greatly appreciated if you could provide us with advice regarding Dr Wright's enquiries that are based around laboratory results produced by FSS, if future requests are made.

Cheers

Cathie

#### Cathie Allen BSc, MSc (Forensic Science) (She/Her\*) **Managing Scientist**

Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the Australian and New Zealand Forensic Science Society (ANZFSS), Brisbane, 11 - 15 Sept 2022

## Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services

Prevention Division, Queensland Health

p a 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 e

w www.health.gld.gov.au/fss

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here



From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] < Sent: Friday, 17 December 2021 8:32 AM To: Cathie Allen < Cc: Lara Keller <L Subject: Enquires from Ms Kirsty Wright

This email originated from outside Queensland Health. DO NOT click on any links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi Cathie

I need to give you a heads up on an enquiry made by Kirsty Wright recently. The email string below is fairly self-explanatory. We wont be providing her any further comment.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

From: Kirsty Wright
Sent: Thursday, 16 December 2021 11:08
To: Krosch.MattN[OSC] <
Cc: Neville.DavidH[OSC] <
Subject: Re: Some Further Analysis from your Paper

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi Matt,

Thank you for your response and clarifying the sexual assault samples. I understand your comments about not using the data to make comment about the lab's efficiency, and will respect your position on that. There are some very interesting results in there that may indicate there are issues in the lab though. The breast, oral and penis swabs are essentially clinical samples (taken from either the victim or offender by a GMO). To get such high amounts of 'no DNA' from those swabs is a concern (eg 52% of penis swabs getting no DNA, when you would expect to always at least get the donor).

Thanks again and have a lovely Christmas.

Dr Kirsty Wright

**Visiting Fellow** 



From: Krosch.MattN[OSC] < Sent: Thursday, December 16, 2021 9:14 AM To: Kirsty Wright < Cc: Neville.DavidH[OSC] < Subject: RE: Some Further Analysis from your Paper

## Dear Kirsty,

Thank you for your inquiry. Regarding your specific questions, sexual assault sample results included both fractions (where relevant), and I am not sure about AP/microscopy results for the semen swabs. More broadly, however, the purpose of the paper was to provide some insight for crime scene examiners about the likelihood of generating a useable profile from a particular sample type based on the substrate and collection technique and thereby inform their decision-making at the point of collection. The study was not designed to evaluate the efficacy of the testing laboratory and it would be inappropriate to use the data for that purpose. Any attempt to do so would be significantly flawed. There are numerous caveats around these data and the appropriateness or otherwise of comparing these with previous studies, many of which are discussed in the paper. It would not be appropriate for me to comment more broadly on these matters.

Kind regards, Matt



Members of QMS will at times be working from home during the COVID-19 crisis. If my office phone goes unanswered, please call me on the mobile above if you need to speak with me.

From: Kirsty Wright < Sent: Monday, 13 December 2021 08:21 To: Krosch.MattN[OSC] < Subject: DNA Profiling Success Article

**CAUTION:** This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi Matt,

I'm doing some research into the lab issues that were affecting the \_\_\_\_\_\_ case after the introduction of PP21 and STRMix. I found your 2020 paper in AJFS about DNA profiling success rates. I don't want to draw any incorrect or unfair conclusions from the data, so can I ask you some questions just to clarify a

couple of points? Eg for the sexual assault samples, were these only the male fractions? For semen samples, were these AP+ and micro+? Please let me know if this is OK, and when would be a good time to talk.

**Best wishes** 

**Dr Kirsty Wright** 

Visiting Fellow

\*\*\*

Disclaimer: This email and any attachments may contain legally privileged or confidential information and may be protected by copyright. You must not use or disclose them other than for the purposes for which they were supplied. The privilege or confidentiality attached to this message and attachments is not waived by reason of mistaken delivery to you. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not use, disclose, retain, forward or reproduce this message or any attachments. If you receive this message in error, please notify the sender by return email or telephone and destroy and delete all copies. Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

Queensland Health carries out monitoring, scanning and blocking of emails and attachments sent from or to addresses within Queensland Health for the purposes of operating, protecting, maintaining and ensuring appropriate use of its computer network.

\*\*\*\*\*

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Cathie Allen < Monday, 20 December 2021 13:52 Neville.DavidH[OSC] Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]; Lara Keller

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

## Hi David

Our Library Services have provided the below article regarding \_\_\_\_\_\_We've reviewed the information within the article and wish to advise you of the following:



Please let me know if you have any queries regarding this.

## Cheers Cathie



## Cathie Allen BSc, MSc (Forensic Science) (She/Her\*) Managing Scientist

Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the Australian and New Zealand Forensic Science Society (ANZFSS), Brisbane, 11 – 15 Sept 2022

#### Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services Prevention Division, Queensland Health



Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here



Sent: Monday, 20 December 2021 9:10 AM

# podcast: Did lab check DNA of high-

Exclusive David Murray National Crime Correspondent

• 9:05PM December 19, 2021

priority targets?

Queensland's government-run forensics laboratory may have failed to conduct DNA comparison checks on two highpriority targets in the murder investigation.

	had a history of using knives to stab and menace people, and was once jailed after violently	
assaulting	mother,	

 Homicide detectives had
 and his friend
 on a list of six high-priority persons of interest in

 murder, along with her former boyfriend
 , local criminal
 and his cousin

 , and another man.
 , and another man.
 , local criminal
 and his cousin

Forensic scientist Kirsty Wright has been unable to find any trace of DNA from or being compared with any DNA profiles from the crime scene or on body and clothes.

These profiles did not meet the criteria to upload to a national DNA database so they relied on matching using the Queensland lab's processes.

"There's just no evidence the lab ever compared two of the six suspects to their crime scene samples – nothing for or even though their samples were sent as suspect samples," Dr Wright said.

She found the potential bombshell anomaly while reviewing forensics evidence for investigative podcast series , and alerted police several weeks before the latest episode.

became a person of interest as someone who lived near the murder scene, was a known drug abuser, did not have a reliable alibi and was previously involved in the attack on , with her daughter present. Claims emerged during the police investigation that he hung out near the Girl Guides hut where the killer hid before the attack, and that missing handbag was seen at his house.

Detectives ruled out and as suspects, as did Coroner David O'Connell in his inquest findings last year.

However, police and the coroner would have had a reasonable expectation that DNA profiles of the two short-listed persons of interest were compared by lab scientists with crime scene DNA.

Barrister Craig Eberhardt, representing Peros, questioned at the inquest about his convictions for violence, including the stabbing of a woman in the face and breast.

accepted he had a lot of entries on his criminal history for assaulting people, breaking into houses, stealing, assault and carrying a knife, but couldn't remember him after she found him in her yard.

says she found n armed with a stick in her yard, approaching and her cousin.

"He went to take a step towards the girls and I stepped in front of him then, and that's when he punched me," she said. "He hit me, punched me, and I fell to the ground."

was later told he pleaded guilty to assault and numerous unrelated charges and was jailed.

An incident involving "going berserk" with a knife while drunk made Mackay's Daily Mercury newspaper in 2007. The article described him breaking two knives trying to stab and kick his way through a locked door. He eventually managed to cut and bash his way through with a third knife. His frience also had an extensive criminal history. Both deny any involvement in murder.

About samples were tested from , her clothing and mobile phone, with DNA profiles generated that contained DNA from unknown persons.

These are the profiles that may not have been compared with the DNA from and



Trish Murphy Team Leader (Library)

Information Research Services, Forensic and Scientific Services Prevention Division, Queensland Health

p 4108 e w <u>www.health.gld.gov.au/fss</u>

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and emerging.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

Disclaimer: This email and any attachments may contain legally privileged or confidential information and may be protected by copyright. You must not use or disclose them other than for the purposes for which they were supplied. The privilege or confidentiality attached to this message and attachments is not waived by reason of mistaken delivery to you. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not use, disclose, retain, forward or reproduce this message or any attachments. If you receive this message in error, please notify the sender by return email or telephone and destroy and delete all copies. Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Cathie Allen < Tuesday, 21 December 2021 17:19 Neville.DavidH[OSC] Lara Keller; Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

#### Hi David

Thank you for your email, and the confirmation that all comparisons have been carried out using reference samples or profiles recorded on NCIDD.

Previously the QPS may have been unsure the confidentiality of information at FSS, so disclosure of the below information is an attempt to ensure that both organisations are across the perceived issues as they arise. I will continue to provide information to you that's in line with the below.

Cheers Cathie



## Cathie Allen BSc, MSc (Forensic Science) (She/Her\*) Managing Scientist

Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the Australian and New Zealand Forensic Science Society (ANZFSS), Brisbane, 11 – 15 Sept 2022

Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services Prevention Division, Queensland Health

p a 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 e www.health.gld.gov.au/fss

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here



From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] < Sent: Tuesday, 21 December 2021 8:10 AM To: Cathie Allen <



This email originated from outside Queensland Health. DO NOT click on any links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

## Hi Cathie

In relation to your comments below, I do not believe that anyone in the QPS is sharing information with the media in relation to the case. This remains an open investigation and it would be highly inappropriate for us to do so. I note that this is the second time you have raised your concern about a leak outside of FSS.

As far as this matter goes, and with any other QPS casework, we would require QH to advise us if they intend to release any of our case information to another party including requests received through the RTI process. There is an exemption to provide information under the RTI Act when it relates to an open criminal investigation. I understand that FSS provided a copy of the casefile under an RTI request casefile under an October 2016. I am unsure if advice was sought from QPS at that time, however I would hope that that we would have advised to seek exemption under that provision.

As far as your other questions, there are no further reference samples that require testing or that remain undelivered. All comparisons/eliminations have been carried out using reference samples or profiles recorded on NCIDD.

I hope this helps



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command



From: Cathie Allen < Sent: Monday, 20 December 2021 13:52 To: Neville.DavidH[OSC] < Cc: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < Subject:

**CAUTION:** This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

## Hi David

Our Library Services have provided the below article regarding We've reviewed the information within the article and wish to advise you of the following:
Please let me know if you have any queries regarding this.

Cheers Cathie

e

### Cathie Allen BSc, MSc (Forensic Science) (She/Her\*) Managing Scientist

Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the Australian and New Zealand Forensic Science Society (ANZFSS), Brisbane, 11 – 15 Sept 2022

Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services Prevention Division, Queensland Health

p a 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108

w www.health.qld.gov.au/fss

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here



Sent: Monday, 20 December 2021 9:10 AM



- Exclusive David Murray National Crime Correspondent
- 9:05PM December 19, 2021

Queensland's government-run forensics laboratory may have failed to conduct DNA comparison checks on two highpriority targets in the murder investigation.

had a history of using knives to stab and menace people, and was once jailed after violently assaulting mother,

 Homicide detectives had
 and his friend
 on a list of six high-priority persons of interest in

 murder, along with her former boyfriend
 , local criminal
 and his cousin

 , and another man.
 , and another man.
 , local criminal
 and his cousin

Forensic scientist Kirsty Wright has been unable to find any trace of DNA from or being compared with any DNA profiles from the crime scene or on body and clothes.

These profiles did not meet the criteria to upload to a national DNA database so they relied on matching using the Queensland lab's processes.

"There's just no evidence the lab ever compared two of the six suspects to their crime scene samples – nothing for or even though their samples were sent as suspect samples," Dr Wright said.

She found the potential bombshell anomaly while reviewing forensics evidence for investigative podcast series , and alerted police several weeks before the latest episode.

became a person of interest as someone who lived near the murder scene, was a known drug abuser, did not have a reliable alibi and was previously involved in the attack on , with her daughter present. Claims emerged during the police investigation that he hung out near the Girl Guides hut where the killer hid before the attack, and that missing handbag was seen at his house.

Detectives ruled out and as suspects, as did Coroner David O'Connell in his inquest findings last year.

However, police and the coroner would have had a reasonable expectation that DNA profiles of the two short-listed persons of interest were compared by lab scientists with crime scene DNA.

Barrister Craig Eberhardt, representing questioned at the inquest about his convictions for violence, including the stabbing of a woman in the face and breast.

accepted he had a lot of entries on his criminal history for assaulting people, breaking into houses, stealing, assault and carrying a knife, but couldn't remember confronting him after she found him in her yard.

says she found armed with a stick in her yard, approaching and her cousin.

"He went to take a step towards the girls and I stepped in front of him then, and that's when he punched me," she said. "He hit me, punched me, and I fell to the ground."

was later told he pleaded guilty to assault and numerous unrelated charges and was jailed.

An incident involving "going berserk" with a knife while drunk made Mackay's Daily Mercury newspaper in 2007. The article described him breaking two knives trying to stab and kick his way through a locked door. He eventually managed to cut and bash his way through with a third knife. His friend also had an extensive criminal history. Both deny any involvement in murder.

About samples were tested from her clothing and mobile phone, with DNA profiles generated that contained DNA from unknown persons.

4

WIT.0035.0001.0147

25 July 2022

Dr John Wakefield PSM Director-General Queensland Health GPO Box 48 Brisbane, Queensland 4001 Australia

Dear Dr Wakefield

As you are aware, Queensland Health Forensic and Scientific Services (QHFSS) undertakes DNA testing on behalf of the Queensland Police Service (QPS).

In February 2018 QHFSS made a recommendation to QPS that testing of samples containing less than 0.008ng/uL of DNA should discontinue because the chance of obtaining a profile would be less than 2%. QHFSS advised that they would report samples below this threshold as 'insufficient DNA for further testing' and that QPS could request testing to continue if the sample was critical to a case. Except for 'Priority One' samples, the QPS agreed to discontinue testing at that point as a matter of routine based on the advice.

In December 2021 the QPS undertook a review of the success rate of obtaining a profile when it requested testing to continue for samples initially reported as 'insufficient DNA for further testing'. This revealed that 30% of the samples yielded a useable DNA profile when testing was continued.

I understand that the sample triage process may have resulted in considerable cost and time savings, however the relatively high success rates observed when testing is continued raises concerns in relation to the threshold value used. If the value is too high, it has the potential to result in offenders going undetected.

I have been keeping abreast of commentary in *The Australian* relating to DNA testing undertaken by QHFSS. On 17 February 2022 this widened to claims that thresholds used by QHFSS to triage testing are too high. It stated that the Queensland lab requires crime scene samples to have the equivalent of at least

22 cells to be fully tested, otherwise they are deemed to have insufficient DNA. It claimed that the threshold is double the 11 cells required in NSW, and almost three times the eight cells that the product manufacturer has used to obtain good quality DNA profiles.

I am not able to assess the basis or legitimacy of the claims made by *The Australian*, however they come at a time where similar concerns have been raised internally within my organisation.

Considering the current circumstances, I request that a review of the current DNA sample triage process be undertaken as a matter of urgency to ensure that the threshold value is still valid. Such a review should include benchmarking practices with other DNA laboratories within Australia.

I would request that an interdepartmental working party be established to undertake the review and offer the QPS to take a lead role. Should independent advice be required during the review, I would recommend this would occur by way of mutual agreement between both agencies.

The key point of contact within the QPS for the purposes of the review is Inspector David Neville, Biometrics, Forensic Services Group. His contact number is

Yours sincerely

KATARINA CARROLL APM COMMISSIONER

# From: Spiteri.TaniaM[OSC] Sent: Friday, 26 November 2021 16:08 To: Image: Cc: Subject: Subject:

Good afternoon FSG Team,

Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

Today, in collaboration, Mackay Criminal Investigation Branch and Homicide Investigation Unit arrested

I wanted to pass on my congratulations to the collaborative team effort from Forensic Services Group. This particular job was very demanding and has amazingly utilised every section within FSG.

I am so proud and very thankful for the professionalism that each and everyone one of you showed me and the investigation team when we kept asking for more..... (b). Our part is far from completed, but you should all be very proud of yourselves to know that you have been a part of this wonderful team and <u>ultimately</u> assisted in the arrest of which will hopefully bring some justice for family moving forward.

I thought that I would also put up a few stats from this job that you were all apart of: To date  $\neg$ 

- 865 Examinations conducted
- 893 exhibits collected
- 48+ FSG staff members involved
- 16+ scenes examined (including vehicles and person examinations)

Well done, and thanks again!!

Please also read the below email from Detective Acting Chief Superintendent Craig MORROW, who has asked me to pass his appreciation onto you all.

Have a great day.

Kind Regards, Tania

Tania SPITERI

ţ



# **OPERATIONS SUPPORT COMMAND**

Our purpose: Enhancing frontline policing through the delivery of specialist capability



From: Morrow.CraigW[HQ] <			
Sent: Friday, 26 November 2021 15	:14		
To: Birt.JonathanE[CIC] <	>; CIC	CHG <	
Cc: Crime Coordinator CER		; Armitt.ThomasA[C	R]
	Savage.JackT[CR] <		
McNamara.AndrewR[CR]		McKenzie.DavidN[CR]	
	; Spiteri.TaniaM[OSC] <		
O'Mara.BrendanG(HQ)			
Subject: RE: Special Occurrence	-		
Afternoon all,			

It's been previously said, and for good reason. This was a difficult job

However this team of investigators, forensic, intelligence and other specialist support officers overcame many hurdles to achieve a great outcome today. You are all to be congratulated for the way you have worked together.

Still much work though to be done, and I look forward to seeing what else comes from today's day of action.

Can you please pass on my appreciation to all your respective staff.

Thank you

Kind regards,

**Craig Morrow** 

**Detective Acting Chief Superintendent - Crime** 

CRIME AND INTELLIG		
From: Birt.JonathanE[CIC] < Sent: Friday, 26 Nover r 2021 13:32 To: CIC HG Hot Team Cc: Crime Coordinator ; Sava	age.JackT[CR] <	Armitt.ThomasA[CR]
McNamara.AndrewR[CR] < Spit O'Mara.BrendanG[HQ] < Subject: Special Occurrence	>; McKenzie.Da teri.TaniaM[OSC] <	vidN[CR]
Good Afternoon, Please find attached Special Occurrence <b>in</b> i of	in relation to	- investigations into the murder
(DOB: a	arrested and charged with the murder	of
Jon Birt Detective Sergeant Homicide Investigation Unit Crime & Intelligence Command   Queensland Po	blice Service	



3

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Subject: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Monday, 29 November 2021 15:06 Neville.DavidH[OSC] RE: DNA testing

### OFFICIAL

Perhaps verbal in the first instance. Keep me posted if you have any issues.

Dale Frieberg APM Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service |

### OFFICIAL

From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] < Sent: Monday, 29 November 2021 12:58 To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < Subject: DNA testing

Dale

On Friday I was advised of a potential issue with DNA testing in relation to the murder investigation The initial results reported for 10 samples were "DNA insufficient for further testing". Given the importance of the samples, QH was asked to retest them. After these items were retested, each yielded a profile that could be linked to a person with a likelihood ratio of >100 Billion.

Exhibit	Exhibit	Label	Location	Initial result	Result after
Number	type				
	Swab	4		DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR	
				FURTHER PROCESSING	CONTRIBUT
	Trace			DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR	
	DNA Kit			FURTHER PROCESSING	KNOWN CO
	Swab			DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR	
				FURTHER PROCESSING	
					CONTRIB >
	Swab			DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR	
				FURTHER PROCESSING	
			_		CONTRIB >

L

Fabric	DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR FURTHER PROCESSING	MILLION TC MILLION. E
Trace DNA Kit	DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR FURTHER PROCESSING	Post Morte
Fingernail Scraping	DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR FURTHER PROCESSING	ON. Post M NCIDD SEAI
Swab	DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR FURTHER PROCESSING	CONTRIB >
Swab	DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR FURTHER PROCESSING	CONTRIB >
Epithelial Fraction	DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR FURTHER PROCESSING	CONTRIB >

During the initial part of testing the amount of DNA present is quantified. The sample only goes on to be profiled if it is over a certain threshold. Given what has occurred, I think this threshold needs to be reviewed. Are you happy for me to raise this with QH.



# **David Neville**

Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Subject: Neville.DavidH[OSC] Monday, 6 December 2021 10:31 Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] RE: DNA testing

Dear Supt

We have undertaken a body of work here to try and work out what is occurring at QHFSS to result in samples not producing a profile that perhaps should have. In the **second** homicide investigation 33 samples were reported as having "DNA Insufficient for further testing" (DIFFT). Ten of these went on to actually produce a profile when further work was requested.

In February 2018 QHFSS made a recommendation to QPS that testing of samples that contained less than 0.008ng/uL of DNA should discontinue because the chance of obtaining a profile was less that 2%. Samples below this threshold were previously micro concentrated in an effort to attain a profile. Based on the advice from QHFSS, the QPS agreed to discontinue testing including micro concentration under such circumstances and the result would be reported as DIFFT.

In November 2018 the QPS raised concern with QHFSS that the number of samples with less than 0.008ng/uL of DNA that might provide a result if testing was continued appeared to be much higher that 2%. The concern came about as a result of a murder investigation **Security Security** where three of four samples that were initially reported as DIFFT yielded a profile when testing was continued upon the request of the QPS. At this stage QHFSS reaffirmed that the data continued to show that the likelihood of getting a result for samples with less than 0.008ng/uL of DNA was less than 2%. The QPS accepted this case as an anomaly. At this time QHFSS also indicated they would have to increase the cost of testing if QPS wished to reintroduce micro concentration as a matter of routine because the savings achieved by removing this had already been invested in anther area of their business.

The recent case prompted a wider review of all samples that were retested after a DIFFT result was received over 6 months. This revealed 51 out of 160 samples provided a profile when the QPS requested testing to continue. This indicates that approximately 30% of samples provide a result if QPS requests testing to continue. Some of the samples that are reported as DIFFT which went on to produce a profile include:



WET GLANS PENIS (Swab) LOW VAGINAL (Swab) VAGINAL (Swab) CERVICAL (Swab)

Each of the above samples would be expected to contain high numbers of cells. The QHFSS scientist would have expected a profile to be generated and should have continued on with testing without having to be prompted by QPS.

It would seem that the process of discontinuing testing when samples contain less than 0.008ng/uL of DNA is unique to QHFSS. I would also appear that it was introduced as an efficiency and potential cost saving exercise.

I think it may be timely to review this arrangement. I wondered if you might be in agreement.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] < Sent: Monday, 29 November 2021 12:58 To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < Subject: DNA testing

Dale

On Friday I was advised of a potential issue with DNA testing in relation to the murder investigation which was solved over the weekend. The initial results reported for 10 samples were "DNA insufficient for further testing". Given the importance of the samples, QH was asked to retest them. After these items were retested, each yielded a profile that could be linked to a person with a likelihood ratio of >100 Billion.

Exhibit Number	Exhibit type	Label	Location	Initial result	Result after
	Swab			DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR FURTHER PROCESSING	
				FORMER FROCESSING	CONTRIBUT
	Trace			DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR	
	DNA Kit Swab			FURTHER PROCESSING	KNOWN CO
				FURTHER PROCESSING	
					CONTRIB >
	Swab			DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR	
	-			FURTHER PROCESSING	
	Fabric			DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR	CONTRIB > '
	rabite			FURTHER PROCESSING	
					MILLION TO
					MILLION. EV
	Trace			DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR	
	DNA Kit			FURTHER PROCESSING	Post Morter
	Fingernail			DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR	Post Morter
	Scraping			FURTHER PROCESSING	
					ON. Post Mi
					NCIDD SEAF
	Swab			DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR	
				FURTHER PROCESSING	
					CONTRIB >
	Swab			DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR FURTHER PROCESSING	
					CONTRIB >

	Epithelial Fraction	DNA INSUFFICIENT FOR FURTHER PROCESSING	
			CONTRIB >

During the initial part of testing the amount of DNA present is quantified. The sample only goes on to be profiled if it is over a certain threshold. Given what has occurred, I think this threshold needs to be reviewed. Are you happy for me to raise this with QH.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Neville.DavidH[OSC]	
Sent:	Friday, 17 December 2021 17:23	
To:	Cathie Allen	
Cc:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]; 'Lara.Keller	
Subject:	Re:	

Hi Cathie

Thanks for the clarification. That was my understanding too. I was of the belief that QHFSS stopped doing this as a matter of routine for low quant samples because there was a lower than 2 percent chance of success. However, QPS has found the success rate to be 30 percent when we requested this to be done. It is the difference between these success rates that I am interested in.

Have a good weekend

David Neville Inspector, FSG

From: Cathie Allen < Sent: Friday, December 17, 2021 5:06 pm To: Neville.DavidH[OSC] Cc: Lara Keller; Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Subject: RE:

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi David

Thank you for the follow-up email regarding samples within this case.

To ensure that we're all on the same page, I'd like to clarify the process. If samples that have been deemed 'insufficient DNA for further processing' are processed further, they all first undergo a concentration step, followed by amplification. This is in contrast with samples that are not deemed in this range, as these samples amplification, without a concentration step. Just wanted to draw to your attention that there is additional work undertaken on the DNA extract to attempt to achieve a DNA result for the samples deemed 'insufficient DNA for further processing'.

Cheers Cathie

Cathie Allen BSc, MSc (Forensic Science) (She/Her\*) Managing Scientist Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the Australian and New Zealand Forensic Science Society (ANZFSS), Brisbane, 11 – 15 Sept 2022 Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services Prevention Division, Queensland Health p 0 a 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108

w www.health.gld.gov.au/fss

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here



From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] <	
Sent: Friday, 17 December 2021 12:04 PM	
To: Cathie Allen <	
Cc: Lara Keller <	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <
Subject: RE:	

This email originated from outside Queensland Health. DO NOT click on any links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

### Hi Cathie

e

In addition to the items on the list provided previously, last week we requested a blood swab to be retested which was originally reported as "insufficient DNA for further testing". This sample was taken from blood on a broken shard of glass as depicted in the photo below.

Given the nature of the stain and inert substrate, we were surprised with the original result which is what prompted the request to further test. Today we were advised that subsequent testing yielded a single source 20 loci profile. This was an excellent result solving the crime which would have been otherwise missed.

The image below is attached to the exhibit screen which was visible to the laboratory staff. The results of presumptive testing are also included on that screen. I wondered if lab staff use this information when making a decision on stopping testing?

Forwarded for you information and consideration along with the other material provided.





David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group

From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] <
Sent: Thursday, 16 December 2021 12:56
To: Cathie Allen <
Cc: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <
Subject: Re:

Hi Cathie

Thanks, this is a high priority for us, we would appreciate advice as soon as possible please.

David Neville Inspector, FSG

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Thursday, December 16, 2021 12:42 pm To: Neville.DavidH[OSC] Cc: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]; Lara Keller Subject: RE:

**CAUTION:** This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi David

Thank you for your email and feedback regarding this. We will review scientific data available to us and will provide further advice to the QPS in due course.

Cheers

e

Cathie
Cathie Allen BSc, MSc (Forensic Science) (She/Her*)
Managing Scientist

Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the Australian and New Zealand Forensic Science Society (ANZFSS), Brisbane, 11 – 15 Sept 2022 Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services Prevention Division, Queensland Health

a 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108

w www.health.gld.gov.au/fss

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here



From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] < Sent: Monday, 13 December 2021 2:06 PM To: Cathie Allen < Cc: Harris.LibbyA[OSC] < Subject: RE

This email originated from outside Queensland Health. DO NOT click on any links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

### Hi Cathie

Since sending you my last message I found some correspondence from February 2018 where QHFSS made a recommendation to QPS that testing of samples that contained less than 0.008ng/uL of DNA should discontinue because the chance of obtaining a profile was less than 2%. Samples below this threshold were previously micro concentrated in an effort to attain a profile. Based on the advice from QHFSS, the QPS agreed to discontinue testing including micro concentration under such circumstances and the result would be reported as "DNA Insufficient for further testing" (DIFFT). I am assuming this is the information I was seeking in the below request.

Based on the results obtained for \_\_\_\_\_\_, I asked my staff to undertake a wider review of the success rate of further testing of items that were originally reported as DIFFT during 2021. This revealed 51 out of 160 samples provided a profile when the QPS requested testing to continue. These items are listed in the attached.

On 14 November 2018 I raised similar concern in relation to \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ after 3 out of 4 samples yielded a result when QPS requested testing to continue. At that time QHFSS provided reassurance that the success rate would be lower than 2% and that the matter should be treated as an aberration. As a result the QPS agreed to continue the truncation of testing for items below the threshold quantity of DNA and limit automated micro concentration to P1 samples only.

Given the result of the recent cases where continued testing was successful, might it be timely to review the practice of truncating testing of lower quant items? For instance, is the threshold value still valid? Also, with the implementation of the latest version of STRMix that can deconvolute more complex mixtures, is it more likely to get a result now?

I think the 30% success rate of retesting warrants a little further examination to make sure we are maximising our chances of solving crime, particularly for major crime matters.

I look forward to discussing this further with you.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] Sent: Friday, 3 December 2021 10:07 To: Cathie Allen < Subject: RE:

**Thanks Cathie** 

I appreciate the timely feedback. Based on our conversation the other day, I am assuming these discussions occurred in 2008. Is there any correspondence that was provided to base this decision on that you can provide, please? For our referce and moving into the future, what is the actual percentage that your dataset has indicated? Obviously this information will be helpful in guiding future requests for retesting.



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

From: Cathie Allen <	
Sent: Friday, 3 December 2021 09:55	
To: Neville.DavidH[OSC] <	
Cc: Justin Howes <	
Subject: RE:	

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

### Hi David

e C

Thanks for the additional information on those samples from that particular case. We'll have a look into them and get back to you when we can.

After we had conducted a review of a large dataset, it was found that below a particular quantitation threshold and in line with manufacturer's specifications, a very small percentage of samples may provide some type of DNA profile, if they proceeded through DNA processing. This information was provided to the QPS, and the QPS advised that it would prefer that those samples that didn't exceed the quant threshold were not processed through to a DNA profile. We've monitored this and have found that with a larger dataset, the small percentage didn't vary.

We'll provide advice for this particular case when we're able to.



p a 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108

w www.health.gld.gov.au/fss

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here



From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] <	
Sent: Wednesday, 1 December 2021 1:48 PM	
To: Cathie Allen <	
Cc: Justin Howes <	
Subject: RE:	

This email originated from outside Queensland Health. DO NOT click on any links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

### Hi Cathie

To provide further context, it has been raised with me that 33 items were examined with advice being received, "DNA Insufficient for further testing". A request was made for these items to be further worked. Ten of these then returned a result with persons being identified with LRs of >100 billion. I have attached a spreadsheet that includes the results. II wondered if there was a particular reason for this case as to why approx. 30% of the samples yielded a result after the work was requested. Can you please advise what the actual threshold is and advice as to whether this needs to be reviewed.

Finally, sorry to sound demanding, can you also provide information on your expected likelihood of success in normal casework (i.e the likelihood of DNA insufficient samples yielding a result if testing is continued).

Cheers



David Neville Inspector Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

From: Neville.DavidH(OSC) Sent: Wednesday, 1 December 2021 10:24 To: Cathie Allen < Subject:

Hi Cathie

I wondered if you might be available at some time today to have a brief chat about some results from I Justin was available too, that might be helpful. Can we teams please?



David Neville Inspector

Biometrics Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

\*\*\*\*\*

Disclaimer: This email and any attachments may contain legally privileged or confidential information and may be protected by copyright. You must not use or disclose them other than for the purposes for which they were supplied. The privilege or confidentiality attached to this message and attachments is not waived by reason of mistaken delivery to you. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not use, disclose, retain, forward or

reproduce this message or any attachments. If you receive this message in error, please notify the sender by return email or telephone and destroy and delete all copies. Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

Queensland Health carries out monitoring, scanning and blocking of emails and attachments sent from or to addresses within Queensland Health for the purposes of operating, protecting, maintaining and ensuring appropriate use of its computer network.

\* \*\*\*\*\*

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:De Marco.JennaL[OSC]Sent:Monday, 29 November 2021 09:54To:Strategy and PerformanceCc:Supt FSGSubject:Weekly Dot Points - AAC OSC - 29/11/2021Attachments:FSG\_AC OSC WEEKLY SHEET\_29.11.2021 - collated response.docx

Good morning,

Please find attached this week's dot points for FSG.





Administration Officer Office of the Superintendent Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command Queensland Police Service

r am positively bedeviled with meetings et cetera....



Our values are at the core of who we are and what we do each day

		OPERATIONS SUPPORT COMMAND	
Area/Unit	Issue	Dot-Point Summary	
			-
Forensic Services Group			
	3. Cold Case Homicide –	3. Cold Case Homicide –	- District
		Review of forensic evidence to be conducted to asc	certain if there is any further
		examinations/testing required.	
	4.	4. Homicide of	
	- Homicide of		

# Operations Support Command | Weekly summary and Matters of Note



# Operations Support Command | Weekly summary and Matters of Note



# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]	
Sent:	Friday, 8 October 2021 13:22	
То:	Bolderrow.Gai[HQ]	
Cc:	Support Officer FSG ; Bushell.PeterA[ cCarthy.DuncanJ[OSC]	
Subject:	RE: Issues experienced with Sexual Assault Forensic Procedures	

### OFFICIAL

Thanks Gai will take a read and speak further with Peter.

Dale Frieberg APM
Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service |

### OFFICIAL

 From: Bolderrow.Gai[HQ] 

 Sent: Friday, 8 October 2021 13:14

 To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] 

 Cc: Support Officer FSG[OSC] 

 ; Bushell.PeterA[COVCOM]

 ; McCarthy.DuncanJ[OSC] 

 Subject: FW: Issues experienced with Sexual Assault Forensic Procedures

### OFFICIAL

Good afternoon Supt,

Some background in attached email. When I was relieving Bruce told me about some things he was trying to progress with FSS. One of those was getting the medical person to take both the exhibit and reference samples of DNA for sexual assault offences - S/Sgt Peter Bushell's great idea.

I spoke at length to John D from FSS but he said the Chief GMO was against it... we never got a formal response to the attached correspondence. I am unsure if Duncan was able to progress or if there is any update.

Since I have been at CIC, A/Supt Mark White has told me about the below committee his area has formed with QHealth to address ongoing issues with Sexual Assault kits and the experiences of victims with the health system and the evidence gathering process. I think the issue raised by Peter Bushell fits in this same area and is another potential issue to cause concern to victims of sexual assault. I think there is an opportunity for FSG to liaise with CASCG to achieve the best outcome for victims and maybe get the forensic practices changed.

Forwarded for your consideration and any further attention.

Regards Gai



### OFFICIAL

From: Briese.DavidB[CIC] Sent: Friday, 8 October 2021 09:34 To: White.MarkG[CIC]

Subject: Issues experienced with Sexual Assault Forensic Procedures

Good morning colleagues,

The Child Abuse and Sexual Crime Group (CASCG) continues ongoing discussions with the Department of Health regarding the provision of forensic examinations of sexual assault victims by Hospital and Health Services. As recently as this week, Det Supt Mark White, Debbie Jones and Bridgette Allen from the Policy and Programs Unit and I met with the Senior Forensic Physician and Director at Queensland Health Dr Adam Griffen and Forensic and Scientific Services Assistant Director of Nursing Jacqui Thomsen.

All matters of concern provided by your areas have been provided to the Department of Health and they have stated they will provide advice back as to why those issues occurred, and are committed to getting this process right.

While I believe that as a result of this continued communication we will see improvement, I also am under no illusion that we will continue to see problems in respect to refusals to conduct sexual assault examinations on both adult and child victims and/or directions to transport our victims to other hospitals.

CASCG is committed to assisting Qld Health get this process right – to ensure that our victims are treated in a timely and dignified manner, and to assist our investigators to obtain the evidence required. In this respect, I ask that you continue to provide any instances that we can provide formal representation of to our colleagues at Qld Health.

Furthermore, could you please ensure your investigators are aware that Forensic Physicians (GMO's) are on call 24/7 for the entire state and Qld Health have assured us that these Doctors will do everything to assist you on ground when you run into a difficult situation. They will provide information and advice to the medical staff you are dealing with and attempt to ensure they conduct the examinations as required. This also has the added bonus of it being recorded and accountable to Qld Health in real time. Should an investigator wish to make contact with the on-call forensic physician they only need to make contact with Police Communications who will then provide access to the on-call number.

Should you have any further queries or concerns, please do hesitate to contact me.

Thanks,

David

David Briese Detective Inspector Child Trauma and Sexual Crime Unit Child Abuse & Sexual Crime Group Crime and Intelligence Command



Sexual violence is never acceptable. Information and support is available online. Sexual Violence Awareness Month

www.qld.gov.au/svamonth



WIT.0035.0001.0172

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]
Sent:	Monday, 11 October 2021 10:52
То:	Bushell.PeterA []; Bolderrow.Gai[HQ]
Cc:	Support Officer FS McCarthy.DuncanJ[OSC]
Subject:	RE: Issues experienced with Sexual Assault Forensic Procedures

### OFFICIAL

Hi Peter,

Yes please if we could organise a meeting to discuss further. It certainly warrants progression. I am not aware of what has been presented by the QPS previously so I will seek for that advice (Jenna can you see if we have any EBN's / MBNs etc).

At the very least on reading below it should be raised to our Minister.

D

Dale Frieberg APM Superintendent   Forensic Services Group	Queensland Police Service
OF	FICIAL
From: Bushell.PeterA[COVCOM]	
Sent: Monday, 11 October 2021 09:55	
To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <	; Bolderrow.Gai[HQ]
<	
Cc: Support Officer FSG[OSC]	McCarthy.DuncanJ[OSC]

Subject: RE: Issues experienced with Sexual Assault Forensic Procedures

Super Bolderrow,

I appreciate you following this up and providing the update and I agree with your assessment this matter would fall under the ambit of the CASCG.

Super Frieberg,

Welcome back to FSG! This one might be a little easier to discuss in its entirety to see which way you may like to proceed.

• MOU (2014) were agreed guidelines between government agencies for a best practice framework for people who have experienced sexual assault;

- As part of this agreement it was determined by the government agencies/working group that one aspect was the reference sample should be taken <u>routinely</u> as part of the forensic medical examination;
- Qld is the only Australian jurisdiction where the victim takes their own reference sample;
- Dr Griffin is the only person who is against this proposal and against the proposed change albeit being jointly signed by the then Director General of Health;
- The taking of the reference sample by medical personnel ensures that the victim is only subject to the one invasive procedure;
- A significant advantage of the reference sample taken by Health is that everything is encompassed by them including supporting parties eg. Sexual Assault Teams who currently do not discuss the reference sample as it is not their charter (the SAIK only is discussed by Health staff and <u>not</u> the reference sample);
- The QPS have addressed all disclinations presented by Dr Griffin including contamination, "country doctors could stuff it up," and police do a better job in the reference sample collection (although the victim does it);
- Dr John Doherty, AC OSC and CoP are also all in agreeance with the taking of the sample by medical personnel is best practice for the victim and aligns with the intention of the MOU.

I am hopeful of a resolution but I wouldn't be overly shocked that the process will remain the same unless instruction came from the Honourable Minister D'Ath or Director General of QHealth Mr Wakefield.

For consideration - if you have time in your diary for 30 minutes I'll liaise with Jenna to organise a time.

Thanks again,

Peter



Peter BUSHELL Acting Inspector Strategy & Performance Taskforce Sierra Linnet

From: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < Sent: Friday, 8 October 2021 13:22 To: Bolderrow.Gai[HQ] Cc: Support Officer FSG[OSC]

; Bushell.PeterA[COVCOM]

McCarthy.DuncanJ[OSC]
Subject: RE: Issues experienced with Sexual Assault Forensic Procedures

## OFFICIAL

Thanks Gai will take a read and speak further with Peter.

Dale Frieberg APM Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service

OFFICIA	L
From: Bolderrow.Gai[HQ] <	
Sent: Friday, 8 October 2021 13:14	-
To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]	
Cc: Support Officer FSG[OSC] <	; Bushell.PeterA[COVCOM]
McCarthy.DuncanJ[OSC]	<
Subject: FW: Issues experienced with Sexual Assault Forensic F	Procedures

## OFFICIAL

Good afternoon Supt,

Some background in attached email. When I was relieving Bruce told me about some things he was trying to progress with FSS. One of those was getting the medical person to take both the exhibit and reference samples of DNA for sexual assault offences - S/Sgt Peter Bushell's great idea.

I spoke at length to John D from FSS but he said the Chief GMO was against it... we never got a formal response to the attached correspondence. I am unsure if Duncan was able to progress or if there is any update.

Since I have been at CIC, A/Supt Mark White has told me about the below committee his area has formed with QHealth to address ongoing issues with Sexual Assault kits and the experiences of victims with the health system and the evidence gathering process. I think the issue raised by Peter Bushell fits in this same area and is another potential issue to cause concern to victims of sexual assault. I think there is an opportunity for FSG to liaise with CASCG to achieve the best outcome for victims and maybe get the forensic practices changed.

Forwarded for your consideration and any further attention.

Regards Gai



OFFICIAL

From: Briese.DavidB[CIC] < Sent: Friday, 8 October 2021 09:34

Fo: White.MarkG[CIC] <

Subject: Issues experienced with Sexual Assault Forensic Procedures

Good morning colleagues,

The Child Abuse and Sexual Crime Group (CASCG) continues ongoing discussions with the Department of Health regarding the provision of forensic examinations of sexual assault victims by Hospital and Health Services. As recently as this week, Det Supt Mark White, Debbie Jones and Bridgette Allen from the Policy and Programs Unit and I met with the Senior Forensic Physician and Director at Queensland Health Dr Adam Griffen and Forensic and Scientific Services Assistant Director of Nursing Jacqui Thomsen.

All matters of concern provided by your areas have been provided to the Department of Health and they have stated they will provide advice back as to why those issues occurred, and are committed to getting this process right.

While I believe that as a result of this continued communication we will see improvement, I also am under no illusion that we will continue to see problems in respect to refusals to conduct sexual assault examinations on both adult and child victims and/or directions to transport our victims to other hospitals.

CASCG is committed to assisting Qld Health get this process right – to ensure that our victims are treated in a timely and dignified manner, and to assist our investigators to obtain the evidence required. In this respect, I ask that you continue to provide any instances that we can provide formal representation of to our colleagues at Qld Health.

Furthermore, could you please ensure your investigators are aware that Forensic Physicians (GMO's) are on call 24/7 for the entire state and Qld Health have assured us that these Doctors will do everything to assist you on ground when you run into a difficult situation. They will provide information and advice to the medical staff you are dealing with and attempt to ensure they conduct the examinations as required. This also has the added bonus of it being recorded and accountable to Qld Health in real time. Should an investigator wish to make contact with the on-call forensic physician they only need to make contact with Police Communications who will then provide access to the on-call number.

Should you have any further queries or concerns, please do hesitate to contact me.

Thanks,

David

David Briese Detective Inspector Child Trauma and Sexual Crime Unit Child Abuse & Sexual Crime Group



Sexual violence is never acceptable. Information and support is available online.

Sexual Violence Awareness Month www.qld.gov.au/svamonth





WIT.0035.0001.0180

188	(year)	EXHIBIT 31
1	DATE	PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED
	0	
R		
đ	120m	oday
	17/11/2	2/0
		Palas Rivel al.
	080	Lara Kuller Dave neurele.
		FSS r PQ
		- SMIKI KITS Prevention
		- SAIKI KITS Prevention adam reports V to Lona. Dr. Kith Mulal
		HO DOUG. D. MORD MOULA
		- allowo dinical
		concusoatron
	nacestates	- miet in I weeks time.
		Jenna to set metig adured we are in process of coulding inice.
		odunach mu an u) dana
		of coulopio win.
• <u></u>		Mal a midionali Jain Anano
- <u></u>		sugartice of um diance, why may
		ON appearance Lara sums supportier of ampliance why mas noted comment - gruppin reports to her + lathy an k/2
-		to how & lothy and kill


202 **EXHIBIT 32** (year) DATE PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED Thursday 18/11/21 AAC office. 1000 1030 SATK Kit discussion. ASC French Ac Annes Dalle Brine - Inverte extended 40 Daw Briese. Peter Buche Ar'S 7 with dava Keller. Danumun meting - modale MB Same A prou rekrence AMON prior mutic

# **EXHIBIT 33**

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Wednesday, 24 November 2021 07:40 Innes.KatherineL[HQ]; Briese.DavidB[CIC]
Cc:	
Subject:	FW: MBN - BREACH OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES – RESPONSE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED SEXUAL ASSULT
Attachments:	- MBN - BREACH OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES – RESPONSE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED SEXUAL ASSULT.docx; qld-govt-guidelines-for-responding-to-sexual-assualt.pdf; The Australian - Rape victims forced to wait hours in Queensland hospitals.pdf; Interstate SAIK Procedures.pdf

# OFFICIAL

AC and David,

Please see attached which may assist for this morning's 8am teams meeting with ED Lara Keller - SAIK Kits.

Hasn't been progressed from AC OSC at this time. This mornings meeting will help determine that.

D

Dale Frieberg APM Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service |

		OFFICIAL
From: Support Office	r FSG[OSC]	>
Sent: Tuesday, 23 No	vember 2021 09:38	
To: Strategy and Per	ormance OSC Offic	ce-
Cc: Supt FSG <o< td=""><td></td><td>; Neville.DavidH[OSC]</td></o<>		; Neville.DavidH[OSC]
<	>; Bushell.PeterA	
C. L. C	MONE DOFACILOF 2014	OUTERNELAND COVERNMARNT INTERACENCY OF URELINES

Subject: - MBN - BREACH OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES - RESPONSE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED SEXUAL ASSULT

Good morning,

Please find attached • MBN - BREACH OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES – RESPONSE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED SEXUAL ASSULT.

Please also find enclosed three supporting documents.

• Response to sexual assault – Queensland Government Interagency Guidelines for Responding to People who have Experienced Sexual Assault.

- News article from The Australian Rape victims forced to wait hours in Queensland hospitals
- Interstate Sexual Assault Investigation Kit (SAIK) Procedures

This MBN has been reviewed and supported by Superintendent Frieberg. Forwarded for favourable consideration and progression.

Dot points below are additional information for AAC French and AC Innes. Should there be no traction with Acting Executive Director Keller, Queensland Health, it is requested the below dot points are forwarded to DC Linford due to her role in the Women's Safety Committee.

# Additional information:

- If this reference sample is taken by medical personnel. The process of the taking of the SAIK and reference sample is discussed by support services. Currently, counsellors do not discuss the taking of the reference sample as it is not their charter;
- The OPM's were changed by A/Insp Ewen Taylor as a result of Dr Griffin declining to change process. Section 2.6.3 advises that the reference sample is to be taken at the same time of the SAIK. This was to ensure that the reference sample was in fact taken by investigators. Good in theory but difficult in practice as investigators are building a rapport with victims and sometimes this is not practical;
- 50% of kits (2016) arrived at QHFSS without the reference sample. Generally two fold. Firstly, junior
  detectives already thought that it had been taken as part of the SAIK and secondly detectives were
  walking the SAIK through without the reference sample not knowing that analysis could not
  commence without it;
- Insp Neville advises that once a SAIK is received that detectives are also advised to ensure the
  reference sample is taken. This reduces the timeliness of the analysis of the kits. If detectives have
  not taken the references sample and the SAIK arrives at QHFSS for analysis then realistically this
  has the potential to put the analysis of the kit back in excess of a week due to the fact that sometimes
  it is not operationally possible to take the kit immediately to QHFSS.

# Regards,



er Office of the Superintendent Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command Queensland Police Service



I am positively bedeviled with meetings et cetera....



Our values are at the core of who we are and what we do each day

QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE			DOC Ref:
Requested by:			File Ref:
MINISTER FOR POLICE AND MINISTER FOR FIRE AND			
$\boxtimes$	Submission for Approval		Briefing Note for Information
	Information for Minister's Speech		Joint Media Release
Locality Brief			Function Checklist
		URGENT	
MINISTER'S DUE DATE		MI	VISTER'S APPROVAL REQUIRED BY

# SUBJECT:

# BREACH OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES – RESPONSE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED SEXUAL ASSULT

# **RECOMMENDATION:**

That the Minister approves the following recommendation:

To progress the issues at the Ministerial level to ensure that Queensland processes are consistent with all other Australian jurisdictions in line with the Response to Queensland Government Interagency Guidelines for Responding to People who have Experienced Sexual Assault. This will ensure enhanced psychological welfare of victims, efficiency in obtaining reference DNA samples and analysis of sexual assault investigation kits.

NOTED / SUPPORTED	NOTED / APPROVED / NOT APPROVED
Deputy Commissioner, Regional Queensland / /2021 NOTED / SUPPORTED	The Honourable Mark Ryan MP Minister for Police and Corrective Services and Minister for Fire and Emergency Services / /2021 MINISTER'S COMMENTS:
Katarina Carroll APM Commissioner / /2021	

DOC Ref: DOC21/1934056

File Ref:

COMMENTS:	

DOC Ref:

File Ref:

# **MINISTERIAL BRIEFING NOTE / APPROVAL**

# SUBJECT: BREACH OF 2014 QUEENSLAND GOVERNMENT INTERAGENCY GUIDELINES – RESPONSE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED SEXUAL ASSULT

# PURPOSE:

1. To inform the Minister of the non-compliance of Queensland Health to implement interagency best practice guidelines by not taking DNA victim reference samples at the time of the forensic medical examination.

# BACKGROUND:

- 2. In June 2014 a Government Interagency Working Group published the policy document Response to Sexual Assault – Queensland Government Interagency Guidelines for Responding to People who have Experienced Sexual Assault (The Guideline). The purpose of the Guideline was to prevent unnecessary trauma being caused to victims including during subsequent forensic medical examinations. It recommends that victim DNA reference samples, usually a mouth swab (on occasion a blood sample) should be taken routinely as part of the forensic medical examination.
- 3. Currently in Queensland, the practice used is contrary to the guidelines, and victims are subject to a forensic medical examination conducted by trained doctors and nurses, where samples are collected using a Sexual Assault Investigation Kit (SAIK). This is followed by a later procedure where a DNA reference sample is taken at the direction of a police officer. In essence the victim is subjected to two separate forensic procedures.
- 4. The collection of DNA by police can increase stress for the victims at a time they are most vulnerable due to fear of how the information may be used by authorities. Queensland is the only Australian jurisdiction where police are involved in the collection of reference samples. In all other jurisdictions the reference sample is taken as part of the forensic medical examination as recommended in the Guideline. This ensures that the victim is subject to only one invasive procedure, thereby minimising trauma.
- 5. Since the Guideline was published, the QPS has been liaising with Queensland Health to have the process altered so that it consistent with national best practice and aligns with the standing guidelines. All requests to implement change have been declined by Dr Adam Griffin who manages the forensic medical program within Queensland Health.
- 6. In January 2016, Acting Inspector Bushell, South Brisbane Forensic Manager (QPS) consulted with Dr Gary Hall, Acting Director of Queensland's Clinical Forensic Medicine Unit, Dr Cathie Allen, Managing Scientist Police Services Stream Queensland Forensic Health Scientific Services (QHFSS) and Ms Majcen, Sexual Assault Team Leader Royal Brisbane and Women's Hospital. All parties were in agree ace that it would be in the victims' best interest to have all invasive procedures conducted during the one process.
- 7. Enquiries were conducted with all Australian jurisdictions which identified that Queensland was the only jurisdiction where the reference sample was taken by the victim, under the direction of a police officer. In all other states and territories, the reference sample is taken as part of the SAIK.
- 8. In November 2016, Senior Sergeant Bushell and Acting Sergeant Tresise of South Brisbane District Forensic Services (QPS) consulted the substantive Director of Queensland's Clinical Forensic Medicine Unit, Dr Adam Griffin and Dr Cathie Allen of Queensland Health and during this discussions doctors Griffin and Allen declined to change the process stating various concerns. These included it was not best practice, inability of rural doctors to take a reference sample and it would create contamination issues.
- 9. In 2017, Inspector Neville, QPS DNA Management Unit contacted Dr Griffin who declined to adopt the 2014 Guidelines where the reference sample of the victim should be taken as part of the forensic medical examination.

UNCLASSIFIED OFFICIAL

DOC Ref:

File Ref:

- 10. In 2018, Acting Inspector Taylor, QPS DNA Management Unit consulted Dr Adam Griffin who again declined to adopt the Guidelines.
- 11. On 26 October 2020, a Forensic Services Liaison Group meeting attended by Acting Assistant Commissioner Connors, Operational Support Command; Superintendent McNab, Forensic Services Group, Executive Director Dr Doherty, QHFSS and Director of Public Prosecutions, Mr McCarthy, agreed that the taking of the victim reference sample was the treating clinicians' responsibility, in turn reducing trauma and improving analysis efficiency.
- 12. On 14 December 2020, correspondence was sent to the Executive Director, Forensic and Scientific Services, QHFSS advising of the agreement between agencies, that the taking of the reference sample was the clinician's responsibility to prevent further trauma to the victim.
- 13. The attending parties of Forensic Services Liaison Group meeting held on 27 January 2021, agreed that the process of the taking of the victim reference sample was to transition to the responsibility of Queensland Health clinical staff with a proposed transition date of 1 July, 2021.
- 14. This date has since passed without the endorsement of the Director of Queensland Health Forensic Medicine Unit, Dr Griffin.
- 15. On 17 November 2020, Acting Executive Director, Ms Lara Keller of QHFSS was consulted regarding the expiry of the proposed transitional date. Ms Keller agreed with the guidelines, that it would be in the best interest of the victim and for national consistency to have the sample taken by medical personnel as part of the forensic medical examination.

# **ISSUES:**

- 16. The current process exposes the victim is to an unnecessary secondary procedure involving police after they have undergone a forensic medical examination.
- 17. This creates more psychological trauma for the victim, which is actively mitigated by all other jurisdictions by taking the reference sample during the forensic medical examination.
- 18. The testing of the SAIK is conducted by Queensland Health which involves DNA analysis. Such analysis cannot be undertaken until a DNA reference sample is available. The involvement of police in the sampling process as a third party also causes unnecessary delays in the testing. The timely testing of the SAIK becomes pertinent where offences are random, are connected to a series of offences and offender/s are not known to the victim.
- 19. There are no legal impediments to the victim reference sample being taken by trained medical personnel. There are no provisions within the *Police Powers Responsibilities Act 2001* that specify that police must take victim reference samples. Victim consent can be obtained from the medical officer performing the forensic medical examination.
- 20. Dr Griffin has raised numerous potential contamination risks in his repeated objection to complying with the Guideline. All of these risks can be removed through appropriate collection and packaging processes which have been adopted in other jurisdictions.

# **RECOMMENDATION/S:**

- 21. That the Minister:
  - a. To progress the issues at the Ministerial level to ensure that Queensland processes are consistent with all other Australian jurisdictions in line with the Response to Queensland Government Interagency Guidelines for Responding to People who have Experienced Sexual Assault. This will ensure enhanced psychological welfare of victims, efficiency in obtaining reference DNA samples and analysis of sexual assault investigation kits.

DOC Ref:

File Ref:

# DAVID FRENCH ACTING ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OPERATIONS SUPPORT COMMAND

Contact Officer: Senior Sergeant Peter Bushell Forensic Services Group

# THE AUSTRALIAN

# Rape victims forced to wait hours in Queensland hospitals

EXCLUSIVE By LYDIA LYNCH, REPORTER 8:34PM NOVEMBER 16, 2021 + 🙊 42 COMMENTS

Rape victims have been kept waiting in Queensland hospital emergency departments for almost 24 hours unable to take a shower, change clothes or brush their teeth because there are no trained staff available to collect vital DNA evidence.

A coalition of senior police, health staff and social workers has sounded the alarm on how the system "frequently fails" victims in regional Queensland as part of an independent inquiry into women's safety.

Sexual assault victims – including children – have been turned away from regional hospitals because there are no medical staff available to conduct forensic medical exams, also known as rape kits, while larger hospitals have kept patients waiting for almost 24 hours.

The inquiry, headed by former appeal court president Margaret McMurdo, will report to the Palaszczuk government this month about domestic violence recommendations, including whether to criminalise coercive control.

A second report into women's experiences in justice system, including a review of the state's sex consent laws, has been delayed until June 2022 because of a huge number of submissions.

In one submission to the inquiry, Senior Sergeant Edward Kinbacher, who heads the Cairns criminal investigation branch, said forensic examination services across the state were "generally poor and not fit for purpose" but the degree of dysfunction varied around Queensland.

The 34-year veteran detective said arrangements between the state government's health, justice and police departments "fail frequently to adequately meet the psychological, medical/forensic and generally humanitarian needs of complainants and victims of sexual assault".

### 17/11/2021, 13:17

### Rape victims forced to wait hours in Queensland hospitals

Sergeant Kinbacher gave recent examples of failures including a child rape victim who was told no forensic exam was possible for 36 hours because there were no on-call staff available.

"After high-level complaints at Cairns Base Hospital, the examination was conducted in a shorter timeframe," he wrote in his capacity as a Sexual Assault Forensic Integrated Response Network member.

Sergeant Kinbacher said another victim left the emergency department without being examined, after waiting almost 24 hours. "This victim was later located by police and the examination conducted," he wrote.

A third victim was turned away from a regional hospital because no staff was qualified to conduct the exam. She then drove herself to a larger hospital where the rape kit was conducted. Sergeant Kinbacher said those failures happened when there were gaps in the on-call roster – the longest being four days – with no contingency plan from Queensland Health.

Lack of qualified staff available to conduct rape kits was exposed by the state's auditor-general in 2019, who found survivors had to drive for hours to find a clinician trained to collect evidence.

The auditor-general decided to dig into rape kit availability "because the Queensland Police Service raised concerns about longstanding difficulties for sexual assault victims accessing these examinations".

In response to the report, the Palaszczuk government promised to train more nurses to conduct rape kits and since then, more than 60 nurses and midwives have been trained through the Central Queensland University.

Attorney-General Shannon Fentiman said women were often retraumatised while trying to seek justice, and the inquiry was looking at better supporting victims as they made their way through the system.

# LYDIA LYNCH, REPORTER

Lydia Lynch covers state and federal politics for The Australian in Queensland. She previously covered politics at Brisbane Times and has worked as a reporter at the North West Star in Mount Isa. She began her... <u>Read more</u>



- 2 -

 Inquiries with interstate revealed all Police jurisdictions in Australia, with the exception of Queensland, take a victim DNA reference sample at the time the SAIK or equivalent is administered by their authorized Forensic Medical examiner – see appendix A for contact liaison list.



7. Inquiries with respective Brisbane Region Detective, Officers' in Charge, reveal a change to current police procedures would be embraced, as changing this procedure should not only reduce potential further distress / anguish to the victim, but also save investigative time of detectives by eliminating a potentially unnecessary follow-up visit.



duar. EXHIBIT 34 215 (year) DATE PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED SAIK Rits uching has researched. Idam gruppen & Jackie Thompson Lad Fuller. (N - doument out for receiver anen 14 not hap metings reprene sample piece · approach to prepare alideo narrit com NO OH Law maidisial. 2010. of hel. + Oume same ounter ontomination mot - 10 still patential you elantamination - considuations a pep, packages. another of allegation DIX. anault NPS.

216 02021 (year) PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED DATE - Wood somples - could track a can loved at refirence comples 12 separate phikaging. (dual sample model) o if each 2% - neld to lan toward mapuly. - no need to incepture DNA unit Educations will dinical kano on site. SIAN program. uark to do. o FOUS ON VICTINIT. ACTION . Marking group to moue pormand received document. \* phone hook p-1 not.

# EXHIBIT 35

From:	Support Officer FSG[OSC]	
Sent:	Wednesday, 8 December 2021 09:57	
To:	Neville.DavidH[OSC]; Bushell.PeterA	]; Briese.DavidB[CIC];
	Hoffman.CarolynP[OSC]; Townsend.N	licoleA[OSC]; McCarthy.DuncanJ[OSC];
	Colless.FabianG[CIC]	
Cc:	Cathie Allen;	; Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]; De
	; Paula Brisotto; Ki	irsten Scott; Justin Howes;
	Adam.Griffin@	
Subject:	Re: SAIK working group Minutes 07.1	2.2021
Attachments:	SAIK Working Group - Agenda Minut	
	5 1 5	•

Good Morning,

Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

Please find the meeting minutes, including action items attached.

These are draft minutes, if there are any changes please let me know before 13/12/2021 otherwise we will consider these as final for the next meeting.

# The next meeting will be held at 11am on 15.12.2021

Kind Regards,



A/Sergeant Support Office Office of the Superintendent Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command

Queensland Police Service





Our values are at the core of who we are and what we do each day



# QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE

**SAIK Working Group** 

# **MINUTES/AGENDA**

Meeting Date: 07/12/2021

Location: Office of Superintendent, Forensic Services Group, Level 4, PHQ and Microsoft Teams Time: 10:30am - 11:30am Chair: Superintendent Dale Frieberg

# Attendees:

Inspector David Neville, FSG (DN) Acting Inspector Peter Bushell, FSG (PB) Inspector David Briese, CIC (DB) Sergeant Carolyn Hoffman, FSG (CH) Paula Brisotto, QH (PBO)

Acting E/Director Lara Keller, QLD Health (LK) Cathie Allen, QLD Health (CA) Justin Howes, QLD Health (JH) Jacqui Thomson, QLD Health (JT) Kirsten Scott, QLD Health (KS)

# Apologies

Senior Sergeant Nicole Townsend, FSG Inspector Duncan McCarthy, FSG

Dr Adam Griffin, QLD Health Sergeant Fabian Colless, CIC

	item	Responsible	Action Items
1.0	Welcome and Apologies		
1.1	Opening and Welcome	Chair	
1.2	Apologies	Chair	
	<ul> <li>Inspector Duncan McCarthy, FSG</li> </ul>		
	<ul> <li>Senior Sergeant Nicole Townsend, FSG</li> </ul>		
	<ul> <li>Dr Adam Griffin, QLD Health</li> </ul>		
2.0	General Business		
2.1	<b>Qld Government Interagency Guidelines</b> Compliance with the 2014 Qld Government Interagency Guidelines	All	<ul> <li><i>LK</i> - to follow up with Dr</li> <li>Adam Griffin on:</li> <li>date his committee met</li> <li>the status of the</li> </ul>
	<i>PB</i> – Seeking compliance in line with Qld Government Interagency Guidelines <i>DN</i> – Discussion on obstacles to compliance and suggestions on how to overcome obstacles		<ul> <li>o the status of the document</li> <li>is there a review required?</li> <li>Deadline for feedback</li> <li>any Action items from this meeting committee</li> </ul>
2.2	Responsibility of collecting reference samples The reference sample to be taken on behalf of the victim by medical personnel during the Forensic Medical Examination (FME) so that the victim is only exposed to the one invasive procedure All agreed that swabs are to be completed by a health professional JT – No issue with reference sample collection at the same time	All	ALL – (Informal ) Educate, communicate this process to all involved. LK – There is no formal agreement by QH for this to be transferred from QPS to QH, to be included in next working group agenda



# QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE



# SAIK Working Group

	LK - This is an ongoing agenda item for the working group from QH's perspective and no agreement has been reached that this will be transferred from QPS to QH.		
2.3	<ul> <li>SAIK and Reference Sample procedures – explanation to victim.</li> <li>The explanation of the SAIK and the reference sample to be conducted by support services/counsellors to alleviate two separate explanations of procedures</li> <li>DN – Discussion on barriers to sampling – if QH wanted to return to blood sampling in SAIKs QPS doesn't need to handle them anymore</li> <li>CA – Buccal cell samples are preferred by QH to FTA. Blood has to be handled manually however there are only approx. 2.5% annually.</li> <li>LK – No official agreement reached by QH to move to the new protocol for reference sample procedures. QH advised they do not wish to move to blood collection for each SAIK. FTO buccal samples are preferred for non-oral cases. Where there is an allegation of oral assault, a later buccal swab or alternative sample would be required.</li> </ul>	All	JT - Training program to be updated for new process integration – to be added for discussion on next working group agenda as requested by QH.
2.4	<ul> <li>Packaging of the SAIK/reference sample</li> <li>Packaging of the SAIK/reference sample would</li> <li>be best held with Health – similar to NSW</li> <li>where the reference sample is attached but</li> <li>separate to the kit – similar to an invoice on a</li> <li>package. Alleviates contamination as not in</li> <li>the one package and ensures both samples</li> <li>remain together.</li> <li>CA - Current external packaging does not</li> <li>support the decided combination of FTA and</li> <li>SAIK. Obstacle with storage at QH end where</li> <li>one is stored in freezer and the other sample</li> <li>stored at room temperature</li> <li>DN - QPS will provide the budget for the 700</li> <li>x FTA's and there should be no extra cost to</li> <li>QH above current processes.</li> </ul>	All	CH – provide budget estimate for 700 x FTA production CA and PB – To follow up as to what this looks like in NSW (dual kit) and bring back an example to the next meeting. JH – Follow up provide information on who takes follow up second sample at the later time? LK – add discussion on changing the packaging of current sample to next working group agenda



# QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE



# SAIK Working Group

	LK – QH has not agreed to change the current packaging of the SAIK/reference sample.		
2.5	The management of the exhibit (SAIK/reference sample) The management of the exhibit would be best discussed by Health and Insp Neville. Do QPS need to be involved? Can this go direct from the examination to analysis? Similar to the Just in Case Kits managed by Health. If QPS don't get involved, then this has the ability to expedite the analysis by days and days. CA – How does the kit/continuity get transported to QH?	All	ALL– Each unit to bring a current and proposed flow chart to next meeting of the procedure so that the committee can discuss and see where to make changes. DN – Will provide QPS
3.0	Other Business		
3.1	CA – suggested a review of the Sex Kit and costings.	All	QPS – add to next working group meeting agenda
4.0	Meeting Finalisation		
4.1	Next Meeting - 15/12/2021 11am		
4.2	Close	1	

# EXHIBIT 36

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]	
Sent:	Friday, 10 December 2021 11:46	
To:	Bushell.PeterA[COVCOM]; Support Officer FSG[OSC]; Townsend.NicoleA[OSC];	
	McCarthy.DuncanJ[OSC]; Koplick.KennethA[OSC]; Hoffman.CarolynP[OSC];	
	Briese.DavidB[CIC]; Neville.DavidH[OSC]	
Cc:	Supt FSG	
Subject:	RE: Updated: SAIK working group Minutes 07.12.2021	

# OFFICIAL

Agree, don't recall the comment regarding the later buccal



# OFFICIAL

From: Bushell.PeterA[COVCOM]	u>
Sent: Friday, 10 December 2021 10:29	1
To: Support Officer FSG[OSC]	Townsend.NicoleA[OSC]
<	>; McCarthy.DuncanJ[OSC]
Koplick.KennethA[OSC]	Hoffman.CarolynP[OSC]
	Briese.DavidB[CIC]
Neville.DavidH[OSC]	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]
Cc: Supt FSG	

Subject: RE: Updated: SAIK working group Minutes 07.12.2021

All,

From what I recall this wasn't actually mentioned. It was my understanding that QHFSS did not want to utilise blood collection for **each** SAIK but in the instances where oral assault occurred and due to the low percentage of this occurring (2% or 8 per year) that QHFSS processes could accommodate blood analysis for those cases since it was low – I believed that this was stated by Ms Cathie Allen. <u>Am I mistaken here?</u> From what I recall, there was no conversation of a later buccal swab in those instances.

2.3	SAIK and Reference Sample procedures – explanation to victim. The explanation of the SAIK and the reference sample to be conducted by support services/counsellors to alleviate two separate explanations of procedures
14	DN – Discussion on barriers to sampling – if QH wanted to return to blood sampling in SAIKs QPS doesn't need to handle them anymore

CA - Buccal cell samples are preferred by QH to FTA. Blood has to be handled manually however there are only approx. 2.5% annually. LK - No official agreement reached by QH to move to the new protocol for reference sample procedures. OH advised they do not wish to move to blood collection for each SAIK. FTO buccal samples are preferred for non oral cases. Where there is an allegation of oral assault, a later buccal swab or alternative sample would be required.

Regards,

Peter



Strategy & Performance

From: Support Officer FSG[0 Sent: Friday, 10 December 2			
To: Townsend.NicoleA[OSC]		>; McCarthy.DuncanJ{OS	C]
	; Koplick.Kennet	thA[OSC] <	
Hoffman.CarolynP[OSC] <		Bushell.PeterA[COVCOM]	
<	>; Briese.DavidB[CIC]		; Paula Brisotto
<	Neville.DavidH[OS	C]	
	u; Cathie Allen	; Justin Howes	
<	>;	Kirsten Scott	
<	>;		
Cc: Supt FSG <	@g		

Subject: Updated: SAIK working group Minutes 07.12.2021

Please find attached the UPDATED draft minutes from the SAIK working group on 07.12.2021 as requested by QH.

These are draft minutes, if there are any changes please let me know before 13/12/2021 otherwise we will consider these as final for the next meeting.

The next meeting will be held at 11am on 15.12.2021

Kind Regards,



A/Sergeant 3 Support Office Office of the Superintendent Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command Queensland Police Service



Our values are at the core of who we are and what we do each day

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Monday, 13 December 2021 10:26 Lara Keller Support Officer FSG[OSC] RE: Updated: SAIK working group Minutes 07.12.2021

# OFFICIAL

Hi Lara

I have held a meeting with my staff this morning to go through the minutes and the feedback from all stakeholders. There seems to be varied recollections of what has been said and agreed to, but I do understand that there warrants further discussion about what is and isn't agreed to.

I have made the decision to include everyone's feedback in the minutes as it is now so we can discuss further at the next meeting and each agency can make a decision as to the position they hold or whether we need to explore further.

For accuracy I will also cause the next meeting to be digitally recorded so the minutes will a 100% accurate interpretation.

D

 Dale Frieberg APM

 Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service |

OFFICIAL

From: Lara Keller < Sent: Monday, 13 December 2021 05:22 To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] < Subject: FW: Updated: SAIK working group Minutes 07.12.2021

**CAUTION:** This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

## Good morning Dale

In the spirit of collaboration, and as the Chair, could you please reconsider these minutes? We are only starting the process of discussing how SAIKs will be managed in the future, and we have not agreed to changes at this time. Last week I sent proposed amendments to Jade, however my comments have just been added to the initial statements.

Thanks in advance, Kind regards Lara

From: Support Officer FSG[OSC Sent: Friday, 10 December 202	-		
To: Townsend.NicoleA[OSC]		; McCarthy.DuncanJ[OSC]	J
Hoffman.CarolynP[OSC]		Bushell.PeterA[COVCOM]	
	Briese.DavidB[CIC]	F	Paula Brisotto
<	Neville.DavidH[OSC]		Lara Keller
	Cathie Allen	Justin Howe	S
	Jacqui Thomson	Ki	irsten Scott
-	Adam Griffin <		
Cc: Supt ESG			

Subject: Updated: SAIK working group Minutes 07.12.2021

This email originated from outside Queensland Health. DO NOT click on any links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Please find attached the UPDATED draft minutes from the SAIK working group on 07.12.2021 as requested by QH.

These are draft minutes, if there are any changes please let me know before 13/12/2021 otherwise we will consider these as final for the next meeting.

The next meeting will be held at 11am on 15.12.2021

Kind Regards,



A/Sergeant Support Office Office of the Superintendent Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command Queensland Police Service



Our values are at the core of who we are and what we do each day

### \*\*\*\*\*\*

Disclaimer: This email and any attachments may contain legally privileged or confidential information and may be protected by copyright. You must not use or disclose them other than for the purposes for which they were supplied. The privilege or confidentiality attached to this message and attachments is not waived by reason of mistaken delivery to you. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not use, disclose, retain, forward or reproduce this message or any attachments. If you receive this message in error, please notify the sender by return email or telephone and destroy and delete all copies. Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

Queensland Health carries out monitoring, scanning and blocking of emails and attachments sent from or to addresses within Queensland Health for the purposes of operating, protecting, maintaining and ensuring appropriate use of its computer network.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Tuesday, 14 December 2021 09:20 Support Officer FSG[OSC]; Cathie Allen Supt FSG RE: Updated: SAIK working group Minutes 07.12.2021

# OFFICIAL

Thanks Cathie.

 Dale Frieberg APM

 Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Queensland Police Service |

# OFFICIAL

 From: Support Officer FSG[OSC]

 Sent: Tuesday, 14 December 2021 09:06

 To: Cathie Allen

 Cc: Supt FSG

 Subject: RE: Updated: SAIK working group Minutes 07.12.2021

Cathie,

This has been amended as requested.

Kind Regards,



A/Sergeant Support Office Office of the Superintendent Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command Queensland Police Service



# Our values are at the core of who we are and what we do each day

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Monday, 13 December 2021 17:42 To: Support Officer FSG[OSC] Cc: Lara Keller < > Subject: RE: Updated: SAIK working group Minutes 07.12.2021

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of Queensland Police Service. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

# Hi Jade

Could you please amend the minutes for section 2.3. Under this section, I (CA) am attributed to the statement 'however there are only approx. 2.5% annually'. I advised that buccal cells are the preferred, however I did not say the remainder of this sentence during the meeting, another police officer advised the attendees of this percentage. To ensure the minutes are correct in their attributions, could this be attributed to the correct police officer.

# Cheers

Cathie



## Cathie Allen BSc, MSc (Forensic Science) (She/Her\*) Managing Scientist

Social Chair, Organising Committee for 25th International Symposium of the Australian and New Zealand Forensic Science Society (ANZFSS), Brisbane, 11 – 15 Sept 2022

### Police Services Stream, Forensic & Scientific Services Prevention Division, Queensland Health

p a 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 e w www.health.qld.gov.au/fss

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*If you're wondering about the use of pronouns She/Her on this signature block, I encourage you to read some resources available here



From: Support Officer FSG[C Sent: Friday, 10 December 2	•	
To:		; McCarthy.DuncanJ[OSC]
	pplick.KennethA[0	DSC]
Hoffman.CarolynP[OSC]		; Bushell.PeterA[COVCOM]
	; Briese.DavidB[CIC]	aula Brisotto
	; Neville.DavidH[OSC	Lara Keller
	; Cathie Allen	; Justin Howes
	; Jacqui Thomson	; Kirsten Scott
	; Adam Griffin	
Cc: Sunt ESG <		

Subject: Updated: SAIK working group Minutes 07.12.2021

This email originated from outside Queensland Health. DO NOT click on any links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe.

Please find attached the UPDATED draft minutes from the SAIK working group on 07.12.2021 as requested by QH.

These are draft minutes, if there are any changes please let me know before 13/12/2021 otherwise we will consider these as final for the next meeting.

The next meeting will be held at 11am on 15.12.2021

Kind Regards,



A/Sergeant Support Office Office of the Superintendent Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command Queensland Police Service



Our values are at the core of who we are and what we do each day

### 

Disclaimer: This email and any attachments may contain legally privileged or confidential information and may be protected by copyright. You must not use or disclose them other than for the purposes for which they were supplied. The privilege or confidentiality attached to this message and attachments is not waived by reason of mistaken delivery to you. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not use, disclose, retain, forward or reproduce this message or any attachments. If you receive this message in error, please notify the sender by return email or telephone and destroy and delete all copies. Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

Queensland Health carries out monitoring, scanning and blocking of emails and attachments sent from or to addresses within Queensland Health for the purposes of operating, protecting, maintaining and ensuring appropriate use of its computer network.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*



3**\_1** 



Lay.

# QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE

# **SAIK Working Group**

# AGENDA

# Meeting Date: 07/12/2021

QU2 1

(year)

Location: Office of Superintendent, Forensic Services Group, Level 4, PHQ and Microsoft Teams 10:30am ~ 11:30am

Chair: Superintendent Dale Frieberg

### Attendees:

Time:

Inspector David Neville, FSG Acting Inspector Peter Bushell, FSG Inspector David Briese, CIC Sergeant Fabian Colless, CIC Sergeant Carolyn Hoffman, FSG

Acting E/Director Lara Keller, QLD Health Cathie Allen, QLD Health Justin Howes, QLD Health Jacqui Thomson, QLD Health Kirsten Scott, QLD Health

### Apologies

Senior Sergeant Nicole Townsend, FSG Inspector Duncan McCarthy, FSG

Dr Adam Griffin, QLD Health

	ltem	Responsible
1,0	Welchme and Applogies	
1.1	Opening and Welcome	Chair
1.2	Apologies	Chair
	Inspector Duncan McCarthy, FSG	
	<ul> <li>Senior Sergeant Nicole Townsend, FSG</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Dr Adam Griffin, QLD Health</li> </ul>	
2.0	General Business	
2.1	Qld Government Interagency Guidelines	All
	Compliance with the 2014 Qld Government Interagency Guidelines	
2.2	Responsibility of collecting reference samples	All
	The reference sample to be taken on behalf of the victim by medical	
	personnel during the Forensic Medical Examination (FME) so that the	
	victim is only exposed to the one invasive procedure	
2.3	SAIK and Reference Sample procedures – explanation to victim.	All
	The explanation of the SAIK and the reference sample to be conducted	
	by support services/counsellors to alleviate two separate explanations	
	of procedures	
2.4	Packaging of the SAIK/reference sample	All
	Packaging of the SAIK/reference sample would be best held with	
	Health – similar to NSW where the reference sample is attached but	
	separate to the kit – similar to an invoice on a package. Alleviates	
	contamination as not in the one package and ensures both samples	
	remain together.	
2.5	The management of the exhibit (SAIK/reference sample)	All
	The management of the exhibit would be best discussed by Health	
	and Insp Neville. Do QPS need to be involved? Can this go direct from	
	the examination to analysis? Similar to the Just in Case Kits managed	
	by Health. If QPS don't get involved, then this has the ability to 🌸	
	expedite the analysis by days and days.	
340	Otifer Bosiness	
3.1		All

(year)		
DATE	PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED	117.11
ng mananan mengeringga ana kang Palagan mengering Salaman dari kang di kang pangan kang pangan kang pangan meng		
2-2	Responsibility of collecting reference	
	samples	
1 2-1.	OPP. Lodd Lullu	1990
1-2-	adam grupi - graup	
	adam gruppi - graup concented any complainty	
1/1	and any arrepaint	
0	Status of document	and the
	/	and the state
+ Ye		
+	oct for ruleien ennently	
- M		
	CFMU. Jacqui Shomoon	A.
	- doesn't lectique any unit	
	collecting reference hamper	
	at same time	
	Education / comms.	
and the second	Canation ( Carrieris.	
and an		
an allen and the second		
-Million (%) (See an painteen (%) (La real)) (See and (%) (La real))		

2021. 275 (year) DATE PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED ÷ Paula/ Kusten DNA Lam suale KHE I used CVD 11 Mel-sample lu omeríavous could oral sugar - Cape uk 50 V lefogr ie-erload -Blocd - police DNA - dupunt ON. laand ling clauty of ry sample - uliques mary le Rall alle negate cashe allen. lucke samples oray 2 ulood. Sex

DATE	PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED
	Juotini other jurisdictions.
	WA - same av Old. - hef. vample taken another acapro O
	others - same time
	gacqui. SAIN fieged.
	current phogram.
2.4	
hui-	who is geing to pay for FTA, a payment. couds
	QPS inverted for surry ref.
	600 or 700 SATK KATS out

WIT.0035.0001.0215

Lancodes no morgen relde to le proceided. FR. dues QPS much unsilverty autopiou ð FTT9'S /B. pwales. renauces 20 PH Kite Paula. I need to consider packaging to ensure separation. FTA cardo - Jean Jenny Stanage EWABS - freeges. =TKIts. VSW Catric' Separatio U 7 How KIT LOSp. -> OH Cathie

avud! . 278 (year) DATE PARTICULARS OF DUTY AND PLACES VISITED (atu continuity of undencer  ${}^{\star}$ 1 JRE'S. quid is case Kits) ilio niskis. ADX meeting FLOW CHART. Junino of ten list that nico Lanore Cathie. SOX RH. costing relein. minutes to le distributed and X action item. - next meeting 15/12/21
# EXHIBIT 37



### QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE

## SAIK Working Group

# AGENDA

Meeting Date: 15/12/2021 Location: Office of Superintendent, Forensic Services Group, Level 4, PHQ and Microsoft Teams Time: 11:00am - 12:00pm Chair: Superintendent Dale Frieberg Invitees: Inspector David Neville, FSG (DN) Acting E/Director Lara Keller, QLD Health (LK) Acting Inspector Peter Bushell, FSG (PB) Cathie Allen, QLD Health (CA) Inspector David Briese, CIC (DB) Justin Howes, QLD Health (JH) Sergeant Carolyn Hoffman, FSG (CH) Jacqui Thomson, QLD Health (JT) Paula Brisotto, QH (PBO) Kirsten Scott, QLD Health (KS) Dr Adam Griffin, QLD Health Senior Sergeant Nicole Townsend, FSG Sergeant Fabian Colless, CIC

### Apologies

Inspector Duncan McCarthy, FSG

	Item	Responsible	Action Items
1.0	Welcome and Apologies		
1.1	Opening and Welcome	Chair	
1.2	Apologies	Chair	
	<ul> <li>Inspector Duncan McCarthy, FSG</li> </ul>		
2.0	General Business		
2.1	<b>Qld Government Interagency Guidelines</b> Compliance with the 2014 Qld Government Interagency Guidelines	All	
	<ul> <li>LK - report from Dr Adam Griffin on:</li> <li>date his committee met</li> <li>the status of the document</li> <li>is there a review required?</li> <li>Deadline for feedback</li> <li>any Action items from this meeting committee</li> </ul>		
2.2	Responsibility of collecting reference samples The reference sample to be taken on behalf of the victim by medical personnel during the Forensic Medical Examination (FME) so that the victim is only exposed to the one invasive procedure Discuss and agree on who will complete	All	
n	collection of sample? Discuss who will conduct integrated education in each organisation and come to an agreement.		



# QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE



# SAIK Working Group

2.3	<ul> <li>SAIK and Reference Sample procedures – explanation to victim.</li> <li>The explanation of the SAIK and the reference sample to be conducted by support services/counsellors to alleviate two separate explanations of procedures</li> <li>Discussion on Buccal cell samples to FTA.</li> <li>Previously notes that there would only be approx. 8 samples for blood (approx. 2.5% annually).</li> <li>What is QLD Health's position?</li> <li>What is QPS position?</li> <li>Can the current training program have the new agreed procedure integrated?</li> </ul>	All	
2.4	Packaging of the SAIK/reference sample Packaging of the SAIK/reference sample would be best held with Health – similar to NSW where the reference sample is attached but separate to the kit – similar to an invoice on a package. Alleviates contamination as not in the one package and ensures both samples remain together. Discussion & agreement to be made on changing the packaging of current sample	All	
	CH – Provide budget estimate for 700 x FTA production CA (QH) and PB (QPS) – What this looks like in NSW (dual kit) and bring back an example JH – Follow up provide information on who takes follow up second sample at the later time?		
2.5	The management of the exhibit (SAIK/reference sample) The management of the exhibit would be best discussed by Health and Insp Neville. Do QPS	All	

SAIK Working Group – 07/12/2021



## QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE



# SAIK Working Group

	need to be involved? Can this go direct from the examination to analysis? Similar to the Just in Case Kits managed by Health. If QPS don't get involved, then this has the ability to expedite the analysis by days and days. CA – To report on a solution for kit/continuity (transportation to QH)?		
	Discussion - QH to provide a flow chart of current and proposed procedure		
NAME AND A REAL PROPERTY AND A	Discussion - QPS (DN) to provide a flow chart of current and proposed procedure		
3.0	Other Business		
3.1	CA – Review of the Sex Kit and costings.	All	
4.0	Meeting Finalisation		
4.1	Next Meeting		
4.2	Close		

Meeting Date:	15/12/2021		
Location:	Office of Superintendent, Forensic	: Services Group, Learning and Microsoft Teams	
Time:	11:00am – 12:00pm		
Chair:	Superintendent Dale Frieberg		
Invitees:			
Inspector Davi	id Neville, FSG (DN)	Acting E/Director Lara Keller, QLD Health (LK)	
Acting Inspector Peter Bushell, FSG (PB)		Cathie Allen, QLD Health (CA)	
Inspector David Briese, CIC (DB)		Justin Howes, QLD Health (JH)	
Sergeant Caro	lyn Hoffman, FSG (CH)	Jacqui Thomson, QLD Health (JT)	
Paula Brisotto	, QH (PBO)	Kirsten Scott, QLD Health (KS)	
Dr Adam Griffin, QLD Health (AG)		Sergeant Fabian Colless, CIC (FC)	

#### Apologies

Inspector Duncan McCarthy, FSG

Senior Sergeant Nicole Townsend, FSG (NT)

Supt Dale Frieberg APM (DF)

DF - I guess Dave can just join us when he is available, so thank you everyone, again for joining us to discuss further the SAIK kits and how we are going to look to do business moving forward. First of all, I know that there was probably a little bit of contention over the minutes from the last meeting so I have made the decision just to leave the comments as they are, as they came in, obviously different people have different recollections about what was said or not said, so I will go around the room and if anyone wants to make any comment about that then we'll certainly make note of it and if there is any clarification we need to go through then we'll do that but, I have just made the executive decision that in order to make sure the minutes are correct moving forward that we will record them electronically and we will provide you with a copy of those, or I can provide them to Lara to distribute.

LK - thank you

DF - So if everyone is happy with that

LK - thank you yeh

DF - So apologies from our end, from Duncan McCarthy and we've been able to have Nicole Townsend join us on this occasion, it was good that she could make it, she couldn't make the last

meeting. I think Sgt Fabian COLLESS, he's online, that's great. So I guess Lara, do you want us to to go through each of those items for discussion from the last meeting or do we just want to have a general discussion about those?

LK – So I guess from our perspective, you know we did have some amendments to the minutes, but I do note that they were added on, so they kind of read as differing views on the same topic in some areas. I do note though that you had said that we would discuss at the next meeting and for each agency to put forward their position and I also note on the agenda for today that there is the opportunity to document that so, you know, I guess, moving forward, this is probably our preferred approach, to document each sides position and minute that.

DF – Ok. So we may as well just start with the first which is the 2.1. I don't think that there was anything really contentious in that agenda item from the last occasion, so, are we all in agreeance with that actually staying the same as it reads? (All agreed) Yep. Ok, 2.2 the responsibility for collecting reference samples so just a discussion I suppose on the completion, obviously something like this will be a work in progress and I know that there are some differing views about whose responsibility that is. I guess again from the last meeting the conversation around doing what's right I guess for the victim in the circumstances so we can alleviate some of the trauma for them moving forward. Does anyone want to make any comment about that? (Pause) Nope, ok. The SAIK and reference-

LK – Sorry, Adam has got his hand up

DF-Oh.

AG - Sorry about that. I was just trying to work out where the complaint came from?

**DF** – There's no complaint, it's been something that we've identified from the Queensland Police Service around the need for, in accordance with the guidelines, that are currently in place, just to make sure that we are victim centric and that we try and you know for their purposes, not have

Police, you know, 7 days later, knock on the door to take a reference sample. So, there wasn't any particular complaint, but I might let Peter talk.

PB – No, there wasn't a complaint Doctor. I think what realistically what we want to do is honour the guidelines from our perspective. In relation to taking the reference sample as part of the forensic medical examination and in that way we can condense two procedures into the one, and also it alleviates the fact that Police have to explain the process of the reference sample, and whilst QH staff explain the process of the SAIK so we can combine the two explanations together so to reduce the exposure for the victim.

AG – Ok. So, it's not a complaint and there has been no victim issues but this reference sampling which you do which is routine across the state and several hundred times a week is now a traumatic experience?

**PB** – Like I said Doctor, we just wanted to conform with respect to the guidelines, those guidelines were-

AG – So the guidelines are actually in error. I mean, it's not actually a requirement to be done and certainly there is no pathway so if we were to look at it from a global perspective the training and delivery of DNA reference sampling is standard Police procedure for anything including and beyond sexual assault. So this is an addition to a pathway that currently isn't in existence and in essence the backup of it seems to be that there is a concern that Police are traumatizing people. So I can't actually see it, we don't have a measurable there, we haven't got a viewpoint problem where it is an issue because otherwise you are still collecting a reference sampling across the board for various victims for various crimes then you are traumatizing them, I don't see that –

PB - I don't think we are necessarily traumatizing them, what we're doing is we're trying to reduce the fact that victims are not exposed to two actual processes that it would be a better way moving forward in conjunction with other states, now last week we were all in agreeance that that would rest with the forensic nurses or medical practitioners –

AG – Apologies, I wasn't at the meeting and I wasn't necessarily aware that that had been agreement. The actual basis of reference sampling as a standard, I am not particularly interested in what other states are doing, I am probably interested in just doing it properly. And are we comparing other geographically challenged states or are we just comparing states that are centrally located and centrally managed.

PB – I think both

DN - yeh

AG - So WA obviously there is a mixture isn't there?

PB - There is, yes.

AG – yeh, and so the really the part that we're talking about here is the development of something new that Police are concerned that they maybe traumatising a patient.

DN – Isn't just returning to the pathway that we used to have, my understanding was that prior to sometime in the 2000's it was a process and we've changed it now to police taking it, and yes Police do take DNA from people as a matter of course, our preference wouldn't be to take DNA from victims and to limit that. Obviously from offenders, yes we do for obvious reasons because we're exercising a police power but when you're a victim of a sexual assault and all of a sudden you have authorities taking your DNA from you as well it comes a lot more stressed with police taking dna from you then medicos because there is concern on how police will use that. And we don't exercise any powers to take it at that time. So, it is victim centric making sure that the person who potentially is very traumatized because sexual assault is unlike other offences and to make sure that it is done in a way that minimises any additional stress on the victim, so that's all we're seeking.

WIT.0035.0001.0224

#### Transcription SAIK Working Group at 11 am on 15.12.2021

AG – Yep, so we have come up with some communication strategies if that's an issue but primarily you talk that it was a historic issue and its historic now and Police were actually analysing reference samples and it was separately packaged and sent with the older documentation, so you've got that was certainly a clear issue. I guess we've got to look at it from a practical perspective here too. We have people who are currently trained who are quite effectively performing the work and there has been no issue or complaint directly from it but more that there is a perceived issue. The perceived issue comes with a management issue to train and change pathways and add to kits which all add up to a very large expense both immediately and ongoing. I think with all honesty I think this has to be fleshed out as a much more policy document before we actually even start talking about it in this way and what I don't have in front of me is a policy document, what I have in front of me is an agenda and it actually looks more like a cost shifting agenda at the moment then it does a service centric agenda so you would probably be best if we looked at this more broadly as a significant policy change and we can reflect on those various issues and (inaudible) and consult out as well to support groups that are providing support to victims. If the expense there has to be shifted across from QPS to health then the way that that expense will come across is not going to be very friendly to QPS and you can appreciate the time and training it takes to train a clinician is significantly more expensive because you're already doing it within QPS, you're already training because you're already going to have to collect (inaudible) and so in essence it's guite a large expense that we're doing it and I don't necessarily think there is going to be a path forward by discussing this as a concept alone when there is actually guite a few layers to what is involved. At the moment we are close to training approximately 200 or more people we would have to bring back to retrain to explain the process of reference sampling and that's an expensive process and its one where we got to try and achieve 100% across the board. If we're going to look at what was going to work for the laboratory processes as well I will very much let Cathie speak to these but again we're going to need a discrete process I would suggest to ensure that there is no risk to contaminating or ruining the sample. And I think that that would really the victim centric approach is actually making sure that there is the one procedure that they go through is uninterrupted and unlikely to lead to an error so it has to be a discrete process. So there is a few issues here. I don't see this as a straight forward thing as it's being expressed at all, because we have an existing body of examiners which are already trained in the collection of DNA. Yeh, sorry, Dave has his hand up.

DN - So back to your point about your policy the reason we're at this point is that there is a policy and I don't agree it is in error. It's pretty clear in the policy that there is a recommendation that the sample be taken by the medical examiner at the time of the examination and it is for that reason we

try and limit the trauma to the victim. We're not trying to shift costs back to QLD Health (QH) in fact the testing, we're in agreement that we would continue to pay for the person testing and we've even gone to the extent that whatever the consumables are, we're happy to provide those to QH for the preparation of the kits, and in terms of the training of medical experts, the collection of the reference sample is not a difficult process, it's quite straight forward and I don't envisage you would need to bring staff to have face to face training to provide that. And in terms of the potential contamination of it there is a much higher risk contaminating the crime scene samples taken from the intimate areas then there is of the reference sample and you will know straight away from the reference sample if it is contaminated because there will be more than one profile and as far as the buccal swab potentially contaminating all of the samples, the crime scene samples, everyone of those sample I would expect to have the victims DNA in it anyway because of where they were taken from, so that is how perspective on it. So, yeh. And just the policy that was referred to was something that was signed by all the parties in 2014 or something so –

AG - Yeh, so, co-author of them, I am fully aware of the (inaudible) -

**DB** – So, Adam if you're the co-author of them, and I've just joined in but I, Dave Neville probably put it the best way and in a lot better way then I was about to because I got to be honest, when you say this thing is just a cost shifting exercise I am quite offended by that because it certainly isn't, it's trying to get you guys, as in health, to do what you signed back in 2014 and like you're supposed to be doing, to make sure that we're being victim centric here. So if you're saying that you're the coauthor, why hasn't that been done, why isn't it being done and why are there so many blockers as you've just outlined to you doing it, because mate, policies there-

AG - But (inaudible)

**DB** – Hang on, hang on, woah, woah, Policies there, we're taking on a number of the costs already, and the training is minimal if required. We're talking about doctors and experienced nurses who examine all parts of the body but you're saying that there's going to be this massive training required for everyone because they have to stick a buccal swab in a victims mouth at the same time as they're undergoing other examinations. None of that adds up to me, I'm not a doctor, I don't pretend to be,

but to me its not a shift, not a cost shifting exercise from our side it's a duty shifting exercise on your side. So back to my original question is, why is it that back in 2014 you co-authored this document but it hasn't been done?

AG -yes, it is a typographical area, so it should say "not" because there was no actual capacity within the kit to do so. And that was the reason for it being there. So not sure when it changed from "not" but obviously it got overlooked as it went through and that's why it actually hasn't been in place or wasn't in place then. The only time it was in place was back in the very old kits and that had the separate document and things were actually going through to the Police DNA laboratory for analysis, which is of course, some decades ago. Though the actual capacity capability of the kit wasn't there so whilst it's based that we do want to actually create and make sure its there. I agree there is capability of people to collect reference samples but no, to suggest it doesn't have to be training is naïve. The actual packaging is separate utility of it and also when you can't collect it and if you are going to collect it and use FTA paperwork which I understand is the preferred process well that's the difference (inaudible) it is quite discrete so it's possible... it's naïve to think that no training is to be required.

DB-No, I'm not saying no training is be required-

AG-Yeh

DB - l'm not saying no training will be required because if coppers can learn in one day then medical practitioners who do this for a living can learn within an hour or two I would imagine.

AG — we are not going to get everybody together in one day (inaudible) Jacqui, sorry, you got your hand up?

JT - Sorry, I understand that the policy document, the guideline that we're referring to was created in 2014 and we're some 6 years down the track, I'm imagining (inaudible) not sure what the review for such a document, do we know what the time frame is for a review?

AG – Thanks Jacqui, yeh it is actually currently under review. We have about 12 months because we're pending the integration of the paediatric component from the Royal Commission. That's actually the main stay of what's stopping a review going forward. I have not heard from where that is, but that seems to be the main stop so it's going to be a uniform document that basically adult and paediatric response.

CH – If the FTA sampling is part of what's causing the hesitation that's just our agreement to work in with the lab preference because it's my understanding the buccal cells are the labs preference for a reference sample. Whereas, as you're aware it used to be blood tube but the FTA card for the buccal cells was just, so long as we get a victim reference sample we don't mind how that's done, the FTA cards which is what we were discussing here was just us working in with the lab preference. So, if you're saying for your doctors and nurses that it would be easier to take a blood sample and that would not require all the testing that you're suggesting then perhaps the blood is the way to go. But obviously that causes a problem at the lab.

AG – No, why would do we want to go stick needles in people if we're not sticking needles in them so that's possibly more of a point. No, I just think at the moment we're looking, like, I would like some more flesh before we're actually informing our policy and process and to spend money on this sort of thing and we need to actually look at how it's being done and make sure that it's an appropriate expenditure of funds and efforts. At this stage this is not emergent and as far as I can see we're not responding to a particular issue we're not changing the police training who will continue to understand how to collect DNA. We're looking at implementing a different process across kits both historic and before they actually go out now and a look at the training behind it. A substantial effort is actually going to be required from a small group of clinicians to train the larger body. I do have some hesitation in seeing it and really looking at how its supposed to be a harm, but so at the moment if we're looking at the policy document saying that this is the argument the policy document doesn't reflect the practice unfortunately and it's an unfortunate typographical error and if it's the basis for the policy-

DN - (inaudible) from our perspective -

**DB** – How about reflect the policy? How about reflect it and actually see its go nothing to do with you're saying its going to be so much more work for you, its more work for us too, yeh it reduces the time that we have to go three days later and do this but we need to put kits together, we need to assist with that, we've been working on it for some time now as a working party to come up with the best way to do this for us and for health but you know what. This isn't about health and it's not about the cost, its about the victim and what it seems to me is that for yourself Adam its about Health, its not about the victim, the victim comes second and you know I could say with all due respect that's how it seems to me. We are trying to make it better and more victim centric, you are creating barriers as to why we can't.

AG – That's not necessarily the case at all. Because what we have, you've described something as a notion, you've described something as (inaudible) –

DB - It's not a notion mate, it's done in every other state bar QLD and possibly one other. It's not a notion. It's something that you signed off on and is done in other areas.

AG – We've discussed that already. What we're actually looking to is the impetus for changing a process that has yet not received any complaints or concerns, that the police engagement is traumatic. It is something that is obviously something that must occur in other situations when you're collecting DNA from individuals (inaudible)

DF - I really don't -

**DB** – we take DNA off (inaudible)

**DF** – Dave, I really don't think, we're not getting anywhere having this discussion but I guess the things is that at the end of the day, there is a very big spotlight on sexual assaults, domestic violence and so on and so forth in relation to females and victims at this particular time, so I'm just thinking it look, I really don't think at this particular time we're moving forward at all I'm mindful we've all got members who are involved in the Women's Safety and Justice Taskforce. I think that this will become

something that will be - Something that the light, the spotlight will be shone on at some particular stage in relation to the sexual assault of victims and the taking of DNA. So if we need to go back and we need to have further discussions in our own agencies about the position I am happy to raise it up to my AC and Deputy and maybe the discussions should be happening at a higher level.

AG – Agree

PB – I completely agree. I cannot see how that would not be best practice moving forward into the future, in line with other states, in line with the guideline itself, I am at a loss. I completely agree with the Supt it can get addressed up our Commissioner has a very invested interest in it, along with her Deputies and Assistant Commissioners. So I agree with the Supt, we should raise that up.

NT – I don't think something needs to be complaint driven to show that it's traumatic either. I'm miffed about that, you know, the victims wouldn't have a process of making a complaint about the process anyway, I think its just a given that being dealt with twice is going to be more traumatic, I think anyone can see that.

DF – Alright, well look, I think, look we'll certainly take on board what you've said Doctor and we'll share that around, I really don't think we're progressing any further, obviously you've got a certain view in relation to this and I think there needs to be certain consultation perhaps from our level, at a higher level, so I'll take what you've said on board and I will raise it up to my AC and maybe they can have some conversations with Lara (Lara Keller) in the first instance and we can go from there.

#### ALL – All Agreed

DF – the time is 11:31 and we'll cease the meeting there. Thank you everyone for joining in today and I guess if you've got anything that you do wish to raise up to Lara, by all means please do that and we'll do that on our side and we'll take it up to a higher level to have those discussions on how we move forward.

PB – Thank you

DF – Thank you

DB – Thanks Super

-----MEETING RECORDING ENDED------

## ACTION ITEM

QLD Health - Raise up any concerns/issues regarding the SAIK and the meeting on 15.12.2021

QPS – Raise up issues/concerns discussed and suggestions on a way to move forward with AC and Deputy.

Next meeting TBA

# EXHIBIT 38

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:
Sent:
To:
Subject:

Taylor.EwenN[OSC] Friday, 20 April 2018 07:07 Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] RE: Issue with PP21 kit

Morning Boss,

Although we don't need to make any changes (*Samples will continue to be collected and delivered*) once this delay stretches out past a week, we may start to notice a delay in results. We will certainly take a hit in results once the matter is resolved and the stockpile comes through to our office. I will send something out to the good Inspectors if the matter is not resolved today.

Kind Regards,

I'm trying to get a gold of Adrian to see if he needs a hand with this latest job. Poor bugger.



Ewen TAYLOR Acting Inspector DNA Management Unit | Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE

Phone Email Address

From: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Sent: Thursday, 19 April 2018 4:55 PM To: Taylor.EwenN[OSC] Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Ewen,

Is this something we need to share with our Mgt team at FSG?

Dale Frieberg Superintendent Operations Commander Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command Queensland Police Service



From: Cathie Allen	[]
Sent: Thursday, 19 April 2018 9:29 AM	
To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <	>; Taylor.EwenN[OSC]
Cc: Paul Csohan	

Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have received the new lot of PP21 kits and have tested them. Unfortunately, this new lot does not resolve the issue for the 2 loci not amplifying properly. We will continue to investigate and work with the manufacturer on supplying us with a different lot number.

We will not re-commence routine processing of crime scene samples at this stage. We will continue to process urgent samples – for court purposes or ongoing investigations.

I will provide you with a further update when it comes to hand.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 17 April 2018 12:21 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the PP21 kits.

The new lot of PP21 kits have arrived at FSS and are currently being tested, with results known late this afternoon. If the test results show normal DNA profiles, tomorrow morning a batch of Volume Crime samples will be processed to ensure that crime scene samples profile appropriately. If this processes well, then processing of Major Crime samples will proceed from late Wednesday.

If the test process doesn't work appropriately, I will advise you asap.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

### Cheers Cathie



HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 13 April 2018 2:05 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: Issue with PP21 kit

A/Insp Ewen Taylor (

Hi Dale

We have identified an issue with the current lot number of PowerPlex 21 kit that is being used. The issue means that 2 loci (out of the 20 loci) are not amplifying properly, which affects the results and any associated work required in the statistical package, STRmix.

Urgent crime scene samples will be processed, however, we have ceased processing of routine crime scene samples with this lot, to ensure that we don't waste the sample as it's the only lot number we have available to us. This doesn't affect reference samples and they will continue to be processed.

We have contacted the manufacturer, who expects to ship us a new lot number on Monday, 16<sup>th</sup> of April, from Melbourne. Once we receive the new lot presumably on Tuesday afternoon, we anticipate verifying it overnight, with analysis of results on Wednesday morning. Once the new lot has been verified, routine testing of crime scene samples will re-commence.

I will keep you up to date on our progress and apologise for this inconvenience as I understand that it has an effect on the QPS' forensic work.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health



HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

This email, including any attachments sent with it, is confidential and for the sole use of the intended recipient(s). This confidentiality is not waived or lost, if you receive it and you are not the intended recipient(s), or if it is transmitted/received in error.

Any unauthorised use, alteration, disclosure, distribution or review of this email is strictly prohibited. The information contained in this email, including any attachment sent with it, may be subject to a statutory duty of confidentiality if it relates to health service matters.

If you are not the intended recipient(s), or if you have received this email in error, you are asked to immediately notify the sender by telephone collect on Australia +61 1800 198 175 or by return email. You should also delete this email, and any copies, from your computer system network and destroy any hard copies produced.

If not an intended recipient of this email, you must not copy, distribute or take any action(s) that relies on it; any form of disclosure, modification, distribution and/or publication of this email is also prohibited.

Although Queensland Health takes all reasonable steps to ensure this email does not contain malicious software, Queensland Health does not accept responsibility for the consequences if any person's computer inadvertently suffers any disruption to services, loss of information, harm or is infected with a virus, other malicious computer programme or code that may occur as a consequence of receiving this email.

Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Cathie Allen Friday, 20 April 2018 09:03 Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]; Taylor.EwenN[OSC] Paul Csoban FW: Issue with PP21 kit

#### Hi Dale

I just wanted to let you know that we've asked other jurisdictions if they've had the same issue with the PP21 kits and yesterday we were advised by one jurisdiction that they had also seen it. This indicates that the issue is kit based, rather than process or instrument based. We will continue to work with the manufacturer and I'll keep you updated as we progress.

### Cheers Cathie



### Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | 07 a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108

w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Thursday, 19 April 2018 9:29 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have received the new lot of PP21 kits and have tested them. Unfortunately, this new lot does not resolve the issue for the 2 loci not amplifying properly. We will continue to investigate and work with the manufacturer on supplying us with a different lot number.

We will not re-commence routine processing of crime scene samples at this stage. We will continue to process urgent samples – for court purposes or ongoing investigations.

I will provide you with a further update when it comes to hand.

Cheers

## Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health



HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 17 April 2018 12:21 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the PP21 kits.

The new lot of PP21 kits have arrived at FSS and are currently being tested, with results known late this afternoon. If the test results show normal DNA profiles, tomorrow morning a batch of Volume Crime samples will be processed to ensure that crime scene samples profile appropriately. If this processes well, then processing of Major Crime samples will proceed from late Wednesday.

If the test process doesn't work appropriately, I will advise you asap.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any guestions.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.qld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 13 April 2018 2:05 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: Issue with PP21 kit

A/Insp Ewen Taylor (

Hi Dale

We have identified an issue with the current lot number of PowerPlex 21 kit that is being used. The issue means that 2 loci (out of the 20 loci) are not amplifying properly, which affects the results and any associated work required in the statistical package, STRmix.

Urgent crime scene samples will be processed, however, we have ceased processing of routine crime scene samples with this lot, to ensure that we don't waste the sample as it's the only lot number we have available to us. This doesn't affect reference samples and they will continue to be processed.

We have contacted the manufacturer, who expects to ship us a new lot number on Monday, 16<sup>th</sup> of April, from Melbourne. Once we receive the new lot presumably on Tuesday afternoon, we anticipate verifying it overnight, with analysis of results on Wednesday morning. Once the new lot has been verified, routine testing of crime scene samples will re-commence.

I will keep you up to date on our progress and apologise for this inconvenience as I understand that it has an effect on the QPS' forensic work.

### Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health



HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

This email, including any attachments sent with it, is confidential and for the sole use of the intended recipient(s). This confidentiality is not waived or lost, if you receive it and you are not the intended recipient(s), or if it is transmitted/received in error.

Any unauthorised use, alteration, disclosure, distribution or review of this email is strictly prohibited. The information contained in this email, including any attachment sent with it, may be subject to a statutory duty of confidentiality if it relates to health service matters.

If you are not the intended recipient(s), or if you have received this email in error, you are asked to immediately notify the sender by telephone collect on Australia +61 1800 198 175 or by return email. You should also delete this email, and any copies, from your computer system network and destroy any hard copies produced.

If not an intended recipient of this email, you must not copy, distribute or take any action(s) that relies on it; any form of disclosure, modification, distribution and/or publication of this email is also prohibited.

Although Queensland Health takes all reasonable steps to ensure this email does not contain malicious software, Queensland Health does not accept responsibility for the consequences if any person's computer inadvertently suffers any disruption to services, loss of information, harm or is infected with a virus, other malicious computer programme or code that may occur as a consequence of receiving this email.

Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Cathie Allen < Tuesday, 24 April 2018 15:48 Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]; Taylor.EwenN[OSC] Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Justin Howes FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have received a new lot number and have tested it, unfortunately we are still experiencing the issue. We anticipate receiving a new lot number and a new batch number this Friday and will keep you advised of the testing.

In the meantime, Justin will work with A/Insp Taylor on some strategies on what samples are able to be reported in the meantime.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health



HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 20 April 2018 9:03 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

I just wanted to let you know that we've asked other jurisdictions if they've had the same issue with the PP21 kits and yesterday we were advised by one jurisdiction that they had also seen it. This indicates that the issue is kit based, rather than process or instrument based. We will continue to work with the manufacturer and I'll keep you updated as we progress.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream Forensic & Scientific Services,

Health Support Queensland, Department of Health



HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Thursday, 19 April 2018 9:29 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have received the new lot of PP21 kits and have tested them. Unfortunately, this new lot does not resolve the issue for the 2 loci not amplifying properly. We will continue to investigate and work with the manufacturer on supplying us with a different lot number.

We will not re-commence routine processing of crime scene samples at this stage. We will continue to process urgent samples – for court purposes or ongoing investigations.

I will provide you with a further update when it comes to hand.

Cheers Cathie



### Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | <u>www.health.gld.gov.au</u> e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 17 April 2018 12:21 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg ( Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the PP21 kits.

The new lot of PP21 kits have arrived at FSS and are currently being tested, with results known late this afternoon. If the test results show normal DNA profiles, tomorrow morning a batch of Volume Crime samples will be processed to ensure that crime scene samples profile appropriately. If this processes well, then processing of Major Crime samples will proceed from late Wednesday.

If the test process doesn't work appropriately, I will advise you asap.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | <u>www.health.gld.gov.au</u> e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 13 April 2018 2:05 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg ( Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: Issue with PP21 kit

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

We have identified an issue with the current lot number of PowerPlex 21 kit that is being used. The issue means that 2 loci (out of the 20 loci) are not amplifying properly, which affects the results and any associated work required in the statistical package, STRmix.

Urgent crime scene samples will be processed, however, we have ceased processing of routine crime scene samples with this lot, to ensure that we don't waste the sample as it's the only lot number we have available to us. This doesn't affect reference samples and they will continue to be processed.

We have contacted the manufacturer, who expects to ship us a new lot number on Monday, 16<sup>th</sup> of April, from Melbourne. Once we receive the new lot presumably on Tuesday afternoon, we anticipate verifying it overnight, with analysis of results on Wednesday morning. Once the new lot has been verified, routine testing of crime scene samples will re-commence.

I will keep you up to date on our progress and apologise for this inconvenience as I understand that it has an effect on the QPS' forensic work.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

 p

 a
 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108

 w
 www.health.gld.gov.au
 e

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

This email, including any attachments sent with it, is confidential and for the sole use of the intended recipient(s). This confidentiality is not waived or lost, if you receive it and you are not the intended recipient(s), or if it is transmitted/received in error.

Any unauthorised use, alteration, disclosure, distribution or review of this email is strictly prohibited. The information contained in this email, including any attachment sent with it, may be subject to a statutory duty of confidentiality if it relates to health service matters.

If you are not the intended recipient(s), or if you have received this email in error, you are asked to immediately notify the sender by telephone collect on Australia +61 1800 198 175 or by return email. You should also delete this email, and any copies, from your computer system network and destroy any hard copies produced.

If not an intended recipient of this email, you must not copy, distribute or take any action(s) that relies on it; any form of disclosure, modification, distribution and/or publication of this email is also prohibited.

Although Queensland Health takes all reasonable steps to ensure this email does not contain malicious software. Queensland Health does not accept responsibility for the consequences if any person's computer inadvertently suffers any disruption to services, loss of information, harm or is infected with a virus, other malicious computer programme or code that may occur as a consequence of receiving this email.

Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

\*\*\*\*\*

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Taylor.EwenN[OSC]
Sent:	Thursday, 26 April 2018 10:43
То:	Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]; Support Officer FSG; Pobar.DarrenJ[OSC]; Neville.DavidH[OSC];
	Keatinge.DavidJ[OSC]; Brock.AdrianC[OSC]; McKay.DonniP[OSC];
	Moseley.RussellJ[OSC]; Freeman.AdrianH[OSC]; Baker.PaulL[OSC]; Van
	Panhuis.Arthur[OSC]; Arthy.LloydF[OSC]; Koplick.KennethA[OSC];
	Stanley.AndrewR[OSC]
Cc:	Harris LibbyA[OSC]
Subject:	Issue with PP21 kits

Good morning ladies and gents,

FSS have completed testing the new PP21 lot numbers, and unfortunately they are still experiencing the same issue. I am advised that WA and NSW and experiencing varying degrees of the same problem. FSS are anticipating the arrival of a new lot number on Friday, with testing expected to be finalised early next week.

In the interim I have approved a trial process for single source volume crime profiles to be uploaded to NCIDD within a workflow that will mitigate risks and not affect the ability for profiles to be searched and linked.

I will advise once the issue is resolved.

Kind Regards,



Phone Email Address Ewen TAYLOR Acting Inspector DNA Management Unit | Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Cathie Allen < Friday, 4 May 2018 15:07 Taylor.EwenN[OSC]; Frieberg.DaleJ[PCAP] Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Justin Howes RE: Update 5: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Ewen

The interim workflow has been implemented and results that can be processed are being processed. Please liaise with Justin if you have any specific questions regarding this from a QPS perspective.

Amplifying the samples can be achieved very quickly, however other downstream processes will take resources and time, so whilst we anticipate higher than normal level of results being progressed to the QPS, we don't anticipate an avalanche once we can process again.

Cheers Cathie



pl

Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Taylor.EwenN[OSC] Sent: Friday, 4 May 2018 11:14 AM To: Cathie Allen; Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Cc: Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Justin Howes Subject: RE: Update 5: Issue with PP21 kit

Thanks for the advice Cathie,

Can you please advise how the interim work flow proposed by Justin is progressing? Once this issue is resolved, do we envisage a large sudden increase in released results?

Kind Regards,

Ewen TAYLOR

	Acting Inspector DNA Management Unit   Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE	
Phone Email Address	GPO Box 1440 Brisbane 4001	
From: Cathie Aller		
Sent: Friday, 4 Ma	y 2018 10:44 AM	
To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Taylor.EwenN[OSC]		
Cc: Paul Csoban <	; Paula Brisotto ; Justin	
Howes		
Subject: Update 5	: Issue with PP21 kit	

Hi Dale and Ewen

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the issue with the Promega PP21 kits that we and two other jurisdictions are experiencing.

We have tried three different lot numbers of the PP21 kit and the issue is still present. We have tried a Promega Fusion kit (this kit includes the 2 loci that we are experiencing issues with) and this kit also showed that the issue is present (presumably due to using the same primers in both PP21 and Fusion).

We've conducted an experiment, as requested by the American Manufacturer, however this showed the issue was still present, but assisted them with more information.

Today we will be conducting four experiments to provide the American Manufacturer with more information. Included in these experiments is a different instrument (to rule out instrumentation, although we believe it's unlikely that the instrument is the issue, testing will be conducted to rule it out) and a kit from a different manufacturer that includes the 2 problematic loci.

We have compiled all of the data that we've gathering from the different experiments that have been conducted and have not been able to detect a trend (ie it's not sample dependent, its not position on a run dependent etc).

We will continue working with the manufacturer on this issue. And we will continue to process urgent samples that are requested by the QPS or are required for Statements and Court matters.

The laboratory hasn't experienced an issue like this previously and we have liaised with our counterparts in other jurisdictions regarding this issue. I apologise for the impact that this has on the QPS and the community. We have allocated a large number of resources to this issue to resolve it as quickly as possible.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | <u>www.health.qld.qov.au</u> e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 24 April 2018 3:48 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Justin Howes Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have received a new lot number and have tested it, unfortunately we are still experiencing the issue. We anticipate receiving a new lot number and a new batch number this Friday and will keep you advised of the testing.

In the meantime, Justin will work with A/Insp Taylor on some strategies on what samples are able to be reported in the meantime.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 20 April 2018 9:03 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

I just wanted to let you know that we've asked other jurisdictions if they've had the same issue with the PP21 kits and yesterday we were advised by one jurisdiction that they had also seen it. This indicates that the issue is kit based, rather than process or instrument based. We will continue to work with the manufacturer and I'll keep you updated as we progress.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen
Sent: Thursday, 19 April 2018 9:29 AM
To: Supt Dale Frieberg
Cc: Paul Csoban
Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have received the new lot of PP21 kits and have tested them. Unfortunately, this new lot does not resolve the issue for the 2 loci not amplifying properly. We will continue to investigate and work with the manufacturer on supplying us with a different lot number.

We will not re-commence routine processing of crime scene samples at this stage. We will continue to process urgent samples – for court purposes or ongoing investigations.

I will provide you with a further update when it comes to hand.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 17 April 2018 12:21 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg A/Insp Ewen Taylor Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the PP21 kits.

The new lot of PP21 kits have arrived at FSS and are currently being tested, with results known late this afternoon. If the test results show normal DNA profiles, tomorrow morning a batch of Volume Crime samples will be processed to ensure that crime scene samples profile appropriately. If this processes well, then processing of Major Crime samples will proceed from late Wednesday.

If the test process doesn't work appropriately, I will advise you asap.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 13 April 2018 2:05 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: Issue with PP21 kit

A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

We have identified an issue with the current lot number of PowerPlex 21 kit that is being used. The issue means that 2 loci (out of the 20 loci) are not amplifying properly, which affects the results and any associated work required in the statistical package, STRmix.

Urgent crime scene samples will be processed, however, we have ceased processing of routine crime scene samples with this lot, to ensure that we don't waste the sample as it's the only lot number we have available to us. This doesn't affect reference samples and they will continue to be processed.

We have contacted the manufacturer, who expects to ship us a new lot number on Monday, 16<sup>th</sup> of April, from Melbourne. Once we receive the new lot presumably on Tuesday afternoon, we anticipate verifying it overnight, with analysis of results on Wednesday morning. Once the new lot has been verified, routine testing of crime scene samples will re-commence.

I will keep you up to date on our progress and apologise for this inconvenience as I understand that it has an effect on the QPS' forensic work.

Cheers Cathie



### **Cathie Allen**

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*\*\*\*\*

This email, including any attachments sent with it, is confidential and for the sole use of the intended recipient(s). This confidentiality is not waived or lost, if you receive it and you are not the intended recipient(s), or if it is transmitted/received in error.

Any unauthorised use, alteration, disclosure, distribution or review of this email is strictly prohibited. The information contained in this email, including any attachment sent with it, may be subject to a statutory duty of confidentiality if it relates to health service matters.

If you are not the intended recipient(s), or if you have received this email in error, you are asked to immediately notify the sender by telephone collect on Australia +61 1800 198 175 or by return email. You should also delete this email, and any copies, from your computer system network and destroy any hard copies produced.

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Taylor.EwenN[OSC]
Sent:	Friday, 11 May 2018 11:14
То:	Frieberg.DaleJ[PCAP]; Pobar.DarrenJ[OSC]; Neville.DavidH[OSC];
	Keatinge.DavidJ[OSC]; Brock.AdrianC[OSC]; McKay.DonniP[OSC];
	Moseley.RussellJ[OSC]; Freeman.AdrianH[OSC]; Baker.PaulL[OSC]; Van
	Panhuis.Arthur[OSC]; Arthy.LloydF[OSC]; Koplick.KennethA[OSC];
	Stanley.AndrewR[OSC]
Cc:	Support Officer FSG
Subject:	DNA Results

Ladies and Gents,

Just keeping you up to date with regards to the issue with the Promega PP21 kits.

Unfortunately the issue has still not been resolved. Other Australian jurisdictions using the PP21 kits are also experiencing the same issues (*Only those using GlobalFiler are unaffected*). FSS are still conducting a number of experiments as requested by the American manufacturer, and are obviously treating this issue with the most urgent priority and continue to liaise with their counterparts. FSS will continue to process urgent samples requested by the QPS or are required for Statement and Court matters.

I have approved a temporary interim workflow which is resulting on some single source volume crime results still being reported. We are in the process of determine whether this interim work flow will now include major crime.

I will keep you advised of any developments, hopefully this will be resolved soon.

Any questions please give me a call.

Kind Regards,



Ewen TAYLOR Acting Inspector DNA Management Unit | Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE

Phone Email Address

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Heit.KarenL[OSC]
Sent:	Wednesday, 16 May 2018 12:42
To:	Strategy and Performance Officer OSC
Cc:	Frieberg.DaleJ[PCAP]; Maguire.JennaL[OSC]
Subject:	FW: Update 6: Issue with PP21 kit

Dot points as requested.

# Karen Heit

Karen Heit | Sergeant | Support Officer | Office of the Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Operations Support Command | Queensland Police Service



From: Taylor.EwenN[OSC] Sent: Wednesday, 16 May 2018 12:26 PM To: Support Officer FSG Subject: RE: Update 6: Issue with PP21 kit

Good afternoon,

Please find below dot points with regards to the Promega PP21 kit issue.

Background. Pre-February 2018, Queensland Health used **PP21 kits** for Major crime (*Improved/more sensitive kits*), and **Profiler Plus** for Volume crime. Post Feb-2018, FSS consumed the last supplies of Profiler Plus throughout the world, and have adopted PP21 for all crime.

- 13<sup>th</sup> April, Forensic Scientific Services (FSS) identified an issue with the current lot of PowerPlex 21 (PP21) DNA kits.
- The issues means 2 loci (Out of the 20 loci) are not amplifying properly.
- Additional lots of current PP21 kits have been received from the American manufacturer, however the problem remains.
- FSS are working the issue in conjunction with the American Manufacturer.
- FSS have liaised with fellow Australian jurisdictions and established that those using PP21 are experiencing the same problems.
- The issue effects approximately 60% of samples.
- The only Australian jurisdictions unaffected are those using Globalfiler.
- The Inspector DNA Management Section (DMS) has negotiated a temporary work flow with FSS, where single source profiles for volume crime are being processed with temporary results released for intel.
- The temporary work flow cannot be used for 2 -3 person mix profiles, due to the complexity.

- FSS are treating the issue as their highest priority are addressing the most likely causes first (*Experimenting* with clean up kits, instruments, equipment, water, extraction processes etc).
- FSS are unable to provide any type of time frame as to when the issue will be resolved.

Risks.

- DNA Samples potentially linking serial offenders may be delayed until the issue is resolved.
- High Priority (Homicide) analysis may be delayed if sample extract is too low to risk re-amplification, until matter resolved. (*Risk of consuming all of the DNA sample for a process which may not work*)

### Solutions.

- The Inspector DMS is working closely with FSS to identify and prioritise high priority cases.
- Inspector DMS negotiating with FSS RE samples which present a risk of consuming the extract through additional re-works.
- FSS to consider additional government funding (So more samples can be examined now, and reworked if necessary at a later date)
- Representative from American manufacturer to attend FSS and assist with solving the issue.

I have attempted to use layman terms, please let me know if you require anything further.

Kind Regards,



Ewen TAYLOR Acting Inspector DNA Management Unit | Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE

Phone Email Address

From: Heit.KarenL[OSC] Sent: Wednesday, 16 May 2018 11:27 AM To: Taylor.EwenN[OSC] Cc: Maguire.JennaL[OSC] Subject: FW: Update 6: Issue with PP21 kit

Can you please draft dot points as requested below?

## Karen Heit

Karen Heit | Sergeant | Support Officer | Office of the Superintendent | Forensic Services Group | Operations Support Command | Queensland Police Service


From: Hahn.RichardJ[OSC] Sent: Wednesday, 16 May 2018 11:04 AM To: Supt FSG < Subject: FW: Update 6: Issue with PP21 kit

Super,

Can this issue be summarised in dot points for the DC please, with a focus on potential risks to the QPS?

Rgds and thanks

ŊН

Richard Hahn Inspector Strategy and Performance Operations Support Command Queensland Police Service



From: Dabinett.StephenJ[OSC] Sent: Wednesday, 16 May 2018 11:01 AM To: Hahn.RichardJ[OSC] Subject: RE: Update 6: Issue with PP21 kit

Richard, has this been briefed to Deputy and if not do we need to do some dot points up to provide a preliminary brief.

Steve Dabinett A/ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OPERATIONS SUPPORT COMMAND From: Hahn.RichardJ[OSC] Sent: Wednesday, 16 May 2018 10:51 AM To: Dabinett.StephenJ[OSC] Cc: McPhee.FionaM[OSC] Subject: FW: Update 6: Issue with PP21 kit

FYI

Richard Hahn Inspector Strategy and Performance Operations Support Command Queensland Police Service



From: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Sent: Wednesday, 16 May 2018 9:02 AM To: Strategy and Performance Officer OSC Cc: Support Officer FSG

; Taylor.EwenN[OSC]

Subject: FW: Update 6: Issue with PP21 kit

Richard,

I mentioned this at OSMG yesterday. Update received last night. We are monitoring this closely.

Dale,

Dale Frieberg Superintendent Operations Commander Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command Queensland Police Service



From: Cathie Allen		
Sent: Tuesday, 15 May 2018 5:56 P	M	
To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]	; Taylor.EwenN[C	ISC]
Cc: Lee Smythe	Paul Csoban	>; Paula Brisotto
	Kirsten Scott <	; Justin Howes
<	Michel Lok	
Subject: FW: Update 6: Issue with P	P21 kit	

Hi Dale and Ewen

I just wanted to provide you with an update on the issue with the PP21 kit.

We've conducted experiments, however we've found no evidence to suggest that any of the below have affected the PP21 process:

- Extraction method used in the lab
- Instruments used in the lab
- Water used in the lab

We are conducting further experiments in an attempt to rule out consumables that are used and could affect the PP21 process.

We are still working with the manufacturer on this issue and continuing to identify samples that are able to be processed, whilst ensuring that critical crime scene extract is not wasted unnecessarily.

We appreciate that this is affecting a number of cases, but are monitoring the court list and ensuring that samples are processed to meet court timeframes and any urgent requests made by the QPS.

Please let me know if there is further information that you'd like me to provide.

Cheers Cathie



# Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.qld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 4 May 2018 10:44 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban; 'Paula Brisotto'; 'Justin Howes' Subject: Update 5: Issue with PP21 kit

A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale and Ewen

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the issue with the Promega PP21 kits that we and two other jurisdictions are experiencing.

We have tried three different lot numbers of the PP21 kit and the issue is still present. We have tried a Promega Fusion kit (this kit includes the 2 loci that we are experiencing issues with) and this kit also showed that the issue is present (presumably due to using the same primers in both PP21 and Fusion).

We've conducted an experiment, as requested by the American Manufacturer, however this showed the issue was still present, but assisted them with more information.

Today we will be conducting four experiments to provide the American Manufacturer with more information. Included in these experiments is a different instrument (to rule out instrumentation, although we believe it's unlikely that the instrument is the issue, testing will be conducted to rule it out) and a kit from a different manufacturer that includes the 2 problematic loci.

We have compiled all of the data that we've gathering from the different experiments that have been conducted and have not been able to detect a trend (ie it's not sample dependent, its not position on a run dependent etc).

We will continue working with the manufacturer on this issue. And we will continue to process urgent samples that are requested by the QPS or are required for Statements and Court matters.

The laboratory hasn't experienced an issue like this previously and we have liaised with our counterparts in other jurisdictions regarding this issue. I apologise for the impact that this has on the QPS and the community. We have allocated a large number of resources to this issue to resolve it as quickly as possible.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services,

Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | \_\_\_\_\_\_a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w [www.health.gld.gov.au e ]

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 24 April 2018 3:48 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg ( Cc: Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Justin Howes Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

); A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

We have received a new lot number and have tested it, unfortunately we are still experiencing the issue. We anticipate receiving a new lot number and a new batch number this Friday and will keep you advised of the testing.

In the meantime, Justin will work with A/Insp Taylor on some strategies on what samples are able to be reported in the meantime.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen	
Sent: Friday, 20 April 2018 9:03 AM	
To: Supt Dale Frieberg	A/Insp Ewen Taylor
Cc: Paul Csoban	
Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit	

Hi Dale

I just wanted to let you know that we've asked other jurisdictions if they've had the same issue with the PP21 kits and yesterday we were advised by one jurisdiction that they had also seen it. This indicates that the issue is kit based, rather than process or instrument based. We will continue to work with the manufacturer and I'll keep you updated as we progress.



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Thursday, 19 April 2018 9:29 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg (Contemported Section 1997) Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have received the new lot of PP21 kits and have tested them. Unfortunately, this new lot does not resolve the issue for the 2 loci not amplifying properly. We will continue to investigate and work with the manufacturer on supplying us with a different lot number.

We will not re-commence routine processing of crime scene samples at this stage. We will continue to process urgent samples – for court purposes or ongoing investigations.

I will provide you with a further update when it comes to hand.

Cheers Cathie



#### **Cathie Allen**

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

pl	
al	39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108
W	www.health.gld.gov.au e [

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 17 April 2018 12:21 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the PP21 kits.

The new lot of PP21 kits have arrived at FSS and are currently being tested, with results known late this afternoon. If the test results show normal DNA profiles, tomorrow morning a batch of Volume Crime samples will be processed to ensure that crime scene samples profile appropriately. If this processes well, then processing of Major Crime samples will proceed from late Wednesday.

If the test process doesn't work appropriately, I will advise you asap.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.qld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

 From: Cathie Allen

 Sent: Friday, 13 April 2018 2:05 PM

 To: Supt Dale Frieberg
 A/Insp Ewen Taylor

 Cc: Paul Csoban

 Subject: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have identified an issue with the current lot number of PowerPlex 21 kit that is being used. The issue means that 2 loci (out of the 20 loci) are not amplifying properly, which affects the results and any associated work required in the statistical package, STRmix.

Urgent crime scene samples will be processed, however, we have ceased processing of routine crime scene samples with this lot, to ensure that we don't waste the sample as it's the only lot number we have available to us. This doesn't affect reference samples and they will continue to be processed.

We have contacted the manufacturer, who expects to ship us a new lot number on Monday, 16<sup>th</sup> of April, from Melbourne. Once we receive the new lot presumably on Tuesday afternoon, we anticipate verifying it overnight, with analysis of results on Wednesday morning. Once the new lot has been verified, routine testing of crime scene samples will re-commence.

I will keep you up to date on our progress and apologise for this inconvenience as I understand that it has an effect on the QPS' forensic work.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

#### \*\*\*\*\*\*\*

This email, including any attachments sent with it, is confidential and for the sole use of the intended recipient(s). This confidentiality is not waived or lost, if you receive it and you are not the intended recipient(s), or if it is transmitted/received in error.

Any unauthorised use, alteration, disclosure, distribution or review of this email is strictly prohibited. The information contained in this email, including any attachment sent with it, may be subject to a statutory duty of confidentiality if it relates to health service matters.

If you are not the intended recipient(s), or if you have received this email in error, you are asked to immediately notify the sender by telephone collect on Australia +61 1800 198 175 or by return email. You should also delete this email, and any copies, from your computer system network and destroy any hard copies produced.

If not an intended recipient of this email, you must not copy, distribute or take any action(s) that relies on it; any form of disclosure, modification, distribution and/or publication of this email is also prohibited.

Although Queensland Health takes all reasonable steps to ensure this email does not contain malicious software, Queensland Health does not accept responsibility for the consequences if any person's computer inadvertently suffers any disruption to services, loss of information, harm or is infected with a virus, other malicious computer programme or code that may occur as a consequence of receiving this email.

Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Cathie Allen
Sent:	Friday, 18 May 2018 15:40
То:	Frieberg.DaleJ[PCAP]; Taylor.EwenN[OSC]
Cc:	Lee Smythe; Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Kirsten Scott; Justin Howes; Michel Lok
Subject:	Update 7: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale and Ewen

Thank you for your feedback regarding our proposal to report more samples (particularly mixed DNA samples) through an 'Interim' reporting process and we appreciate that this was not a workable solution for the QPS and we will not proceed with this proposal.

Since my last update, we've conducted a number of different experiments regarding the PP21 issue. The collation of the results from these and other experiments and several discussions has led us to the point whereby we are still yet to determine the cause of the issue.

Bearing this in mind, and the impact on the QPS and the community, we will re-commence processing of samples through to profile and reporting stage, whilst we continue to undertake our investigation into the cause. We have assessed the risk of this and will mitigate this by beginning with Major Crime and the higher concentration samples (thereby using less of the extracted DNA).

We will be continuing our investigation into the cause of this event and will advise on the outcome once known.

Thank you for your patience during this period. I apologise for the disrupted flowing of results, which will now begin again, and I understand the impact that it has on the staff within the DNA Results Management Team and the wider forensic community of staff.

Please don't hesitate to contact me for any further clarification.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health



HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 15 May 2018 5:56 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg ; A/Insp Ewen Taylor Cc: Lee Smythe; Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Kirsten Scott; Justin Howes; Michel Lok Subject: FW: Update 6: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale and Ewen

I just wanted to provide you with an update on the issue with the PP21 kit.

We've conducted experiments, however we've found no evidence to suggest that any of the below have affected the PP21 process:

- Extraction method used in the lab
- Instruments used in the lab
- Water used in the lab

We are conducting further experiments in an attempt to rule out consumables that are used and could affect the PP21 process.

We are still working with the manufacturer on this issue and continuing to identify samples that are able to be processed, whilst ensuring that critical crime scene extract is not wasted unnecessarily.

We appreciate that this is affecting a number of cases, but are monitoring the court list and ensuring that samples are processed to meet court timeframes and any urgent requests made by the QPS.

Please let me know if there is further information that you'd like me to provide.

Cheers Cathie



## Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 4 May 2018 10:44 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban; 'Paula Brisotto'; 'Justin Howes' Subject: Update 5: Issue with PP21 kit

A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale and Ewen

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the issue with the Promega PP21 kits that we and two other jurisdictions are experiencing.

We have tried three different lot numbers of the PP21 kit and the issue is still present. We have tried a Promega Fusion kit (this kit includes the 2 loci that we are experiencing issues with) and this kit also showed that the issue is present (presumably due to using the same primers in both PP21 and Fusion).

We've conducted an experiment, as requested by the American Manufacturer, however this showed the issue was still present, but assisted them with more information.

Today we will be conducting four experiments to provide the American Manufacturer with more information. Included in these experiments is a different instrument (to rule out instrumentation, although we believe it's unlikely that the instrument is the issue, testing will be conducted to rule it out) and a kit from a different manufacturer that includes the 2 problematic loci.

We have compiled all of the data that we've gathering from the different experiments that have been conducted and have not been able to detect a trend (ie it's not sample dependent, its not position on a run dependent etc).

We will continue working with the manufacturer on this issue. And we will continue to process urgent samples that are requested by the QPS or are required for Statements and Court matters.

The laboratory hasn't experienced an issue like this previously and we have liaised with our counterparts in other jurisdictions regarding this issue. I apologise for the impact that this has on the QPS and the community. We have allocated a large number of resources to this issue to resolve it as quickly as possible.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Cheers Cathie



#### **Cathie Allen**

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | m | m | m | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 24 April 2018 3:48 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Justin Howes Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

We have received a new lot number and have tested it, unfortunately we are still experiencing the issue. We anticipate receiving a new lot number and a new batch number this Friday and will keep you advised of the testing.

In the meantime, Justin will work with A/Insp Taylor on some strategies on what samples are able to be reported in the meantime.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health



HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 20 April 2018 9:03 AM	
To: Supt Dale Frieberg	A/Insp Ewen Taylor
Cc: Paul Csoban	
Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit	

Hi Dale

I just wanted to let you know that we've asked other jurisdictions if they've had the same issue with the PP21 kits and yesterday we were advised by one jurisdiction that they had also seen it. This indicates that the issue is kit based, rather than process or instrument based. We will continue to work with the manufacturer and I'll keep you updated as we progress.

Cheers Cathie



#### Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health



HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Thursday, 19 April 2018 9:29 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

We have received the new lot of PP21 kits and have tested them. Unfortunately, this new lot does not resolve the issue for the 2 loci not amplifying properly. We will continue to investigate and work with the manufacturer on supplying us with a different lot number.

We will not re-commence routine processing of crime scene samples at this stage. We will continue to process urgent samples – for court purposes or ongoing investigations.

I will provide you with a further update when it comes to hand.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

 p

 a) 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108

 w
 www.health.gld.gov.au

 e

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 17 April 2018 12:21 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor (

Hi Dale

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the PP21 kits.

The new lot of PP21 kits have arrived at FSS and are currently being tested, with results known late this afternoon. If the test results show normal DNA profiles, tomorrow morning a batch of Volume Crime samples will be processed to ensure that crime scene samples profile appropriately. If this processes well, then processing of Major Crime samples will proceed from late Wednesday.

if the test process doesn't work appropriately, I will advise you asap.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health



HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 13 April 2018 2:05 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg ; A/Insp Ewen Taylor ( Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have identified an issue with the current lot number of PowerPlex 21 kit that is being used. The issue means that 2 loci (out of the 20 loci) are not amplifying properly, which affects the results and any associated work required in the statistical package, STRmix.

Urgent crime scene samples will be processed, however, we have ceased processing of routine crime scene samples with this lot, to ensure that we don't waste the sample as it's the only lot number we have available to us. This doesn't affect reference samples and they will continue to be processed.

We have contacted the manufacturer, who expects to ship us a new lot number on Monday, 16<sup>th</sup> of April, from Melbourne. Once we receive the new lot presumably on Tuesday afternoon, we anticipate verifying it overnight, with analysis of results on Wednesday morning. Once the new lot has been verified, routine testing of crime scene samples will re-commence.

I will keep you up to date on our progress and apologise for this inconvenience as I understand that it has an effect on the QPS' forensic work.



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers lains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

This email, including any attachments sent with it, is confidential and for the sole use of the intended recipient(s). This confidentiality is not waived or lost, if you receive it and you are not the intended recipient(s), or if it is transmitted/received in error.

Any unauthorised use, alteration, disclosure, distribution or review of this email is strictly prohibited. The information contained in this email, including any attachment sent with it, may be subject to a statutory duty of confidentiality if it relates to health service matters.

If you are not the intended recipient(s), or if you have received this email in error, you are asked to immediately notify the sender by telephone collect on Australia +61 1800 198 175 or by return email. You should also delete this email, and any copies, from your computer system network and destroy any hard copies produced.

If not an intended recipient of this email, you must not copy, distribute or take any action(s) that relies on it; any form of disclosure, modification, distribution and/or publication of this email is also prohibited.

Although Queensland Health takes all reasonable steps to ensure this email does not contain malicious software, Queensland Health does not accept responsibility for the consequences if any person's computer inadvertently suffers any disruption to services, loss of information, harm or is infected with a virus, other malicious computer programme or code that may occur as a consequence of receiving this email.

Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

# Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:
Sent:
To:
Cc:
Subject:

Cathie Allen Thursday, 28 June 2018 15:01 Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]; Neville.DavidH[OSC] Craig Russell; Michel Lok; Paula Brisotto; Justin Howes Update 8: Issue with PP21 kit

#### Hi Dale and David

I wanted to provide you with a final update regarding the suppression of 2 loci in the PP21 kit that we've been experiencing. We've continued to work on the root cause of the suppression and have worked closely with the manufacturer from the beginning regarding this issue. Earlier this week, the manufacturer provided us with further information regarding the root cause.

Upon notification from us of this issue, the manufacturer's Research and Development team began some investigations. Another laboratory (that isn't using PP21) also contacted them and advised them of some issues that they were seeing, that are similar to us. The R&D team have advised that there appears to be an issue with one component of the extraction kit that we use. They advised that this issue appears to have occurred mid manufacture of a lot number – meaning that our trend analysis on lot numbers wouldn't have highlighted this issue.

The R&D team have provided a modified extraction protocol to us to test and the outcome of the test showed that the samples are unaffected by the suppression issue. We have advised the company of this outcome, meaning the modified protocol resolves the component issue. We have requested that the issue be resolved within the kit, rather than being resolved by modification of the protocol, as any modification of the protocol will require validation (which uses resources and time). The manufacturer will soon issue a notice regarding a timeframe for the resolution of the issue.

We will continue to process samples using a different method (as described below), that is of the same quality standard and is unaffected by this issue. We will continue to report samples as quickly as possible and have scheduled an overtime session for processing results this Saturday, 30<sup>th</sup> of June.

Thank you for your continued patience during this period, as we understand that it has disrupted the flow of results to you. Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any further queries.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a i 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 18 May 2018 3:40 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg ( Cc: Lee Smythe; Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Kirsten Scott; Justin Howes; Michel Lok Subject: Update 7: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale and Ewen

Thank you for your feedback regarding our proposal to report more samples (particularly mixed DNA samples) through an 'Interim' reporting process and we appreciate that this was not a workable solution for the QPS and we will not proceed with this proposal.

Since my last update, we've conducted a number of different experiments regarding the PP21 issue. The collation of the results from these and other experiments and several discussions has led us to the point whereby we are still yet to determine the cause of the issue.

Bearing this in mind, and the impact on the QPS and the community, we will re-commence processing of samples through to profile and reporting stage, whilst we continue to undertake our investigation into the cause. We have assessed the risk of this and will mitigate this by beginning with Major Crime and the higher concentration samples (thereby using less of the extracted DNA).

We will be continuing our investigation into the cause of this event and will advise on the outcome once known.

Thank you for your patience during this period. I apologise for the disrupted flowing of results, which will now begin again, and I understand the impact that it has on the staff within the DNA Results Management Team and the wider forensic community of staff.

Please don't hesitate to contact me for any further clarification.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | <u>www.health.gld.gov.au</u> e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

 From: Cathie Allen

 Sent: Tuesday, 15 May 2018 5:56 PM

 To: Supt Dale Frieberg
 A/Insp Ewen Taylor

 Cc: Lee Smythe; Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Kirsten Scott; Justin Howes; Michel Lok

 Subject: FW: Update 6: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale and Ewen

I just wanted to provide you with an update on the issue with the PP21 kit.

We've conducted experiments, however we've found no evidence to suggest that any of the below have affected the PP21 process:

- Extraction method used in the lab
- Instruments used in the lab
- Water used in the lab

We are conducting further experiments in an attempt to rule out consumables that are used and could affect the PP21 process.

We are still working with the manufacturer on this issue and continuing to identify samples that are able to be processed, whilst ensuring that critical crime scene extract is not wasted unnecessarily.

We appreciate that this is affecting a number of cases, but are monitoring the court list and ensuring that samples are processed to meet court timeframes and any urgent requests made by the QPS.

Please let me know if there is further information that you'd like me to provide.

Cheers Cathie



## Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 4 May 2018 10:44 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban; 'Paula Brisotto'; 'Justin Howes' Subject: Update 5: Issue with PP21 kit

A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale and Ewen

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the issue with the Promega PP21 kits that we and two other jurisdictions are experiencing.

We have tried three different lot numbers of the PP21 kit and the issue is still present. We have tried a Promega Fusion kit (this kit includes the 2 loci that we are experiencing issues with) and this kit also showed that the issue is present (presumably due to using the same primers in both PP21 and Fusion).

We've conducted an experiment, as requested by the American Manufacturer, however this showed the issue was still present, but assisted them with more information.

Today we will be conducting four experiments to provide the American Manufacturer with more information. Included in these experiments is a different instrument (to rule out instrumentation, although we believe it's unlikely that the instrument is the issue, testing will be conducted to rule it out) and a kit from a different manufacturer that includes the 2 problematic loci.

We have compiled all of the data that we've gathering from the different experiments that have been conducted and have not been able to detect a trend (ie it's not sample dependent, its not position on a run dependent etc).

We will continue working with the manufacturer on this issue. And we will continue to process urgent samples that are requested by the QPS or are required for Statements and Court matters.

The laboratory hasn't experienced an issue like this previously and we have liaised with our counterparts in other jurisdictions regarding this issue. I apologise for the impact that this has on the QPS and the community. We have allocated a large number of resources to this issue to resolve it as quickly as possible.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 24 April 2018 3:48 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Justin Howes Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

We have received a new lot number and have tested it, unfortunately we are still experiencing the issue. We anticipate receiving a new lot number and a new batch number this Friday and will keep you advised of the testing.

In the meantime, Justin will work with A/Insp Taylor on some strategies on what samples are able to be reported in the meantime.

Cheers Cathie



## Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.qld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 20 April 2018 9:03 AM	
To: Supt Dale Frieberg	A/Insp Ewen Taylor
Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit	

Hi Dale

I just wanted to let you know that we've asked other jurisdictions if they've had the same issue with the PP21 kits and yesterday we were advised by one jurisdiction that they had also seen it. This indicates that the issue is kit based, rather than process or instrument based. We will continue to work with the manufacturer and I'll keep you updated as we progress.

Cheers Cathie



### Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health



HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Thursday, 19 April 2018 9:29 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

We have received the new lot of PP21 kits and have tested them. Unfortunately, this new lot does not resolve the issue for the 2 loci not amplifying properly. We will continue to investigate and work with the manufacturer on supplying us with a different lot number.

We will not re-commence routine processing of crime scene samples at this stage. We will continue to process urgent samples – for court purposes or ongoing investigations.

I will provide you with a further update when it comes to hand.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health



HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 17 April 2018 12:21 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg ( Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the PP21 kits.

The new lot of PP21 kits have arrived at FSS and are currently being tested, with results known late this afternoon. If the test results show normal DNA profiles, tomorrow morning a batch of Volume Crime samples will be processed to ensure that crime scene samples profile appropriately. If this processes well, then processing of Major Crime samples will proceed from late Wednesday.

If the test process doesn't work appropriately, I will advise you asap.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

## Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

We have identified an issue with the current lot number of PowerPlex 21 kit that is being used. The issue means that 2 loci (out of the 20 loci) are not amplifying properly, which affects the results and any associated work required in the statistical package, STRmix.

Urgent crime scene samples will be processed, however, we have ceased processing of routine crime scene samples with this lot, to ensure that we don't waste the sample as it's the only lot number we have available to us. This doesn't affect reference samples and they will continue to be processed.

We have contacted the manufacturer, who expects to ship us a new lot number on Monday, 16<sup>th</sup> of April, from Melbourne. Once we receive the new lot presumably on Tuesday afternoon, we anticipate verifying it overnight, with analysis of results on Wednesday morning. Once the new lot has been verified, routine testing of crime scene samples will re-commence.

I will keep you up to date on our progress and apologise for this inconvenience as I understand that it has an effect on the QPS' forensic work.



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

This email, including any attachments sent with it, is confidential and for the sole use of the intended recipient(s). This confidentiality is not waived or lost, if you receive it and you are not the intended recipient(s), or if it is transmitted/received in error.

Any unauthorised use, alteration, disclosure, distribution or review of this email is strictly prohibited. The information contained in this email, including any attachment sent with it, may be subject to a statutory duty of confidentiality if it relates to health service matters.

If you are not the intended recipient(s), or if you have received this email in error, you are asked to immediately notify the sender by telephone collect on Australia +61 1800 198 175 or by return email. You should also delete this email, and any copies, from your computer system network and destroy any hard copies produced.

If not an intended recipient of this email, you must not copy, distribute or take any action(s) that relies on it; any form of disclosure, modification, distribution and/or publication of this email is also prohibited.

Although Queensland Health takes all reasonable steps to ensure this email does not contain malicious software, Queensland Health does not accept responsibility for the consequences if any person's computer inadvertently suffers any disruption to services, loss of information, harm or is infected with a virus, other malicious computer programme or code that may occur as a consequence of receiving this email.

Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Neville.DavidH[OSC]
Sent:	Thursday, 28 June 2018 15:46
To:	Cathie Allen
Cc:	Frieberg.DateJ[OSC]
Subject:	RE: Update 8: Issue with PP21 kit

Thanks Cathie. It is a complex issue and we appreciate the update. This might be a stupid question, but, do the impacted loci overlap with the old ProfilerPlus 9? Is it possible to disregard the effected loci and report a reduced likelihood ratio?

Thanks again

David		
From: Cathie Allen [		
Sent: Thursday, 28 June 2018 3:01 PM		
To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]	Neville.DavidH[OSC]	
<		
Cc: Craig Russell	; Michel Lok ; Pau	ula Brisotto
< ; Justin Howes <		
Subject: Update 8: Issue with PP21 kit		

Hi Dale and David

I wanted to provide you with a final update regarding the suppression of 2 loci in the PP21 kit that we've been experiencing. We've continued to work on the root cause of the suppression and have worked closely with the manufacturer from the beginning regarding this issue. Earlier this week, the manufacturer provided us with further information regarding the root cause.

Upon notification from us of this issue, the manufacturer's Research and Development team began some investigations. Another laboratory (that isn't using PP21) also contacted them and advised them of some issues that they were seeing, that are similar to us. The R&D team have advised that there appears to be an issue with one component of the extraction kit that we use. They advised that this issue appears to have occurred mid manufacture of a lot number – meaning that our trend analysis on lot numbers wouldn't have highlighted this issue.

The R&D team have provided a modified extraction protocol to us to test and the outcome of the test showed that the samples are unaffected by the suppression issue. We have advised the company of this outcome, meaning the modified protocol resolves the component issue. We have requested that the issue be resolved within the kit, rather than being resolved by modification of the protocol, as any modification of the protocol will require validation (which uses resources and time). The manufacturer will soon issue a notice regarding a timeframe for the resolution of the issue.

We will continue to process samples using a different method (as described below), that is of the same quality standard and is unaffected by this issue. We will continue to report samples as quickly as possible and have scheduled an overtime session for processing results this Saturday, 30<sup>th</sup> of June.

Thank you for your continued patience during this period, as we understand that it has disrupted the flow of results to you. Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any further queries.



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 18 May 2018 3:40 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Lee Smythe; Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Kirsten Scott; Justin Howes; Michel Lok Subject: Update 7: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale and Ewen

Thank you for your feedback regarding our proposal to report more samples (particularly mixed DNA samples) through an 'Interim' reporting process and we appreciate that this was not a workable solution for the QPS and we will not proceed with this proposal.

Since my last update, we've conducted a number of different experiments regarding the PP21 issue. The collation of the results from these and other experiments and several discussions has led us to the point whereby we are still yet to determine the cause of the issue.

Bearing this in mind, and the impact on the QPS and the community, we will re-commence processing of samples through to profile and reporting stage, whilst we continue to undertake our investigation into the cause. We have assessed the risk of this and will mitigate this by beginning with Major Crime and the higher concentration samples (thereby using less of the extracted DNA).

We will be continuing our investigation into the cause of this event and will advise on the outcome once known.

Thank you for your patience during this period. I apologise for the disrupted flowing of results, which will now begin again, and I understand the impact that it has on the staff within the DNA Results Management Team and the wider forensic community of staff.

Please don't hesitate to contact me for any further clarification.

Cheers
Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

 From: Cathie Allen

 Sent: Tuesday, 15 May 2018 5:56 PM

 To: Supt Dale Frieberg

 A/Insp Ewen Taylor

 Cc: Lee Smythe; Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Kirsten Scott; Justin Howes; Michel Lok

 Subject: FW: Update 6: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale and Ewen

I just wanted to provide you with an update on the issue with the PP21 kit.

We've conducted experiments, however we've found no evidence to suggest that any of the below have affected the PP21 process:

- Extraction method used in the lab
- Instruments used in the lab
- Water used in the lab

We are conducting further experiments in an attempt to rule out consumables that are used and could affect the PP21 process.

We are still working with the manufacturer on this issue and continuing to identify samples that are able to be processed, whilst ensuring that critical crime scene extract is not wasted unnecessarily.

We appreciate that this is affecting a number of cases, but are monitoring the court list and ensuring that samples are processed to meet court timeframes and any urgent requests made by the QPS.

Please let me know if there is further information that you'd like me to provide.



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | <u>www.health.qld.gov.au</u> e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 4 May 2018 10:44 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban; 'Paula Brisotto'; 'Justin Howes' Subject: Update 5: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale and Ewen

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the issue with the Promega PP21 kits that we and two other jurisdictions are experiencing.

We have tried three different lot numbers of the PP21 kit and the issue is still present. We have tried a Promega Fusion kit (this kit includes the 2 loci that we are experiencing issues with) and this kit also showed that the issue is present (presumably due to using the same primers in both PP21 and Fusion).

We've conducted an experiment, as requested by the American Manufacturer, however this showed the issue was still present, but assisted them with more information.

Today we will be conducting four experiments to provide the American Manufacturer with more information. Included in these experiments is a different instrument (to rule out instrumentation, although we believe it's unlikely that the instrument is the issue, testing will be conducted to rule it out) and a kit from a different manufacturer that includes the 2 problematic loci.

We have compiled all of the data that we've gathering from the different experiments that have been conducted and have not been able to detect a trend (ie it's not sample dependent, its not position on a run dependent etc).

We will continue working with the manufacturer on this issue. And we will continue to process urgent samples that are requested by the QPS or are required for Statements and Court matters.

The laboratory hasn't experienced an issue like this previously and we have liaised with our counterparts in other jurisdictions regarding this issue. I apologise for the impact that this has on the QPS and the community. We have allocated a large number of resources to this issue to resolve it as quickly as possible.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream Forensic & Scientific Services,

Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

 P
 Image: Second state st

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 24 April 2018 3:48 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg ( Cc: Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Justin Howes Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have received a new lot number and have tested it, unfortunately we are still experiencing the issue. We anticipate receiving a new lot number and a new batch number this Friday and will keep you advised of the testing.

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor

In the meantime, Justin will work with A/Insp Taylor on some strategies on what samples are able to be reported in the meantime.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | <u>www.health.qld.gov.au</u> e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 20 April 2018 9:03 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg

A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

I just wanted to let you know that we've asked other jurisdictions if they've had the same issue with the PP21 kits and yesterday we were advised by one jurisdiction that they had also seen it. This indicates that the issue is kit based, rather than process or instrument based. We will continue to work with the manufacturer and I'll keep you updated as we progress.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | \_\_\_\_\_\_ a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.heallh.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

 From: Cathie Allen

 Sent: Thursday, 19 April 2018 9:29 AM

 To: Supt Dale Frieberg

 Cc: Paul Csoban

 Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have received the new lot of PP21 kits and have tested them. Unfortunately, this new lot does not resolve the issue for the 2 loci not amplifying properly. We will continue to investigate and work with the manufacturer on supplying us with a different lot number.

We will not re-commence routine processing of crime scene samples at this stage. We will continue to process urgent samples – for court purposes or ongoing investigations.

I will provide you with a further update when it comes to hand.



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | <u>www.health.old.gov.au</u> e |

**HSQ's vision** | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 17 April 2018 12:21 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg ( Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the PP21 kits.

The new lot of PP21 kits have arrived at FSS and are currently being tested, with results known late this afternoon. If the test results show normal DNA profiles, tomorrow morning a batch of Volume Crime samples will be processed to ensure that crime scene samples profile appropriately. If this processes well, then processing of Major Crime samples will proceed from late Wednesday.

If the test process doesn't work appropriately, I will advise you asap.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Cheers Cathie

# Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a [ 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e [

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 13 April 2018 2:05 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: Issue with PP21 kit

A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

We have identified an issue with the current lot number of PowerPlex 21 kit that is being used. The issue means that 2 loci (out of the 20 loci) are not amplifying properly, which affects the results and any associated work required in the statistical package, STRmix.

Urgent crime scene samples will be processed, however, we have ceased processing of routine crime scene samples with this lot, to ensure that we don't waste the sample as it's the only lot number we have available to us. This doesn't affect reference samples and they will continue to be processed.

We have contacted the manufacturer, who expects to ship us a new lot number on Monday, 16<sup>th</sup> of April, from Melbourne. Once we receive the new lot presumably on Tuesday afternoon, we anticipate verifying it overnight, with analysis of results on Wednesday morning. Once the new lot has been verified, routine testing of crime scene samples will re-commence.

I will keep you up to date on our progress and apologise for this inconvenience as I understand that it has an effect on the QPS' forensic work.

Cheers Cathie



#### **Cathie Allen**

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*\*\*\*\*

This email, including any attachments sent with it, is confidential and for the sole use of the intended recipient(s). This confidentiality is not waived or lost, if you receive it and you are not the intended recipient(s), or if it is transmitted/received in error.

Any unauthorised use, alteration, disclosure, distribution or review of this email is strictly prohibited. The information contained in this email, including any attachment sent with it, may be subject to a statutory duty of confidentiality if it relates to health service matters.

If you are not the intended recipient(s), or if you have received this email in error, you are asked to immediately notify the sender by telephone collect on Australia +61 1800 198 175 or by return email. You should also delete this email, and any copies, from your computer system network and destroy any hard copies produced.

If not an intended recipient of this email, you must not copy, distribute or take any action(s) that relies on it; any form of disclosure, modification, distribution and/or publication of this email is also prohibited.

Although Queensland Health takes all reasonable steps to ensure this email does not contain malicious software, Queensland Health does not accept responsibility for the consequences if any person's computer inadvertently suffers any disruption to services, loss of information, harm or is infected with a virus, other malicious computer programme or code that may occur as a consequence of receiving this email.

Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Cathie Allen < Thursday, 28 June 2018 16:15 Neville.DavidH[OSC] Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC]; Craig Russell RE: Update 8: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dave

Yes, the loci that are affected by the suppression are in both Profiler Plus kits and PP21 kits. We're unable to use Profiler Plus as the manufacturer discontinued that kit and the last of the kits were consumed by the lab in January of this year. We purchased a GlobalFiler kit (similar kit to PP21 but made by a different manufacturer) and the affected loci were suppressed with that kit as well. This is what led us to concentrate on the extraction process for our investigation.

As the lab is now using STRmix for statistical interpretation of all profiles, excluding loci has an impact on STRmix's ability to model the profile and provide statistics. So excluding them is not a course of action that we're able to take.

We have set up a sub-team that are tasked with assessing the amount of suppression within a particular profile within the context of a case. If the suppression greatly affects the ability to interpret a profile, then re-extracting the sample is the best option (depending on other samples in the case, as a number of factors are considered prior to re-extracting). If the suppression within a particular profile doesn't affect the interpretation, then profile can be reported to the QPS. Not every profile is affected by the suppression, and not all profiles are adversely affected by the suppression. A bottleneck in our processing began when the issue was highlighted, due to an uncertainty regarding the root cause. We're now attempting to remove that bottleneck.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | <u>www.health.qld.gov.au</u> e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Neville.DavidH[OSC] Sent: Thursday, 28 June 2018 3:46 PM To: Cathie Allen Cc: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] Subject: RE: Update 8: Issue with PP21 kit Thanks Cathie. It is a complex issue and we appreciate the update. This might be a stupid question, but, do the impacted loci overlap with the old ProfilerPlus 9? Is it possible to disregard the effected loci and report a reduced likelihood ratio?

Thanks again		
David		
From: Cathie Allen [		
Sent: Thursday, 28 June 2018 3:01 PM		
To: Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] <	>; Neville.DavidH[OSC]	
Cc: Craig Russell	Michel Lok	; Paula Brisotto
; Justin Howes <	<	>
Subject: Update 8: Issue with PP21 kit		

Hi Dale and David

I wanted to provide you with a final update regarding the suppression of 2 loci in the PP21 kit that we've been experiencing. We've continued to work on the root cause of the suppression and have worked closely with the manufacturer from the beginning regarding this issue. Earlier this week, the manufacturer provided us with further information regarding the root cause.

Upon notification from us of this issue, the manufacturer's Research and Development team began some investigations. Another laboratory (that isn't using PP21) also contacted them and advised them of some issues that they were seeing, that are similar to us. The R&D team have advised that there appears to be an issue with one component of the extraction kit that we use. They advised that this issue appears to have occurred mid manufacture of a lot number – meaning that our trend analysis on lot numbers wouldn't have highlighted this issue.

The R&D team have provided a modified extraction protocol to us to test and the outcome of the test showed that the samples are unaffected by the suppression issue. We have advised the company of this outcome, meaning the modified protocol resolves the component issue. We have requested that the issue be resolved within the kit, rather than being resolved by modification of the protocol, as any modification of the protocol will require validation (which uses resources and time). The manufacturer will soon issue a notice regarding a timeframe for the resolution of the issue.

We will continue to process samples using a different method (as described below), that is of the same quality standard and is unaffected by this issue. We will continue to report samples as quickly as possible and have scheduled an overtime session for processing results this Saturday, 30<sup>th</sup> of June.

Thank you for your continued patience during this period, as we understand that it has disrupted the flow of results to you. Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any further queries.



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.old.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 18 May 2018 3:40 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Lee Smythe; Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Kirsten Scott; Justin Howes; Michel Lok Subject: Update 7: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale and Ewen

Thank you for your feedback regarding our proposal to report more samples (particularly mixed DNA samples) through an 'Interim' reporting process and we appreciate that this was not a workable solution for the QPS and we will not proceed with this proposal.

Since my last update, we've conducted a number of different experiments regarding the PP21 issue. The collation of the results from these and other experiments and several discussions has led us to the point whereby we are still yet to determine the cause of the issue.

Bearing this in mind, and the impact on the QPS and the community, we will re-commence processing of samples through to profile and reporting stage, whilst we continue to undertake our investigation into the cause. We have assessed the risk of this and will mitigate this by beginning with Major Crime and the higher concentration samples (thereby using less of the extracted DNA).

We will be continuing our investigation into the cause of this event and will advise on the outcome once known.

Thank you for your patience during this period. I apologise for the disrupted flowing of results, which will now begin again, and I understand the impact that it has on the staff within the DNA Results Management Team and the wider forensic community of staff.

Please don't hesitate to contact me for any further clarification.



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

 From: Cathie Allen

 Sent: Tuesday, 15 May 2018 5:56 PM

 To: Supt Dale Frieberg (

 Cc: Lee Smythe; Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Kirsten Scott; Justin Howes; Michel Lok

 Subject: FW: Update 6: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale and Ewen

I just wanted to provide you with an update on the issue with the PP21 kit.

We've conducted experiments, however we've found no evidence to suggest that any of the below have affected the PP21 process:

- Extraction method used in the lab
- Instruments used in the lab
- Water used in the lab

We are conducting further experiments in an attempt to rule out consumables that are used and could affect the PP21 process.

We are still working with the manufacturer on this issue and continuing to identify samples that are able to be processed, whilst ensuring that critical crime scene extract is not wasted unnecessarily.

We appreciate that this is affecting a number of cases, but are monitoring the court list and ensuring that samples are processed to meet court timeframes and any urgent requests made by the QPS.

Please let me know if there is further information that you'd like me to provide.



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | \_\_\_\_\_\_\_ a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | <u>www.health.qld.gov.au</u> e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 4 May 2018 10:44 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban; 'Paula Brisotto'; 'Justin Howes' Subject: Update 5: Issue with PP21 kit

; A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale and Ewen

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the issue with the Promega PP21 kits that we and two other jurisdictions are experiencing.

We have tried three different lot numbers of the PP21 kit and the issue is still present. We have tried a Promega Fusion kit (this kit includes the 2 loci that we are experiencing issues with) and this kit also showed that the issue is present (presumably due to using the same primers in both PP21 and Fusion).

We've conducted an experiment, as requested by the American Manufacturer, however this showed the issue was still present, but assisted them with more information.

Today we will be conducting four experiments to provide the American Manufacturer with more information. Included in these experiments is a different instrument (to rule out instrumentation, although we believe it's unlikely that the instrument is the issue, testing will be conducted to rule it out) and a kit from a different manufacturer that includes the 2 problematic loci.

We have compiled all of the data that we've gathering from the different experiments that have been conducted and have not been able to detect a trend (ie it's not sample dependent, its not position on a run dependent etc).

We will continue working with the manufacturer on this issue. And we will continue to process urgent samples that are requested by the QPS or are required for Statements and Court matters.

The laboratory hasn't experienced an issue like this previously and we have liaised with our counterparts in other jurisdictions regarding this issue. I apologise for the impact that this has on the QPS and the community. We have allocated a large number of resources to this issue to resolve it as quickly as possible.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | \_\_\_\_\_\_a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e | \_\_\_\_\_\_

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Tuesday, 24 April 2018 3:48 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg (\_\_\_\_\_\_\_; A/Insp Ewen Taylor (\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Cc: Paul Csoban; Paula Brisotto; Justin Howes Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have received a new lot number and have tested it, unfortunately we are still experiencing the issue. We anticipate receiving a new lot number and a new batch number this Friday and will keep you advised of the testing.

In the meantime, Justin will work with A/Insp Taylor on some strategies on what samples are able to be reported in the meantime.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | <u>www.health.gld.gov.au</u> e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 20 April 2018 9:03 AM To: Supt Dale Frieberg (

A/Insp Ewen Taylor (

Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

I just wanted to let you know that we've asked other jurisdictions if they've had the same issue with the PP21 kits and yesterday we were advised by one jurisdiction that they had also seen it. This indicates that the issue is kit based, rather than process or instrument based. We will continue to work with the manufacturer and I'll keep you updated as we progress.

Cheers Cathie



### Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen
Sent: Thursday, 19 April 2018 9:29 AM
To: Supt Dale Frieberg (
Cc: Paul Csoban
Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

We have received the new lot of PP21 kits and have tested them. Unfortunately, this new lot does not resolve the issue for the 2 loci not amplifying properly. We will continue to investigate and work with the manufacturer on supplying us with a different lot number.

We will not re-commence routine processing of crime scene samples at this stage. We will continue to process urgent samples – for court purposes or ongoing investigations.

I will provide you with a further update when it comes to hand.



Cathie Allen Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.gld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen
Sent: Tuesday, 17 April 2018 12:21 PM
To: Supt Dale Frieberg
Cc: Paul Csoban
Subject: FW: Issue with PP21 kit

Hi Dale

I just wanted to provide you with an update regarding the PP21 kits.

The new lot of PP21 kits have arrived at FSS and are currently being tested, with results known late this afternoon. If the test results show normal DNA profiles, tomorrow morning a batch of Volume Crime samples will be processed to ensure that crime scene samples profile appropriately. If this processes well, then processing of Major Crime samples will proceed from late Wednesday.

If the test process doesn't work appropriately, I will advise you asap.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Cheers Cathie



Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist – Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.qld.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

From: Cathie Allen Sent: Friday, 13 April 2018 2:05 PM To: Supt Dale Frieberg Cc: Paul Csoban Subject: Issue with PP21 kit

A/Insp Ewen Taylor

Hi Dale

We have identified an issue with the current lot number of PowerPlex 21 kit that is being used. The issue means that 2 loci (out of the 20 loci) are not amplifying properly, which affects the results and any associated work required in the statistical package, STRmix.

Urgent crime scene samples will be processed, however, we have ceased processing of routine crime scene samples with this lot, to ensure that we don't waste the sample as it's the only lot number we have available to us. This doesn't affect reference samples and they will continue to be processed.

We have contacted the manufacturer, who expects to ship us a new lot number on Monday, 16<sup>th</sup> of April, from Melbourne. Once we receive the new lot presumably on Tuesday afternoon, we anticipate verifying it overnight, with analysis of results on Wednesday morning. Once the new lot has been verified, routine testing of crime scene samples will re-commence.

I will keep you up to date on our progress and apologise for this inconvenience as I understand that it has an effect on the QPS' forensic work.

Cheers Cathie



## Cathie Allen

Managing Scientist - Police Services Stream

Forensic & Scientific Services, Health Support Queensland, Department of Health

p | a | 39 Kessels Road, Coopers Plains, QLD 4108 w | www.health.old.gov.au e |

HSQ's vision | Delivering the best health support services and solutions for a safer and healthier Queensland.

Queensland Health acknowledges the Traditional Owners of the land, and pays respect to Elders past, present and future.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

This email, including any attachments sent with it, is confidential and for the sole use of the intended recipient(s). This confidentiality is not waived or lost, if you receive it and you are not the intended recipient(s), or if it is transmitted/received in error.

Any unauthorised use, alteration, disclosure, distribution or review of this email is strictly prohibited. The information contained in this email, including any attachment sent with it, may be subject to a statutory duty of confidentiality if it relates to health service matters.

If you are not the intended recipient(s), or if you have received this email in error, you are asked to immediately notify the sender by telephone collect on Australia +61 1800 198 175 or by return email. You should also delete this email, and any copies, from your computer system network and destroy any hard copies produced.

If not an intended recipient of this email, you must not copy, distribute or take any action(s) that relies on it; any form of disclosure, modification, distribution and/or publication of this email is also prohibited.

Although Queensland Health takes all reasonable steps to ensure this email does not contain malicious software, Queensland Health does not accept responsibility for the consequences if any person's computer inadvertently suffers any disruption to services, loss of information, harm or is infected with a virus, other malicious computer programme or code that may occur as a consequence of receiving this email.

Unless stated otherwise, this email represents only the views of the sender and not the views of the Queensland Government.

CONFIDENTIALITY: The information contained in this electronic mail message and any electronic files attached to it may be confidential information, and may also be the subject of legal professional privilege and/or public interest immunity. If you are not the intended recipient you are required to delete it. Any use, disclosure or copying of this message and any attachments is unauthorised. If you have received this electronic message in error, please inform the sender or contact <u>1300ITPSBA@psba.qld.gov.au</u>. This footnote also confirms that this email message has been checked for the presence of computer viruses.

\*\*\*

10

## EXHIBIT 39

## Frieberg.DaleJ[ESC]

From:	Neville.DavidH		
Sent:	Monday, 10 S		
То:	Frieberg.DaleJ		
Subject:	recall of result		

Neville.DavidH[OSC] Monday, 10 September 2018 09:36 Frieberg.DaleJ[OSC] recall of results by FSSQHS

Dear Supt,

As discussed this morning. It has come to my attention that FSSQHS frequently report results of a DNA link to a person and then later retract the result. On almost every occasion the initial reported result is a component of a 3 person mixture. They report very high probabilities (greater than 100,000,000,000:1) that a person contributed their DNA to the mixture and this information is reported to investigators through QPRIME. On some occasions the result is later reviewed and the initial result is retracted and instead they report that the sample yielded a mixed profile that cannot be interpreted.

I have included some recent examples of this occurring in the table below. I happens quite frequently (I am told it occurs more than twice a month).

These results are not reported as preliminary or accompanied by any type of caveat. They are acted upon by investigators and could result in a person being charged and possibly kept in custody.

I have asked that FSSQHS for more information regarding this frequent occurrence. I have requested to know why it occurs and what quality controls the result go through before release. I have also asked if police should treat results involving mixtures with caution.

The reporting of results from 3 person mixtures only commenced when FSSQHS introduced a statistical program called STRMix which allows them to separate components from a mixed profile. The practitioner has to manually determine how many persons are in the mixture and the program then isolates each contributor based partly on the concentrations of the material present and other factors. If the examiner makes a bad call on the number of contributors, STRMix can give an unreliable result. This may be the reason for the recall of the result.

I will provide further information when FSSQHS respond to my request for information.

It may be that we need to treat any result from a mixed profile with a higher degree of caution.

Exhibit	Date of initial result	Initial Result	Date of updated result	Updated result
	27/03/2018	3 person mix profile - support for contrib > 100 billion victim match	14/05/2018	MIXED PROFILE UNSUITABLE FOR INTERP OR COMPARISON
	13/02/2018	3 person mix - support for contribution > 100 billion - to	10/04/2018	COMPLEX MIXED PROFILE UNSUITABLE FOR INTERP OR COMPARISON
	5/12/2017	3 person mix profile - support for contrib > 100 billion evidence match -	15/06/2018	COMPLEX MIXED PROFILE UNSUITABLE FOR INTERP OR COMPARISON
	3/4/2018	3 person mix profile - support	27/04/2018	COMPLEX MIXED PROFILE

	for contrib > 100 billion evidence match		UNSUITABLE FOR INTERP OR COMPARISON
21/12/2017	3 person mix profile - support for contrib > 100 billion evidence match	31/08/2018	COMPLEX MIXED PROFILE UNSUITABLE FOR INTERP OR COMPARISON



David Neville Inspector DNA Management Unit | Forensic Services Group Operations Support Command QUEENSLAND POLICE SERVICE

